Career Life Balance

Executive Summary

Section 10.1
## Table of Contents

Major Activities Overview .............................................................................................................................................. 1

- CLB Benchmark Policy Comparison ........................................................................................................................ 1
- Retrospective Market Research with UC Dual Career Couples .............................................................................. 1
- Feasibility Study for Regional Hiring Exchange...................................................................................................... 1

Internal Results: University of Cincinnati Climate for Dual Career Hiring & Career Life Balance ...................... 2

- Dual Career Hiring ..................................................................................................................................................... 2
- Elder Care Assistance................................................................................................................................................ 3
- Child Care: Daily Child Care & Emergency or Back-Up Child Care ................................................................. 3
- Lactation Support........................................................................................................................................................ 3
- Parental Leave............................................................................................................................................................ 4
- Part-Time Tenure ...................................................................................................................................................... 4
- Stopping the Tenure Clock ........................................................................................................................................ 5

External Results: Greater Cincinnati Climate for Dual Career Hiring Network ....................................................... 5

- Dual Career Feasibility Survey ................................................................................................................................... 5

Recommendations ........................................................................................................................................................... 7

References ........................................................................................................................................................................ 9

Executive Summary Appendix ..................................................................................................................................... 18
Major Activities Overview

There were three major activities as part of the CLB Grant. These include collecting benchmark data to compare UC’s policies to other IHE’s, conducting retrospective market research on challenges that dual career couples at UC face, and the combination of findings to engage in a feasibility study for a regional hiring exchange in greater Cincinnati. The activities associated with each of these portions will be reviewed prior to discussing the overall results from the efforts associated with each phase.

CLB Benchmark Policy Comparison

The first step in assessing the work life balance initiatives at the University of Cincinnati was comparing UC’s policies to other institutions including ADVANCE and non-ADVANCE institutions within the United States. It was imperative to see how programming compared to other institutions that have also received funding from the NSF Advance grant. A list of institutions that have received grant money was extracted from the NSF Advance website and was used to benchmark policies. Once the benchmarking collection was complete, UC’s collective bargaining agreement for faculty was reviewed to compare current UC policies to the benchmarked data.

The topics benchmarked included initiatives relating to work life balance which encompassed parental leave, elder care, emergency child care, on-campus child care, lactation support, part time tenure opportunities, and stopping the tenure clock. The data was gathered through extensive internet related searches on the institution’s websites and in their faculty handbooks. A total of 51 universities were studied. These universities were as far away as Washington State and also included Ivy League institutions such as Cornell, Columbia and Brown University. The combined student enrollment figures ranged from 3256 to 234,464 which was the University of California conglomerate. The average number of faculty at these institutions was 2693 with a standard deviation of 2870.

Retrospective Market Research with UC Dual Career Couples

In order to assess the internal climate concerning work life balance at the University of Cincinnati, LEAF sponsored a Dual Career Focus Group with members of the faculty that were in relationships when initially hired. This event was held on March 9, 2014 with nine A&S faculty members. On average, the participants have been employed by the university for a little over three years. The group consisted of three women and six men. Six of the participants have partners that also work for the university, the other participants have partners that are working in either real estate or law, outside of the university. The A&S departments represented include Biology, Geology, Anthropology, Psychology, and Philosophy. See Appendix A for a copy of the Dual Career Focus Group transcript. Participants discussed what went well during the hiring process and what could be improved, and retention issues relating to managing dual careers.

Feasibility Study for Regional Hiring Exchange

The third portion of the grant focused on the external climate supporting dual career couples in the greater Cincinnati area. In order to assess the best practices and initiatives related to dual career couples in the region a feasibility study was conducted. A 23-question survey was compiled and entered into Survey Monkey. The survey was divided into four sections, I: Recruitment of Employees in Dual Career Households, II: Retention of Employees in Dual Career Households, III: Regional Hiring Network for the Greater Cincinnati Area, and IV: Company Demographics. See Appendix B for a copy of the survey.
The survey was sent via email to over 220 individuals. The first individuals to receive the survey were alumni of the Masters of Human Resource program at the university that were listed as working in the greater Cincinnati area. The survey was then posted on several LinkedIn groups including the Greater Cincinnati Recruiting & HR Network, and Cincinnati Human Resources Young Professionals. For further outreach, the survey was posted to the HR Net on June 4th by Steve Brown which is an affiliate of the society for Human Resource Management and the Greater Cincinnati Human Resources Association. To further expand the survey results, job database queries were searched to find Human Resource contacts from companies in specific industries that were lacking in response rates for the survey. The program coordinator also attended various meetings with HR professionals to conduct informal networking while gathering data pertaining to the study.

