The Niehoff Urban Studio

URBAN FOOD AND QUALITY OF LIFE

SUMMARY REPORT 2002-04
The Niehoff Studio is a place for the university led, but community driven study and discussion of urban issues for the benefit of Cincinnati and other urban centers. It is a place where University and non-university participants can come to participate in educational classes, events, symposia, and exhibits that explore these urban issues.

The Niehoff Studio is a unique and innovative off-campus classroom in which an interdisciplinary group of university students and faculty can interact with community stakeholders to study and experience, first-hand all aspects of the urban issues relevant to the center city.

The work of the Niehoff studio is intended to have a tangible impact on the urban problems under consideration and will contribute to the body of knowledge of research in this area.
works

PURE RESEARCH
Findings on the food system of Greater Cincinnati with a focus on urban food production, distribution, and consumption. Consideration of the “social ecology” surrounding food land uses, and the development potential of these uses for urban revitalization. Findings pertaining to the equity of food access among different socioeconomic groups.

APPLIED RESEARCH
Mapping and description of the physical aspects of existing food production, distribution, and consumption uses throughout the central urban area and selected outlying counties. National survey and analysis of existing urban supermarket prototypes and attendant retail systems with application to specific inner-city sites. Observation and analysis of agricultural production for application towards farmland preservation.

SERVICE LEARNING
Contribution to community development through curriculum and internship opportunities that provided interactions and collaborations with community stakeholders.

COMMUNITY EDUCATION
Public symposium, exhibit, and publication of findings disseminated from downtown studio. Initiative to convene stakeholders in an action oriented agenda to effect food policy in greater Cincinnati.
“Government entities, including academic institutions should play a lead role in addressing inner-city food access issues...Universities, operated by states, have an obligation to provide research, training, and technical assistance on the resolution of pressing public concerns, of which inner city (retail food outlets) access and development certainly qualify.” (Public Voice for Food Health and Policy)

The Niehoff Urban Studio is a new and unique interdisciplinary initiative that addresses urban issues that challenge the quality of life in Cincinnati and other cities across the nation. Through the studio, UC endeavors to engage the community in a urban problem solving effort to meet Cincinnati’s current and future needs. The content focus of the studio from 2002-2004 has been on food production, distribution, and retail.

From early times to the present, food has occupied a central place in the urban community. The food we eat is telling of our identity, our ethnicity, our social class, our political and social views, and our state of health. Food retailers, local governemnts, urban designers, architects, and other urban professionals have long been concerned with access to urban retail food shops by diverse socioeconomic, ethnic, and age groups; the distribution of these shops in the physical and social urban fabric; the current and emerging trends in retail food on consumer preferences; the uses of food and entertainment as community development tools; and the viability of local farm food production.

In the Fall and Winter Quarters, the studio work focused on various aspects of retail food land uses and development types. Chief among the project areas was the study of supermarkets within the urban environment. The history and current trends of food retailing was researched with attention to food retail patterns within our urban center. Architecture and Planning students analysed the best siting for a supermarket in the Uptown area of Cincinnati and designed mixed-use development scenarios centered on food and entertainment uses. Architecture students also studied the typology of supermarkets and proposed both prototypical models and unique design solutions for creating a new small footprint urban supermarket building that incorporated novel approaches to site development, parking provision, and physical/programmatic connectivity to the surrounding community. Interior Design and Industrial Design students proposed new concepts for a positive consumer experience of grocery shopping. Urban Geography and Planning students considered equity issues in retail food accessibility throughout the city.

Spring 2003 Works

In the Spring of 2003, teams of Graduate Planners worked on four different, but related project ideas. One team of students investigated the feasibility of implementing an urban design proposals developed during the autumn/winter quarters.
Another team of urban planning and urban geography students investigated the key considerations surrounding the issue of increased access to retail food stores in the core and core-periphery sections of the older American city. The group’s focus included the relationship of social theory to the concept of access to urban retail food stores, social equity, and policy development.

A team of students investigated emerging concepts and assumptions surrounding the role of the urban retail food store in promoting social interaction and in serving as a catalyst for urban neighborhood stability.

A fourth team of students investigated the issues surrounding the quality of the urban retail food store consumer environment by focusing on enhanced experiential, visual, and functional attributes of desirable food retail scenarios.

