



Briefing

# The U.S. Department of Education's Notice of Proposed Rulemaking on Title IX Regulations on Students' Eligibility for Athletic Teams

## Presented by:

**Janet P. Judge**, Partner, Education & Sports Law Group, LLC

**Joseph Storch**, Senior Director of Compliance and Innovation Solutions, Grand River Solutions, Inc.

**Shannon Minter**, Legal Director, National Center for Lesbian Rights

## The Legal Landscape:

- ***Hecox v. Little***, 479 F. Supp. 3d 930 (D. Idaho 2020) (initial PI ruling).
- ***Utah High Sch. Activities Ass'n***, 2022 WL 3907182 (Utah Dist. Ct. Aug. 19, 2022).
- ***Barrett v. State of Mont.***, No. DV-21-581B, at 5-7 (Mont. Dist. Ct. Sept. 14, 2022).
- ***A.M. by E.M. v. Indianapolis Pub. Sch.***, No. 1:22-cv-01075-JMSDLP, 2022 WL 2951430 (S.D. Ind. July 26, 2022), *appeal dismissed*, No. 22-2332 (7th Cir. Jan. 19, 2023).
- ***B.P.J. v. W. Va. State Bd. of Educ.***, No. 2:21-CV-00316, 2023 WL 111875 (S.D.W. Va. Jan. 5, 2023) (initial PI ruling).
- ***Soule v. Conn. Ass'n of Sch.***, 57 F.4th 43 (2d Cir. 2022) (*en banc* review pending).

# The Unofficial Proposed Regulation Language:

The proposed regulation would be in the Title IX regulations at section 106.41(b)(2):

- If a recipient adopts or applies sex-related criteria that would limit or deny a student's eligibility to participate on a male or female team consistent with their gender identity, such criteria must, for each sport, level of competition, and grade or education level:
  - (i) be substantially related to the achievement of an important educational objective, and
  - (ii) minimize harms to students whose opportunity to participate on a male or female team consistent with their gender identity would be limited or denied.

# NCAA Policy:

- NCAA Policy referenced but not officially endorsed in the unofficial proposed regulations.
- Jan 2022: the NCAA Board of Governors updated the transgender student-athlete participation policy to incorporate sport-by-sport eligibility requirements that align with the Olympic movement in three phases.
- The NCAA Committee on Competitive Safeguards and Medical Aspects of Sports(CSMAS) developed corresponding sport-specific NCAA transgender student-athlete eligibility criteria: [fall sports](#), [winter sports](#) and [spring sports](#).
- Jan 2023: the BOG extended Phase Two of the [NCAA transgender student-athlete participation policy](#) through the 2023-24 academic year.
- Schools are required to submit sensitive medical documentation during the year to the NCAA’s CSMAS Medical Review Panel. Schools may designate a contact person for all related communication.
- The NCAA “encourage[s] schools to consult with legal, risk management and other applicable campus personnel as necessary before submitting eligibility information to evaluate and confirm, as necessary, the applicability of any [...] laws and related requirements.”

# Phase 2: Effective 2022-23 and 2023-24

- **Transgender Men:**

- The policy updates do not change eligibility requirements for a transgender man to compete during the 2022-23 and 2023-24 academic years.
- If gender affirming medical care for any student-athlete involves the use of NCAA banned substances (e.g., testosterone), a school would be required to submit a medical exception request on behalf of the student-athlete. More information may be found at [NCAA medical exception procedures](#) .

- **Transgender Women:**

1. [NCAA Transgender Student-Athlete Eligibility Review Form](#); and
2. **Evidence of Serum Testosterone Level.** Laboratory results demonstrating a one-time total serum testosterone level that is within the allowable levels for the sport in which the student-athlete plans to compete. Additionally, submitted laboratory results must be within four weeks (28 days) prior to the applicable competition date (e.g., student-athlete's first contest of each playing season segment or championship selection date).

# Open Questions and Takeaways:

- State laws.
- Preemption questions.
- School policies and procedures.
- Comment.
- Education.
- Next steps.





# Questions?

NACUA materials, PowerPoint slides and recordings available as part of this program are offered as educational materials for higher education lawyers and administrators. They are prepared by presenters and are not reviewed for legal content by NACUA. They express the legal opinions and interpretations of the authors.

Answers to legal questions often depend on specific facts, and state and local laws, as well as institutional policies and practices. The materials, PowerPoint slides and comments of the presenters should not be used as legal advice. Legal questions should be directed to institutional legal counsel.

Those wishing to re-use the materials, PowerPoint slides or recordings should contact NACUA ([nacua@nacua.org](mailto:nacua@nacua.org)) prior to any re-use.