Lastly, to expand upon the results generated in this feasibility study, UC LEAF hosted a Dual Career Feasibility Roundtable on August 1st, 2014. Individuals that expressed an interested in the regional hiring exchange on the dual career feasibility study were invited to the roundtable discussion which covered best practices in dual career hiring, discussing the results of the feasibility survey, and brainstorming regarding the possibility of a regional hiring exchange. In addition to the survey responders, leaders of organizations with similar initiatives, such as Agenda 360, an affiliate of the Greater Cincinnati Chamber of Commerce were also invited to participate. In total, three representatives from industry (P&G, Camargo Pharmaceuticals, and Patheon Pharmaceuticals), and two representatives from the Agenda 360 Chamber of Commerce group and Diverse by Design attended. The representative from Camargo had been part of an earlier effort to develop a hiring network among Life Sciences companies in the greater Cincinnati area. The participants brainstormed on different facets of a regional hiring exchange that would beneficial to this area. The topics discussed included what membership would consist of in terms of cost, provided services that would make membership attractive, who or what organization would manage the network, and how to get companies actively participating. See Appendix C for a transcript of this Roundtable.

**Internal Results: University of Cincinnati Climate for Dual Career Hiring & Career Life Balance**

**Dual Career Hiring**

The results of the internal dual career focus group complimented the data collected during the benchmarking phase of the project. The faculty involved in the focus group discussed the fact that they felt mentioning a spouse or family in general was a taboo topic and could potentially stymie their offer of a job. Thus, many of the faculty chose not to disclose any information regarding their family or the fact that a spouse is also in need of a job. Several of the universities benchmarked circumvent this issue by making it a priority to advertise their dual career hiring protocols to all candidates for all positions, thereby eliminating possible discrimination based on familial status. This practice was found at Lehigh University, University of Rhode Island, and Utah State University. These institutions recognize the ubiquitous nature of dual career candidates and provide the dual career support information up front. Thus, encouraging candidates to self-identify as part of a dual career couple which in essence facilitates the ball rolling towards finding career placement for the partner. See Appendix D for a summary of the benchmarked dual career hiring information. See Appendix E for a copy of dual career hiring policies from the benchmarked universities.

The focus group participants mentioned the fact that there is variation surrounding the process in which different departments handle dual career hiring and work life balance needs in general.
Elder Care Assistance

As the U.S. population continues to age, there are more and more people finding themselves in a primary caregiver position for a loved one, whether that be an elderly parent or aging spouse. Several universities have responded to this demographic shift by offering services for faculty members involved with the care of an adult dependent family member. See Appendix F for a summary of the benchmarked elder care assistance information.

University of Cincinnati offers an employee assistance program that covers elder care support through Impact Solutions. This third party provider has assistance available to all employees and their household members, as well as dependents living away from home and parents & parents-in-law, including referrals to community resources. This policy was similar to the policies found at the benchmarked universities. Ohio State offered the most comprehensive solution for elder case assistance, they provide a free in-home assessment through the Department of Human Development and Family Science Extension. This assessment reviews the senior’s needs, provides a functional assessment of their living conditions and reviews how the senior or the employee would like assistance. The university then discusses options for addressing their assistance needs. See Appendix G for a copy of elder care assistance policies from the benchmarked universities.

Child Care: Daily Child Care & Emergency or Back-Up Child Care

Child care was mentioned several times throughout the duration of the focus group. There were contradicting thoughts surrounding the topic. Two of the participants felt that UC did a great job promoting work life integration by offering “excellent daycare / preschool (UCELC, Arlitt).” However, most participants felt the waiting list was too long and hoped to see part of the fees associated with the daycare subsidized. One participant questioned the current waitlist and posed the question “what do people relocating to UC with small children do to get in daycare due to the waitlist?” Another participant added that she postponed finding a job in the area for two years until the children were able to get into a reputable daycare.