**Fall 2003 Works**

Fall studio work examined the city and public space to understand the presence of food in the life of public places. This research included the observation and analysis of food uses by identifying the cultural/spatial/functional urban environments within which such uses occur. This exploration also reflected a broader discourse on urban vitality. More popularized presences of food in the life of public spaces include: street vending, public food markets, and food festivals. These food venues resonate as issues of daily importance in the political economy of street vending, observation of vendors’ boundaries of activities, consumer access and desire to have food in public space, and the examination of how culture and authority structure the interaction between food and space. Students applied research findings and design principles to a series of proposals that included public food festivals, restaurants as job training programs, street food vending, mobile food/festival projects, public event spaces, and urban gardening.

**Winter 2004 Works**

During the Winter quarter of 2004, Architecture and Urban Planning students explored the role of street vitality in placemaking with a focus on the “Urban Entertainment” districts of Main Street and Vine Street in Over-The-Rhine. Within these two districts, and the Findlay Market area, the studio considered the presence of food and entertainment and its implication for street vitality and community development.

In the course of their research, students worked closely with individual community stakeholders and their constituent organizations to develop an understanding of diverse viewpoints on community development policy and outcomes. Each student team was charged with resolving apparent conflicts between opposing groups through speculative policy proposals and related design interventions. Final projects for the Winter quarter included ideas for all facets of life in Over-The-Rhine, ranging from proposals for light industry to children’s play environments. Substantial attention was focused on potential interventions within the Findlay Market area, which envisioned novel food vending, outdoor eating and entertainment venues.

**Spring 2004 Works**

In the Spring Quarter of 2004, the Graduate Comprehensive Planning Studio studied the production and distribution aspects of the local food system. This included a primary focus on promoting local food production through small farm preservation in the metropolitan area of Cincinnati. Students complemented this activity with considerations of how to connect food producers with consumers both within and outside the urban area.

Students investigated national issues relevant to impacts on small farmers in the Cincinnati area and studied and proposed economic strategies for enhancing small farm sustainability. During the course of the quarter, student teams selected case study areas in two of the fastest growing counties of the
region, Warren and Boone counties. They analyzed the threat of sprawling development to the survival of small farm food production in these counties. Proposals included new land-use policies, preservation incentives, and economic strategies to enhance the viability of small farms.

**Associated Seminars/Studios**

Three associated academic studio projects were conducted in collaboration with the Niehoff Urban Studio.

In the Winter of 2003, ten graduate Design students working on campus conducted studio work on new approaches to the design of the retail food consumer environment. A separate group of five Urban Planners analysed five supermarkets to determine the connection between social and physical capital within the communities studied.

In the Winter of 2004, sixteen interior design students completed restaurant design proposals for Vine and Main Streets. The subject for one of these restaurants was Venice Pizza, which evolved into the associated technical outreach project described below.

**Associated Projects**

Based on the work of the Winter 2004 Interior Design studio, the Community Design Center, with funding from the University of Cincinnati Institute for Community Partnerships, provided architectural services for the interior construction of the Venice Pizza restaurant on Vine Street in Over-the-Rhine. This restaurant is operated by the non-profit group Power in Progress and provides job training for hard to employ persons from Over-The-Rhine. The Design Center partnered with Miami University’s Center for Community Engagement as well as other architectural studios from the College of DAAP to construct the restaurant through a design-build process. Once open the restaurant will provide a much needed economic activity for the Vine Street corridor.

**Public Events**

During the 2002-04 project years, the Niehoff Urban Studio was host to nearly two hundred attendees in a series of ten events, which included public presentations and debate on current architectural and urban design projects in the downtown area. The Niehoff Urban Studio exhibits the work of the students in the Emery Center on a continuing basis and has opened its doors to more than three hundred visitors during the “Taste of Cincinnati” events of 2002-04.

