Accomplishments

* What are the major goals of the project?

* **Initiative I: Improve pathways for women faculty, including women faculty of color, in STEM by broadening recruitment, improving hiring, increasing retention, and promoting advancement.**

  * **Bottom Up:** Proposed activities include three separate professional development workshop series for women STEM faculty, and a LEAF mini-grants program to support women STEM faculty professional development and research. However, bottom up efforts related more broadly to this initiative are also included below.

  * **Top Down:** Proposed activities include best practices seminars and training workshops for leadership (heads, deans and administrators) and faculty committees responsible for hiring and RPT (reappointment, promotion, tenure). However, efforts related more broadly to this initiative are also included below.

* **Initiative II: Transform the climate for STEM faculty by creating social and collaborative mentoring networks to promote intellectual progress and equity, resulting in an inclusive culture.**

  * **Bottom Up:** Proposed activities include the establishment of learning communities for women STEM faculty and a Visiting Scholars Program. However, bottom up efforts related more broadly to this initiative are also included below.

  * **Top Down:** The primary purpose of this initiative is to assess climate and aid in development and implantation of unit-level logic models for change.

* **Initiative III: Create interdependence to reinforce mutual responsibility and fosters shared responsibility to enable sustainable dynamic institutional practice and policy.**
Major Activities:

Initiative IV: Social Science research on climate and transformation of policy and reform, as expressed through message linguistics, subjective experiences, and social networks.

* What was accomplished under these goals (you must provide information for at least one of the 4 categories below)?

**Initiatives I & II:**

- LEAF sponsored the Celebrating Women and Diversity in STEM! Breakfast on 2/4/14 with 72 RSVPS. We featured Melinda Bahabee-Gittens, MD, MS, speaking on “The Academic Contortionist: Morphing and Adjusting the Path.” LEAF also sponsored a lunch with Provost Davenport for 15 STEM faculty of color on January 16. Discussion centered on how the Provost's office could support retention and advancement and evolved into a loose learning community, with monthly lunches planned beginning March 20th.

- On 12/6/13, LEAF co-sponsored (with President, Provost, UC Diversity Council, Women’s Gender and Sexuality Studies, Journalism, and Women’s Center) a workshop led by The OpEd Project. The goal was to provide attendees with basic knowledge of and support to publish research and ideas via OpEd pieces. Eighteen women staff and faculty attended, six of which were from STEM (including Valerie Hardcastle, Melanie Cushion). The Steering Committee, including Stacie Holloway, is planning a second workshop for Fall.

- The Jr. East LC met monthly with an average of 7 faculty attending. Topics varied. The Jr. West LC held 5 meetings and topics included: negotiation, RPT, personnel issues, branding. The LC for mid-level faculty (east campus) continues to meet monthly. Initial meetings were to get acquainted and discuss LC goals. Subsequent meetings focus on how to work successfully with leadership. LC facilitator Sandra Degen gave a presentation, “How to Work with Your Chair”, that she gives yearly at the American Association of Medical Colleges Workshop for MidCareer Women Faculty. 8-10 faculty attended each meeting. There is a sense of camaraderie and many fruitful science and dual career discussions are underway. As a result of the LC, Erin Haynes (Assoc. Prof, Environmental Health) applied for and was accepted to attend the AAMC Workshop for Mid-Career Women. Erin’s attendance yielded new information on a role as a Women In Medicine (WIM) liaison with the AAMC. After nomination by Dr. Degen and the Dean of the COM, Erin is developing a WIM group. Several formal and informal LC-related activities continue to bring together women from across campus to promote networking.

- LEAF held 2 training workshops for heads, assoc. deans, and deans on recruiting, hiring, retaining, promoting women and women of color to aid in logic model development. The Provost asked that we develop a training program for all heads on campus. We created a toolkit webpage for heads and search committees. The draft of the HR Toolkit has been customized for UC. Upon approval, the toolkit will be uploaded to the LEAF website. Included will be a drop-down menu to allow users from different departments or Colleges to search for discipline-specific recruitment information. LEAF has received 10 (of 17) logic models and started analysis. We will report our findings to the Provost and Deans, who will then respond to departments. LEAF is also collaborating with the Provost’s office on new initiatives for diversifying faculty, including support for underrepresented faculty and dual
career hires. (See Impacts)
- Leaf has a meeting on 3/10/14 with key personnel in HR to address the challenge of getting accurate data on faculty.