There are several universities that offer their faculty an option for Emergency or Back-Up Child Care in situations when their primary care giver is unavailable, or the child is sick. Currently, the University of Cincinnati does not have an official emergency child care policy. Most of the universities offering this service have it available to all benefits eligible employees through a third party provider. The cost is minimal to faculty, with the university subsidizing the majority of the expenses and the faculty member simply paying a co-pay each time the service is used. In most cases, the co-payment was relatively minimal, from 12 hours to 10 days per year per faculty member. In order to utilize the services the faculty member must register with the provider in advance (when possible). The care provided is either in the home or at a 3rd party location, depending on the situation and the university. See Appendix H for a summary of the benchmarked emergency child care information. See Appendix I for a copy of emergency child care policies from the benchmarked universities.

Lactation Support

According to the Department of Labor, the Patient Protection and Affordable Care Act amended section 7 of Fair Labor Standards Act (FLSA) to require employers to provide reasonable break time for an employee to express breast milk for her nursing child for one year after the child’s birth each time such employee has need to express the milk. Employers are also required to provide a place, other than a bathroom, that is shielded from view and free from intrusion from coworkers and the public, which may be used by an employee to express breast milk. The break time requirement became effective when the Affordable Care Act was signed into law on March 23, 2010. Several of the benchmark universities cited this act in their lactation support policies and have taken steps to ensure nursing mothers are provided with at least these minimum requirements. University of Cincinnati refers to
the Affordable Care Act on the Women’s Center website and provides a list of available Lactation Rooms on campus.

The focus group was held prior to the implementation of lactations stations around UC’s campus. The participants discussed the need for accessible lactation stations around campus, which is now the case. However, they also discussed the need for not having to have conversations surrounding the use of lactation stations or other personal issues with their department heads. One participant felt very uncomfortable bringing up these personal issues. She felt these items “shouldn’t have to be brought up, they should be a policy. It makes it feel like my problem and I’m asking for a favor” in regards to asking for a space to express breast milk following the birth of her child. See Appendix J for a summary of the benchmarked lactation support information. See Appendix K for a copy of lactation support policies from the benchmarked universities.

**Parental Leave**

The use of paid parental leave policies was examined during the benchmarking phase of this project. The average length of the paid leave was about six weeks, with some universities offering only three, and the University of New Hampshire offering twelve paid weeks. Most of the leaves were offered on a consecutive basis within a twelve-month period following the birth or adoption of a child. Several of the schools only counted the adoption of a child as eligible for a paid parental leave if the child was younger than a certain age. The age range cut-off varied between six and twelve years old. There were two situations where the birth-mother was offered a longer paid leave (six weeks) than non-birth mother parents or parents adopting children (three weeks).

The focus group participants felt that University of Cincinnati could improve their initiatives relating to parental leave policies. When asked how UC could improve work life integration policies, six participants agreed that UC needs to incorporate a paid parental leave policy, available to both men and women. Participants felt this would be a “huge recruitment opportunity” for the university and that it would ameliorate the bifurcation of career and family. The participants also felt that incorporating additional reasons into the approved list of leave would be beneficial. The examples provided were death of a parent and other catastrophic events. See Appendix L for a summary of the benchmarked parental leave information. See Appendix M for a copy of the parental leave policies from the benchmarked universities.

**Part-Time Tenure**

The benchmarking data found eleven universities with formal policies regarding part-time tenure for faculty. In order to participate in the part-time programs, the request must be generated by the faculty member for the purpose of maintaining a better balance between work and family life. Most of the policies associated with a change to part-time status revolve around the birth, adoption, or primary care responsibilities for a small child. There were a few universities that provided reasons such as the care for a seriously ill member of the household in addition to child care. In most scenarios, the change to part-time status also triggered a proportionate extension of the probationary period, for example, one year of service at 50% counts as one half year on the tenure clock.

Most of the observed part-time appointments made the faculty member responsible for at least 50% of their normal duties and were paid a proportionate rate of 50% their regular salary. Most policies did not allow the faculty member to drop below a 50% reduction in duties, and part-time was counted as anything less than full-time could be considered part-time.