- **5.25.03:** Taste of Cincinnati Exhibit and Open House
- **10.22.03:** Projects in Over-The-Rhine and the West End, Speakers: Jeff Raser, GlaserWorks, Robin Brandon, Cincinnati Public School and Jeff Dodge, Cole and Russell, Bob Richardson, City of Cincinnati, Frank Russell, UC Community Design Center
- **11.19.03:** Civic Leadership for Center City Revitalization Efforts (A joint meeting with the Urbanists Civic Group) Speakers: Thomas Blinn, Cincinnati Center City Development Corp, David Ginsburg, Downtown Cincinnati Inc, Tim Sharp, Port Authority, Jeff Stec, The Urbanists Civic Group, Barry Gee, Cincinnati Tomorrow Civic Group
- **12.3.03:** Projects in the Central Business District Speakers: John Alschuler, HRBA, Cincinnati Center City Plan, Bob Richardson, City Architect
- **12.15.04:** Student projects for the Cincinnati Subway with Cincinnati Tomorrow Civic Group
- **2.19.04:** The Proposed “Kroger” Garage Design Vine and Central Parkway Speakers: Rick Kimbler, President, Rick Kimbler Interests and Developer, Bob Richardson, City Architect
- **4.14.04:** The Cincinnati Subway tour with Cincinnati Tomorrow
- **4.26.04:** Projects in Uptown, Speakers: Ron Kull, AIA University Architect, University of Cincinnati, Dale McGrill, Vice President, University of Cincinnati
- **5.19.04:** Projects in the Eastern Avenue Corridor Speakers: Arni Bortz, Towne Properties, Bob Little, Sr. Principal- Director of Development; Urban Equity Properties, Patrick Ewing; Senior Community Development Analyst, Department of Community Development and City Planning, City of Cincinnati
- **5.28.04:** Taste of Cincinnati Exhibit and Open House
- **6.2 9.04:** Washington Park District Plan Proposal Speakers: Steven Leeper Cincinnati Center City Development Corporation
- **8.17.04:** On the Ground Design Harrett for Social Justice with Miami University Center for Community Engagement.

**Community Partnerships**

During the 2002-04 program, students and faculty of the Niehoff Urban Studio collaborated with more than twenty stakeholder groups through their outreach, public education, and academic work.
This academic outreach partnership is made possible through the sponsorship and collaboration of Mr. H.C. Buck Niehoff, the Kroger Corporation, the Ohio Urban University Program, University of Cincinnati Institute for Community Partnerships, and the University of Cincinnati, in collaboration with the Schools of Architecture and Interior Design, Planning, and Geography, and is administered by the College of DAAP Community Design Center.

University Level Steering Committee: Dale L. McGirr, MPA, Vice President, Office of Vice President Finance, Judith Koroszik, Ph.D., Dean, College of Design, Art, Architecture, and Planning, Barbara Gould, Ph.D., Dean, College of Arts and Sciences, Ronald B. Kull, MA, Associate Vice President, University Architect’s Office, Lawrence J. Johnson, Ph.D., Dean, College of Education, Criminal Justice, and Human Services, Mary R. Stagaman, BA, APR, Associate Vice President Community Relation and Marketing, Governmental Relations and University Communication, Anthony J. Perzgian, Ph.D., Sr. Vice President and Provost Professor, Office of Sr. Vice President and Provost

College Steering Committee: Judith Koroszik, Ph.D., Dean, College of Design, Art, Architecture, and Planning, Daniel S. Friedman, FAIA, Director, School of Architecture and Interior Design, Henry P. Hildebrandt, MArch., Associate Director, School of Architecture and Interior Design, David Edelman, Ph.D., Director, School of Planning, Frank Russell, MArch., AIA, Director, Community Design Center

Faculty: Gil Born, Professor Emeritus, School of Industrial Design, Andrew Jacobs, Ph.D., Assistant Professor, School of Planning, Udo Greinacher, MArch., Associate Professor, School of Architecture and Interior Design, Colleen McTaue, MA, Adjunct Instructor, Department of Geography, Jeffrey T. Tilman, Ph.D., Assistant Professor, School of Architecture and Interior Design, Menelaos Triantafliliou, MLA., Visiting Associate Professor, School of Planning, Michaela Pride-Wells, Assoc. Professor of Architecture, Kiril Stanilov, PhD, Asst. Professor of Urban Planning, So-Shin Choi, Assoc. Professor of Industrial Design, Frank Russell, MArch. AIA., Director, Community Design Center

Graduate Assistants and Student Helpers: Samantha Hoffa, Dyah Kartikawening, Chris Gritzmacher, Stephen Filigino, Dan Macdonald, Viorica Popescu, Tricia Martin, Alan Marrero, Harish Vutukuru, Steve Muzik, Lauren Kelch, Vanessa Tyree, Emalee Listerman, Megan Minock, Emily Angell