**Initiative III:** The AAC met twice to review climate data, the revised evaluation plan, indicator data, and the first year site visit report. Ongoing activities include:

- Review of RPT, workload, and unit policies to ensure family-friendly and collaborative initiatives
- Appointment of senior faculty in STEM colleges to serve as “allies” for women faculty in need of mediation services
- Appointment of a committee to oversee revision of the UC hiring manual
- AAC members in COM are working with departments engaged in hiring to assist with diversity efforts.

**Initiative IV & Other Data:**

- **Social Networks.** Data were gathered from 8 departments, with 7 more scheduled. Preliminary results have been and will be presented at various conferences.
- **Discourse Analysis.** E-mails from listservs were gathered for 2000-2012, including STEM colleges, faculty, deans, heads, and directors. Messages rendered over 60,000 pages of e-mails embedded in code. Extraction revealed 3,364 unique messages, and initial sorting of e-mails identified 1,162 specific to STEM sciences. STEM e-mails were coded using Nvivo 10 software and suggest that few STEM messages pertain to gender. When masculine language was used it was typically implicit. E-mails pertaining to STEM women were explicit and typically related to initiatives forwarded by outside organizations. Few STEM e-mails used language relating to race/ethnicity. Additional coding will analyze differences in language regarding men and women faculty, diverse identities, leadership, and RPT.
- **Turnover Data.** In November, LEAF launched a study of former UC faculty designed to identify reasons for leaving and whether those reasons differ for women versus men faculty in STEM and non-STEM disciplines. We have located more than 300 faculty, 40% of whom have completed surveys. Data collection is scheduled to end in March.
- **Best Schools Study.** We have begun data collection on the representation of women and women of color on the faculties of UC’s peer and aspirant institutions. These data will allow specific disciplines to compare the composition of faculty to that of peer/aspirant programs. Findings may be used to highlight units who have done an exceptional job of recruiting and retaining women and women of color and to motivate those with suboptimal representation to act.
- **Climate Data.** We received preliminary results of the climate survey from the External Evaluation team in December. Data suggest women faculty, compared to male peers, tend to have less favorable perceptions of fairness, transparency, and consistency of recruiting and hiring processes at the department level; less positive views of diversity issues in general, and perceived less support for women and faculty of color. Women reported they were treated with less respect within departments, that departments operated in less open ways, and were less satisfied with resource and workload allocation. These results will be shared with faculty and leadership across campus in a series of data-sharing meetings conducted by Valerie Hardcastle.
- **Career-Life Balance Initiative:** Andrea Burkhardt, Project Coordinator for the CLB project has established working relationships with several members of UC staff
charged with dual career recruitment and support. These individuals include Dr. Robin Martin and Donna Bowman (HR). Benchmarking of dual career policies and procedures at other ADVANCE and Research I institutions was completed in December. We are working to include examples of specific policies to share with staff noted above. Data will also be included in the feasibility report that will be provided to the President in August. Along with Donna Bowman, Andrea is scheduling site visits with HR leaders at some of Cincinnati’s largest employers to learn about their dual career policies. She will also be gauging interest in a regional hiring exchange. In a recent meeting with Shelly Sherman, Senior Director for HR, LEAF learned about a dual career network that exists within the Cincinnati area. This network is administered through a local consulting firm and Andrea will invite the administrator to campus in order to learn more about the potential for collaboration. We have scheduled a focus group on 3/10 for UC faculty hired within the past 5 years who are part of a dual career couple. The objective will be to gather data regarding recruitment processes and how issues of dual career partners were addressed. We aim to also gather information regarding on-going (lack of) support of dual career families. A follow-up workshop is planned for later in the spring/summer where we will focus on providing faculty with strategies and tools.

Specific Objectives:

Significant Results:

Key outcomes or Other achievements:

* What opportunities for training and professional development has the project provided?

- Ready, set, go! Workshops for professional development.
- Learning communities (now expanded to include senior STEM women faculty and African American STEM faculty groups).
- LEAF small grant awards.
- Recruitment, hiring, retention, and promotion workshops for heads.
- Training workshops of deans and department heads on the development of unit level logic models for recruiting, hiring, promoting, and retaining a diverse faculty.
- Celebrating Women and Diversity in STEM! Breakfast series.
- OpEd project.