Part-time tenure opportunities were not discussed during the focus group. See Appendix N for a summary of the benchmarked part-time tenure information. See Appendix O for a copy of part-time tenure policies from the benchmarked universities.
Stopping the Tenure Clock

The University of Cincinnati policy is very similar to most of the policies enacted at benchmarking schools concerning stopping the tenure clock. UC, and the majority of the schools offer a one year extension of the probationary period, and up to two years total. There were a few schools (Duke, University of Pittsburgh, University of Utah, and West Virginia University) that offered up to three years for the extension. Most of the schools include provisions for caring for a seriously ill or disabled family member, death of a spouse or child, and treatment of a serious illness for oneself as alternate reasons for requesting an extension of the probationary period. There were a few schools that extended the tenure for reasons above and beyond child and family care, including a catastrophic residential loss (Howard University), a major shift in the departmental mission (Iowa State University), and when an employee’s family member or domestic partner is on active military duty or is called to active duty (Lehigh University). The focus group participants reiterated the need to add additional qualifying reasons for stopping the tenure clock. One participant explained how their partner’s research was delayed due to a change in administration. It took months before this individual was able to continue on the project, thus setting everything back and delaying the results and adding stress to the tenure process. The participants felt that incorporating additional scenarios into the stopping the clock policy would be helpful. See Appendix P for a summary of the benchmarked stopping the tenure clock data. See Appendix Q for a copy of the stopping the tenure clock policies from the benchmarked universities.

In most scenarios, the request and approval process differs depending on the reason associated with the request. There were several circumstances were the extension following birth or adoption of a child automatically extended the tenure clock; whereas there was a request and approval procedure for the extension based on the other possible extenuating circumstances. For example, at the University of Connecticut, if a faculty member takes a leave of absence related to an FMLA qualifying major life event, the leave paperwork submitted to Human Resources (HR) triggers an automatic extension of the tenure clock. A majority of the universities had the extension based on an opt-out instead of opt-in programming following birth or adoption. The focus group participants expressed an interest in creating opt-out opportunities for policies relating to family services, such as stopping the tenure clock. The participants felt that if policies were implemented and advertised as opt-out scenarios more people would participate and the stigma associated with choosing family over work would be minimized.

There were three universities that also included a clause in the policy to protect the faculty member who elected to take the extension, the University of Alabama, Louisiana State, and Lehigh University. For example, the Lehigh University’s policy states “during tenure review, the department chair shall inform internal and external evaluators that the candidate must be evaluated with the same tenure criteria as candidates who have received no extensions and with the same expectations for accomplishments as would be applied to candidates who received no extensions.” This was a prominent topic during the focus group. One participant explained that she choose to stop the clock when she had her first child, and is now going up for early tenure. She felt that the early track meant having to be on an “extraordinary” track and discussed the pressure associated with that decision.

External Results: Greater Cincinnati Climate for Dual Career Hiring Network

Dual Career Feasibility Survey

The dual career 85 total respondents from over 30 different industries. Several respondents selected multiple industries in order to more accurately depict their company. The most prominent field was manufacturing with a total of 19 respondents, followed by professional, scientific and technical services with a total of 12 respondents. Health care and social assistance, government and transportation, warehousing and logistics all had around eight respondents. See Appendix R for an executive summary of the survey results.
Only 10% of the organizations surveyed have formal policies in place to support the recruitment of individuals from dual career households. All of the respondents from these organizations felt they have seen an improvement in recruitment and that their recruitment efforts were garnering a more diverse pool of employees due to these policies. Fourteen percent of the organizations partner with other local organizations to assist with finding job placements for accompanying partners when recruiting external candidates.

There were an additional 26% of respondents that do utilize informal procedures for supporting candidates facing dual career issues. Together, with the organizations offering formal policies, some of the best practices associated with both formal and informal procedures for supporting these candidates include utilizing a network of business consultants, recruiters & relocation providers; interviewing or placing the spouse within the host organization, providing local resources, job-site information, and temporary housing assistance, counseling the spouse, implementing detailed hiring procedures for dual career hiring, financial assistance, offering alternate options and reimbursements, informal networking, and providing flexible start dates.

One of the roundtable participants from Procter and Gamble, Farris Bukhari, explained their three pronged approach for supporting accompanying partners. The first step is an internal process to help the partner find placement within P&G. However, since 90% of the jobs P&G recruits are entry level positions, anyone with over three years of experience is considered overqualified. Mr. Bukhari also explained the rigorous recruiting process, only 3% of applicants are offered a job. The second prong is using a third party placement consultant that partners with the accompanying spouse to try to find them a job within the city. Lastly, an ad hoc approach is initiated when the human resources hiring manager reaches out to an informal network to see what opportunities are available.