Collaborating Community Stakeholder Groups and Individuals: Civic Garden Association, Over The Rhine Chamber of Commerce, Tom Brescanceny, Over The Rhine Community Council Sister Monica McGlone, Walter Rheinhaus, Cincinnati Tomorrow, Barry Gee, the Urbanists Jeffrey Stec, Friends of Findlay Market, John Kornbluh, The Findlay Market Association, Bob Pickford, The Vine Street Pride Center, Jim Franklin, Cincinnati City Center Development Corporation., Des Bracey, Downtown Cincinnati Inc. Kathy Schwab, The Kroger Corporation., Monte Chesko, The Corryville Community Economic Development Corporation, Maureen Mello, the City of Cincinnati, Tom Jackson Miami University Community Engagement Center, Tom Dutton, Robert Bell, The Drop Inn Center Shelterhouse, Pat Clifford, The Over The Rhine Foundation, Marge Hammelrath, ReStoc, Andy Hutzel, Power inspires Progress, Cincinnati Chapter of the American Institute of Architects, the Architectural Foundation, Aaron Etzler

Niehoff Studio at the Emery Center, 110 East Central Parkway, Cincinnati, OH 45202
Tel.513.556.3282; Fax. 513.564.0959; email: frank.russell@uc.edu; website: www.uc.edu/cdc
In the pre-industrial era, people produced most of their own goods necessary for living, therefore purchasing less items.

Markets were held on specific days of the week and were used for the exchange of specialized goods. The “catchment” area for the market encompassed a radius of approximately six to eight miles. This was the distance that could be served in one day’s travel. These ‘central markets’, however could not feasibly survive if people had little to sell or spend. The livelihood of the market grew with the introduction of a market economy, which more readily allowed for individuals to live independently. The early markets did not have the variety of goods that would be commonly associated with grocery stores today. There was a hierarchical arrangement of markets. The local market sold the surplus production within a settlement. The central market sold products from local settlements, and roaming merchants and vendors were yet another entity connected the hierarchy of markets.
Merchants shipped goods down the Rhein in the late 1400's. As commercial centers sprouted up on rivers due to the efficient transportation they afforded.

Markets have played an important role in the formation of communities. The Greek Agora served an important function in Greek cities. It combined trade, civic activities, and socializing, in one it was the central place of exchange of ideas and commerce. The Greek Agora was imitated and modified by the Romans. Thus creating formalized spaces and the Roman Empire. Wandering merchants in Europe and a surplus of goods helped to spur along a new form of buying and selling during the Middle Ages, the local market. The local market was held weekly in the open air and supplied the needed provisions to nearby towns. The merchants brought their produce into town, paid taxes to the king or lord, and set up a stall for trading in a fixed spot.
Sixteenth Century to the Eighteenth Century

This period saw a shift from aristocracy to a merchant class. Money became a central focus. The physical features of the market changed. The market places, which were once by public buildings in a major public “square,” were slowly moving to areas bordered by merchant houses and street-front shops with goods displayed in windows. Many craftsmen became retail traders and wholesale food dealers began to buy direct from producers in the country.

By the 18th century, the market was no longer a casual place for the exchange of goods. It was no longer solely the market of local farmers bringing in their surplus goods for supplemental income. By this time period, a considerable percentage of work had become specialized and people relied on the market for the majority of goods. The increased competition, caused by heavy reliance upon markets, led to standards of products and comparison shopping. Signage, as a form of advertising, had become particularly important as vendors tried to attract new business.
Food Production, Distribution, and Manufacture 1845-1900

Food Production 1845 -1900

- Food Production increased sharply during the 19th century
- In 1800 it took 373 man-hours using an ox-drawn plow to produce 3 tons of wheat
- In 1960 it took 10 man hours using tractors and combine harvesters to harvest the same amount
- Crop breeding begun in the 1800s and increased productivity 48% during the years 1935 - 1975

During this time the cost to manufacture farm machinery made from iron and steel drastically fell, making technical innovations possible

John Deere 1837

Gasoline powered tractors were developed in the 1890s, but did not fully overtake the horse until the 1940s
Food Manufacture

- **1850s** - Commercial canneries established in New England
- **1850s** - Much of the fruit and vegetables produced in the US are canned commercially
- **1874** - Invention of pressure cooker allows for automated production process
- **1870s** - Beef packing houses become the first American industry to use the assembly line
GROCERIES FROM 1900-1945