* How have the results been disseminated to communities of interest?

- Workshop for recruiting, hiring, promoting, and retaining a diverse faculty will be repeated in university diversity conference.
- Data presentations that summarize our baseline data and preliminary social network analysis have been scheduled for Dean’s Council, Head’s Council in the College of Engineering and Applied Science, Chair’s Council in the College of Medicine, and Head’s Council and Faculty Senate in the College of Arts and Sciences.
- OpEd piece developed for Women’s History month. Valerie Hardcastle and Stacie Holloway assisted Marianne Kuhnnen Jones with development of the piece. President Ono and Hardcastle will have the by-line.
- For the ADVANCE audience, we are sharing via smaller ADVANCE-sponsored conferences as well as the ADVANCE PI workshop. We are also hoping to disseminate findings to a broader academic and practitioner audience via participation in the upcoming SPSSI conference and the 2014 Gender Summit.

Below are upcoming presentations.

- Furst-Holloway, S., Kallen, R., Eiler, B., & Hardcastle, V. Intra-and Inter-Departmental Social Networks. To be


* What do you plan to do during the next reporting period to accomplish the goals?

- Hire a Program Director, who will (among other things): develop an effective communication plan, update our webpages, analyze previous events for URM attendance.
- Hold several data presentations across campus.
- Continue to work with departments and colleges on targeted hires for STEM women, especially underrepresented minority faculty.
- Develop training for heads across campus, in collaboration with the Provost's office.
- Provide unit-level feedback on logic models.
- Analysis of logic models will inform Provost's strategic plans for hiring.
- Have another Celebrating Women and Diversity in STEM! Breakfast with a panel discussion on moving from “bench” to administration.
- Dr. Diane Halpern will come in April as a best-practices visitor.
- Expand visibility of AAC as a safe space for women to come talk about sensitive issues.
- Follow-up analysis of STEM search processes to determine whether there were any changes in practice or results.
- Work with COM associate deans to develop a program of faculty development.
- Meet with Hispanic/Latina STEM faculty to determine their level of interest in forming a learning community for the 2014-2015 academic year.
- Develop and begin to implement plan to address the challenge of getting untainted data on faculty with key personnel in Human Resources.
- Revise Faculty Hiring Manual.
- Begin conversations with the union and administration about the possibility of part-time tenured and tenure-track positions.
- Complete space analysis for faculty.
- Coordinate activities with the AAMC Women in Medicine representative.
- Start analysis of workload and RPT (reappointment, promotion, and tenure) documents for the College of Applied Science and Engineering.
- The LEAF team is planning a Social Networking workshop in April/May to present findings from the social network analysis. We have contacted Ines Mergel from Syracuse University to assess her availability to attend and present her work. Content for the workshop will also include a session on developing networking skills, specifically targeting our women and women of color in STEM.
- Continue Programming (workshops, LC’s, Best practices, Visiting Scholars).

Products

Journals

Books

Book Chapters

Thesis/Dissertations

Conference Papers and Presentations
Other Publications

Technologies or Techniques

Patents

Inventions

Licenses

Websites

Other Products

Participants

What individuals have worked on the project?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Most Senior Project Role</th>
<th>Nearest Person Month Worked</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Santa Ono</td>
<td>PD/PI</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Urmila Ghia</td>
<td>Co PD/PI</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Valerie G Hardcastle</td>
<td>Co PD/PI</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Steven R Howe</td>
<td>Co PD/PI</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rachel Kallen</td>
<td>Co PD/PI</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

What other organizations have been involved as partners?
Nothing to report.

Have other collaborators or contacts been involved? N

Impacts

What is the impact on the development of the principal discipline(s) of the project?