On the contrary, the survey showed that 34% of the surveyed organizations do not provide assistance, and 30% of respondents did not answer the question. The respondents that provide no assistance commented that either the issue has not come up, or that the recruits that relocate to the area do not have spouses that work, and lastly, that it is not a matter that concerns them as it is up for the employee and their spouse. Kevin Wiseman, a roundtable attendee from the pharmaceutical industry, admitted to being one of the companies that does not provide any assistance. He explained that his company does not do a lot of external recruiting at high levels. However, the company has recently acquired various international locations and the dual career couple is becoming more of an issue. Wiseman mentioned the impact of dual career couples even when relocating their employees from various locations around the world. The company would still need to consider finding employment for the accompanying spouse, and selling the area as accommodating and appropriate for their families. He felt that offering support to accompanying spouses and families provides additional stability to help lessen the impact of a relocation.

Fifty-one percent of the organizations expressed an interest in joining a Regional Hiring exchange and an additional eighteen percent would consider joining pending more information, specifically, the scope of the network and potential costs associated with a membership.

The Dual Career Roundtable addressed potential costs associated with a membership to the proposed hiring exchange. The participants agreed that some type of cost structure is necessary as people tend to place a higher value on memberships that are associated with a fee. Some of the ideas surrounding costs for a hiring exchange included a sliding scale based on size of the company, free membership but charging for job advertisements, flat fees for successful hires, free access to all “basic” services and the ability to purchase “ad hoc” services. However, the parsimonious nature of companies was also discussed, including the reluctance for companies to dig into their pockets to support yet another nonprofit organization in the area.
The nonprofit sector was a salient part of the overall discussion. The attendees agreed that most companies have tightened their belts due to the recession, and to be successful the exchange should managed by an already established organization. Thus, reducing the chance of nonprofits and other service organizations cannibalizing each other to get resources.

**Recommendations**

After analyzing the data collected during the benchmarking phase of the project the UC LEAF team put together several recommendations for improving the AAUP contracts to better serve the work life balance needs of the faculty. The results from the internal and external focus groups were also combined and analyzed to produce recommendations for the University of Cincinnati in regards to a Hiring Exchange to support dual career couples within the region. The culmination of these efforts were presented to UC leadership on August 18, 2014. The recommendations are listed below. See Appendix S for a copy of the PowerPoint that was presented to university leadership on August 18, 2014.

I. AAUP Policy Updates
   a. Dual Career Hiring
      i. Create a permanent budget line for dual career hires university wide.
         1. Initiate a set procedure for department chairs and search committees when conducting a candidate search regarding dual career hires.
         2. Department Chair to contact the Dean who contacts the Office of Dual Career Hiring when the top candidates have been selected, during interviewing phase.
      ii. Office of Dual Career Hiring to disseminate dual career hiring information to the top two candidates
      iii. Include language in all job advertisements related to dual career hires; train all department chairs on dual career hiring.
         1. Example: (Purdue) The Office of Dual Career Hiring seeks to support the University's mission to attract and retain outstanding faculty and staff. We recognize that behind many top candidates stand equally strong partners who accompany them to the University.
         2. Example (University of Michigan): To maintain and strengthen its excellence, the University of Cincinnati must recruit and retain an outstanding faculty. Many faculty members who are being recruited by the University have partners who are accomplished professionals in their own right. Therefore, the ability of a dual career partner to find a suitable career opportunity is often a key factor in the recruitment process and ultimately in the couple's decision. The Office of Dual Career Hiring was created in response to this need.
      iv. Develop policies and resources to assist the accompanying partner with finding a position.
         1. Continue membership in HERC and expand usage.
         2. Create additional local network for hiring partners
         3. Interview practice
         4. Area Information (schools, daycare facilities, realtors, etc).
   b. Elder Care Assistance
i. Provost’s office to partner with the Human Resources department to help promote and disseminate the information available to UC faculty and staff pertaining to eldercare initiatives provided through the EAP.
ii. Provide information to all job candidates as part of the recruiting process.
iii. Investigate usage and effectiveness of current 3rd party provider – Impact Solutions.