Agriculture

- USDA founded in 1862
- Industrialization of the farming system
- Collapse of agriculture throughout the 1920s and 1930s
- Introduction of the tractor and chemical fertilizers allows for mass production of food
- Agricultural products become a major US export before the 1920s and again after 1940
- Planes influence agriculture because of the new possibility of crop dusting

Transportation

- Refrigerated box cars change from ice to mechanical methods.
- The introduction of the automobile to the general public revolutionizes transportation
- Road network becomes more advanced and trucking becomes more popular

Refrigeration

- Prior to 1900 almost all refrigeration relied on ice blocks
- Mechanical Refrigeration begins in the dairy and meatpacking industries
- Grocery stores begin to use “coolers”
- The first home domestic unit introduced in 1913 - by 1920 there were over 200 models
- In 1939 GE began mass production of a dual temperature model, introducing refrigeration to the middle class
Canned Foods:

- Automatic preparation of fruits and vegetables become possible
- World Wars increased demand for canned food to feed troops
- Canned foods become more socially accepted

Branded Food:

- Started with the self service grocery store
- Rise of national brands as well as grocery store brands
- By 1933 there are major technological advancements in printing and packaging

Evolution of the Grocery Store:

- Prior to the turn of the century, general stores were prevalent
- Clarence Saunders opens the first Piggly Wiggly in 1916 in Memphis, Tennessee. The store was formatted in a maze of aisles leading to a checkout stand. Saunders patented this self-service system selling it across the nation
Prior to the turn of the century general stores were prevalent

A & P begins using the “Economy Store Format” in 1913. It becomes the basis for future layouts.

M.B. Skaggs opens first store in 1915 - by 1926 owns over 400

Throughout the 1920s chain grocers acquire other chains to form bigger corporations

The first convenience store opens in 1927

A & P introduces its own label products offering substantial discounts

Depression causes grocers to consolidate into fewer and larger stores

Stores are standardized and built from uniform model

In 1930 King Kullen opens its first store in N.Y. regarded as the first supermarket

Safeway introduces produce pricing by the pound and dating on perishables to ensure freshness

Parking lots appear in front of grocery stores. This model is not completely adopted until after WWII

Following industry trends, major grocery stores consolidate small stores into larger supermarkets

Dawning of the supermarket era with large chains such as Big Bear, King Kullen, and Ralph’s
The Golden Age of the Supermarket
1945 -1980

Jay Blackburn
Rebecca Gill
Jason Kasparek

The 1940s
Self service becomes the norm. Prepackaged foods become popular for efficiency. Stores begin to stock more than just food.

The 1950s
The growth and efficiency of grocery stores stemmed from the impressions left by the war effort on society. The mechanization of the industry improved store organization, distribution, and the overall quality of services provided. Convenience factors into all aspects of the grocery store. Directories are added to assist the wayward shopper.

The 1960s
The supermarkets of the 1960s differ little from earlier models. The decor and graphic style does, however, change during this decade.
This was a time of changing shopper demographics. Full time housewives grew rarer and time became precious.

The 1960s

The 1970s

Little change in the grocery industry. Aesthetically, supermarkets remodelled in a “modern” style taking advantage of bold, clean lines. Also, supermarkets made efforts to personalize their large spaces and make shoppers more comfortable. The redesigned butcher shop is an example of this effort.
Superstores Growth and Girth: Grocery Retailing 1980 - Present

The rise of the American Superstore in the nineties can be traced to two key factors (political and financial) during the eighties. Politically, the tendency of the Reagan administration to ignore antitrust legislation paved the way for large food retailers to engage in corporate buyouts.

- Albertson's of the Pacific Northwest acquires smaller northwest operations and Chicago's American Stores
- Safeway based in California acquires Von's (California) and Dominick's (Chicago)
- Yucaipa group takes Fred Meyer, Smitty's, Smith's, Ralph's, Food For Less, Quality Food Centers, and Hughes
- Royal Ahold of Holland sweeps up Pathmark, Stop n' Shop, Giant, Tops, Finast, Edward's, and Bi-Lo
- Kroger Co. swallows Fred Meyer (Yucaipa) Group

These stores are huge, Wal-Mart's supercenters range from 109,000 to 230,000 sq. ft. About 30 to 40 percent of the store contains grocery items, the rest of the store contains general retail items with many additional services normally found in several different and unique stores. Pharmacy, health food, clothing, video rental, delicatessen, butcher, seafood, film developing, dine-in cafe, eye care, bank, hair salon, and even a gas station can be found in one location.
Reactionary forces against sprawl and commercial overabundance have caused the next generation of responses from the superstore industry.