- Offers of tenure track positions are currently out to four women in the College of Engineering and Applied Science; one Latina woman was hired into a tenure track position in Geology; and a proposal for two women hires in physics has been submitted, one of whom is part of a dual career couple. The finalists for a biochemistry search in the Department of Biological Sciences are 50% women. Psychology is currently negotiating to hire an Hispanic male and his wife as a dual career couple in the department.
- Erin Haynes, PhD (Associate Professor in Environmental Health) has been named the Women in Medicine representative for UC with the American Association of Medical Colleges. This opportunity came out of interactions in her learning community.
- We have been sought out by women faculty individually to help with a promotion and tenure issue, hiring practices, and departmental/college climate. We have mediated or are in the process of mediating each situation.
- Thus far, at least two STEM departments have used the candidate evaluation tool we developed for interviewing faculty
as part of their hiring process.

**What is the impact on other disciplines?**

- Philosophy is participating in dual career hire focus group, as their faculty profile closely resembles that of the STEM disciplines.
- Valerie Hardcastle is part of a site visit team for philosophy departments to assess climate and practices. She is part of two site visits this academic year, one of which has received considerable attention in the press (there are five total scheduled).
- A strong ally, Melanie Cushion, has been named as a member of the search committee for the next Vice Provost and Dean of the Graduate School.
- Faculty from all areas attend the diversity breakfast events.

**What is the impact on the development of human resources?**
Nothing to report.

**What is the impact on physical resources that form infrastructure?**
Nothing to report.

**What is the impact on institutional resources that form infrastructure?**

- Working with Provost to align faculty support programs with LEAF initiatives and to sustain LEAF programs beyond the tenure of the grant.
- Working with Provost's office and Human Resources to develop a network of contacts for dual career hires for partners inside and outside of academia.
- Diversity grant launched out of Division of Research.
- The President's Office has launched a new strategic plan. In earlier draft stages, members of the LEAF team commented on the need to increase diversity and support for STEM faculty. Resources for faculty and faculty support form the central planks of the Third Century plan.

**What is the impact on information resources that form infrastructure?**
Nothing to report.

**What is the impact on technology transfer?**
Nothing to report.

**What is the impact on society beyond science and technology?**
Nothing to report.

---

**Changes**

**Changes in approach and reason for change**

- We hired a part-time program coordinator to assist in managing the details of the grant. This is a replacement for the position we eliminated in November.
- We are in the process of hiring a Program Director, who will play a leadership role in managing all aspects of the grant.
- We have expanded the management team to include Robin Martin as a representative of the Provost's office and to expand our STEM women faculty of color initiatives; Karen Faaborg, chair of the AAC; and Urmila Ghia, chair of the IAC. We expect this to improve communication among our various groups and to provide more checks and balances on proposed program activities.
- In addition to adding Robin Martin to the management team to help our focus on race and ethnic diversity, we have
created a diversity advisory committee to help with programming suggestions and priorities for LEAF.

- We are starting to put together some working committees to focus on making particular policy recommendations that will include faculty allies and members of the AAC and IAC.
- We have expanded our Blackboard site to include all members of the IAC and AAC and can upload all relevant documents for sharing there.

**Actual or Anticipated problems or delays and actions or plans to resolve them**

- There has been a significant delay in hiring a Program Director because we have had a hard time finding someone with the requisite skills and background who either lives in the area or is willing to move here. We have been interviewing potential candidates since December 2013. We have now identified an excellent candidate, who has accepted the position. This delay in getting a Program Director on board has meant that our communication to community members is less than what we would like and that some data analysis has been put on hold until the summer months.
- The College of Medicine has not submitted any of its logic models. The college is in the process of consolidating and restructuring its basic science departments, and we all agree that it would not be productive for departments to work on a logic model while they are slated for elimination. One department (Cancer Biology) has completed its restructuring and a new chair was hired as of January. Valerie is meeting with him in March to bring him up to speed regarding UC LEAF and the logic models.
- The IAC meeting scheduled for December had to be cancelled at the last minute because the College of Medicine called an emergency meeting for all senior personnel. As a consequence, four members of the IAC were suddenly unable to attend the meeting. Given the challenges facing the College of Medicine, we thought it best to reschedule the meeting at a time when everyone could attend. That meeting is now rescheduled for March.

**Changes that have a significant impact on expenditures**

Nothing to report.

**Significant changes in use or care of human subjects**

Nothing to report.

**Significant changes in use or care of vertebrate animals**

Nothing to report.

**Significant changes in use or care of biohazards**

Nothing to report.

---

**Special Requirements**

Responses to any special reporting requirements specified in the award terms and conditions, as well as any award specific reporting requirements.