c. Emergency Child Care
   i. Conduct a feasibility study to examine the effectiveness of emergency or back-up child care policies at other universities, including the cost of program and usage.
   ii. Implement an emergency child care solution for faculty and staff.

d. Lactation Support
   i. Incorporate the lactation policy and usage of lactation rooms onto university contracts.
   ii. Ensure all lactation rooms are dedicated lactation spaces (they currently are not) equipped with appropriate seating and mini refrigerators.
   iii. Publicize the existence and location of the lactation spaces, as well as additional resources for new parents, more effectively on campus.

e. Parental Leave
   i. Incorporate a non-discrimination clause to Article 19.2.4 and 20 concerning implications of leave taking on RPT decisions.
      1. Example: All individuals and committees participating in reappointment, promotion, and tenure reviews understand that any individual who took parental leave must be held to the same standard - not a higher or more stringent one - to which other candidates without such a leave are held.
   ii. Integrate an all-encompassing title to Article 19 to reflect additional familial situations which could arise and require the usage of leave (i.e. terminally ill relative, catastrophic events).

g. Part-Time Tenure
   i. Create specific policies in the contract governing part-time represented faculty positions (tenure-track, tenured, research, clinical, and educator).
   ii. Incorporate additional reasons for policy usage (i.e. terminally ill relative).
   iii. Eliminate the need to reapply each year if there is a continuing circumstance.
   iv. Proportional adjustment of the tenure clock based on the percentage of time dedicated to work.

h. Stopping the Tenure Clock
   i. Re-name Article 19 to be more all-encompassing “Family Leave”
   ii. Add language to deter discrimination on tenure review and to increase acceptance of use of this policy
      1. Example (University of Alabama): All individuals and committees participating in tenure reviews understand that any individual who has received a tenure period extension must be held to the same standard - not a higher or more stringent one - to which other candidates without such an extension are held.
   iii. Clarify that one cannot be turned down for this request.
   iv. Incorporate additional reasons for stopping the tenure clock, for catastrophic events, for example.
v. Provide some training for unit leaders to help expectant faculty member's use these and other related policies.

II. UC LEAF in conjunction with the Human Resources department will collect the following data pertaining to dual career hires:
   a. Usage of dual career policies and programming.
   b. Retention and performance rates.
   c. Missed opportunities, assess talent that the university missed. Figure out why applicants turn down job offers to the university and see if there is any correlation between partner placement issues.

III. Establish a permanent line of funding for an IT support person to manage a job bank with a regional outreach.
   a. Monitor usage of the job bank, ensure top tier jobs are promoted.
   b. Link the job bank to existing resources within the greater Cincinnati area, such as Agenda 360 and Diverse by Design.

IV. Ensure proper communication channels are enacted to disperse dual career hiring and career life balance initiatives among faculty and new hires.
   a. Ensure hiring committees from each department are trained on the dual career hiring initiatives and career life policies.
   b. UC LEAF Executive Director to facilitate departmental training for hiring committees.
   c. Promote the UC LEAF website to all faculty, staff and applicants in order to ensure all individuals stay abreast and are aware of the policies pertaining to dual career hiring and career life balance.
   d. UC LEAF to publish a new faculty material policy handbook to disperse to new faculty. This handbook will contain all of the career life balance issues to help build awareness and promote utilization of existing policies.

V. The University of Cincinnati has become a member of the ACE network. With this designation, the university commits to investing in policies and procedures that create a more flexible workplace for faculty (and perhaps staff).

References


Cornell University, (2014). Support for Faculty and Staff. Faculty and staff assistance program, Family helper list, Adult caregiving, Child care and parenting, Flexible work arrangements, Wellness program. Retrieved from https://www.hr.cornell.edu/life/support/.


from http://www.howard.edu/newsroom/proposedhowardfacultyhandbook/Faculty%20Handbook%20(3-7-13)%20(Final).pdf.


Jackson State Human Resources. (n.d.). Retrieved from http://www.jsums.edu/hr/


University of Alabama, (2014). Faculty Handbook. Sections, Tenure Earning Period, 2.15.4-7; Part-Time Tenure-Track and Tenured Appointments 2.5.4.. Retrieved from http://www.uab.edu/policies/Pages/Faculty-Handbook.aspx