Realizing a smaller and more urban approach will be a requirement in the future. **Wal-Mart has already unleashed a new store model labeled the “Neighborhood Market.”** The neighborhood market ranges from a mere 42,000 to 55,000 s.f. and includes typical supermarket items and services.
By 2030, 60% of the U.S. will live in Metropolitan Areas

Demographic Projection:
White 52.7%
Hispanic 21.1%
African-American 15%
Asian 11.2%

The U.S. Population is getting older
1995: 33.5 million
2030: 69 million (75+)

Eating habits of people 50+

Healthy eating 79%
Read Food Lables 66%
Maintain a low-fat diet 50%
Balance healthy vs. unhealthy 43%
Try new food products 34%
Give up taste for health 15%

The average household spends less on food than they did a decade ago. In 1950 families spent 1/4 of household income on food. In 2000 families spent 1/8 of household income on food.

Jeanne Banyas, Mark Siwek, Matthew Stevenson

Trends: Demographic and Consumer Preferences
Food Retailing

TRENDS

Shopper Amenities
Offerings and Outlets
The Technology of Vending
N D S: Technology, Acquisition, and Delivery

Beckwith's rolling grocery store at Berea Projects

Groceries from your local Tesco

Choose your groceries online - fresh, convenient and delivered to your door! An easier
Another area of research investigated emerging prototypes of retail food stores in the U.S. and other countries to identify current trends and the potential for their application in the project area. Grocery store types in three different geographic areas were examined: Chicago, Atlanta, and Florida.
THE NETHERLANDS

TRANSPORTATION

= walking - tram

Urban Fabric

Bicycle

Location in Amsterdam’s

Transportation

Research

Typical Groceries and Markets

GROCERIES
Supermarkets: Kroger at University Plaza, Walnut Hills, Queen City, and Downtown Cincinnati

Comparison

- Number of Cashier Stations
- Number of Aisles

- Food Services
- Non-Food Services

- Varieties of Brand
- Varieties of Rye
Store Layout

Jeanne Banyas
Rebecca Gill
Mark Siwek
This research employed the census demographics and the responses to a grocery customer survey conducted by members of the Niehoff Studio in May of 2003.

This research employed a twofold approach in order to derive relationships. First, the demographic characteristics of gender and economics from the U.S. Censuses were spatially evaluated and a regression analysis was performed.

The purpose of this research was to discover a relationship between gender, poverty, and grocery shopping within the city of Cincinnati.

Gender, Poverty, and Groceries in Cincinnati, Ohio

Julia Schlutz, Adam Parrillo

Next, various response categories of the survey were isolated according to gender, and subsequently charted. Responses dealing with transportation were then tabulated by averages in order to determine any correlations between gender and transportation type.

Locations of Grocery Stores Surveyed

An overall relationship between the survey responses and perceived distance may be assumed (see below).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Survey Response - Perceived Distance</th>
<th>Female</th>
<th>Male</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Walk</td>
<td>4.73</td>
<td>4.61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bus</td>
<td>3.46</td>
<td>3.11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Drive</td>
<td>4.01</td>
<td>3.90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ride</td>
<td>3.33</td>
<td>3.50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cab</td>
<td>5.00</td>
<td>n/a</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bike</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>4.75</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

1: strongly disagree (very far)
2: disagree (far)
3: neutral (intermediate)
4: agree (close)
5: strongly agree (very close)
How did you get here?
According to the survey responses, there were only slight variations in type of travel utilized by customers to arrive at the store locations. The majority of both male and female respondents drove to the store location, while about twice as many male to female respondents walked to the store location. Further, a small percentage more of male respondents utilized public bus service.

A majority of male respondents indicated that they do the household grocery shopping; almost a third less than the 86% of female respondents who indicated themselves as the primary grocery shopper.

I do the grocery shopping for my household/family...

: a geographic perspective
There is a strong correlation between the percentage of female-headed households in census tracts and median household income. As the percentage of female-headed households in census tracts increases, median household income tends to decrease.

In the city of Cincinnati, are households headed by women geographically concentrated in different areas. On the west side, high concentrations occur in parts of Westwood, the Fay Apartments, South Cumminssville - Millvale, and North Fairmount - English Woods. In the north, a high concentration exists in Winton Hills. An axis of female-headed households extends north from the West and East Ends and Over-The-Rhine through Mt. Auburn, Walnut Hills, Avondale, Evanston towards Bond Hill.

Female Poverty Tracts are those with a median household income below the poverty level and a high percentage of households headed by women. As shown on the map, Female Poverty Tracts are located in the Fay Apartments, South Cumminssville – Millvale, North Fairmount – English Woods, Over-The-Rhine, Walnut Hills, Avondale, Evanston and Winton Hills.
Bringing Home the Bacon: Grocery Stores & Local Economic Vitality

How does the grocery store fit in the local economy?

Quality of life depends on many factors, including economic vitality. The importance of a grocery store is not solely derived from profit margins. Grocery stores support the local economy by providing necessities, employing local residents, and acting as an anchor in the neighborhood business district. This circular flow of money and resources into and out of the store contributes to the community’s well-being.

The flow of transactions between the grocery store and the local community (Left).

Do grocery stores provide local jobs?

The number of neighborhood residents hired at a grocery store reflects its integration into the local economy. That integration varies in relationship to a store’s size, accessibility, and level of regional sales draw (ICIC 2003, 7). A small sample of stores in the area suggests that income levels in the area increases with store size.

Sales and total payroll are correlated (Left).

Other economic benefits to the area

Grocery stores aid many groups through charitable donations. Managers grant donations to most groups requesting them from within their sales area. Donations range from $150 to $1,500 per month. While small in monetary value, such contributions maintain and enhance the store’s role as a business citizen in the community.

Do grocery stores sell local goods?

Store managers agreed that selling local goods is good for them and the regional economy. Buying from regional distributors benefits the city’s economy, but revenues may not flow directly into the store’s neighborhood business district (NBD). Only one store reported selling products made in the NBD. Another store allows local artisans to sell their wares on the premises.

Grocery stores are often the economic anchor of neighborhood business districts.
Cincinnati Food Equity Study:
Do the poor pay more?

Across the United States, the disparity between inner-city and suburban communities generates a number of social injustices. Which affect one of our most fundamental needs: access to daily food items. In recent decades, numerous supermarket chains and independent grocers have departed low-income, inner-city neighborhoods for a variety of reasons, including declining populations, civil unrest, higher business costs, and a desire for a more spacious and secure environment in middle and upper-income urban and suburban areas. Consequently, residents in the marginalized neighborhoods are now disadvantaged by the prices, quality, and quantity of groceries available to them.

The purpose of this study is to determine if, there is an equity issue regarding retail grocery stores in Cincinnati. For this analysis, we utilized a twofold methodological approach. Firstly, we compared food prices, quality, and selection of daily staple food items at supermarkets in the Corryville Study Area with those in more affluent neighborhoods outside of the study area (i.e. Hyde Park, West Chester, etc). Secondly, we analyzed demographic data in order to complete a profile for the neighborhoods in which the stores surveyed were located.

Findings show an average cost of 39 grocery staples in the inner city at $59.25 versus $57.57 in outlying areas. While prices between these areas of different socio-economic groups were comparable, quality and selection favor more affluent areas.
Research Goals
This research had two objectives. The first was to determine whether the population within the study area has adequate access to retail food outlets. The second was to determine if other groups with distinctive characteristics are less likely to have access to retail food outlets.

Background
This research was performed to identify the demographic characteristics of the population residing in these neighborhoods. Existing retail food outlets were examined to determine if this population was already adequately served.

The Geography of Retail Food Location

The perimeter boundary was determined by adopting pre-established neighborhood boundaries created by the City of Cincinnati. In order to compile the location of Retail Food Establishments (RFE), a list was obtained by the City of Cincinnati Health Department. The list of RFEs was divided into seven categories: supermarkets, grocery stores, drug stores, convenience stores, independent convenience stores, ethnic stores, and specialty stores. This data was then imported into Arcview 3.2, geocoded and overlayed with demographics from the 2000 United States Census Summary File 3. Data was obtained at the geographic block group (the smallest increment summary figures are given).

Methodology

Dina Abdulkarim, Milana Boz, Aaron Crary, Adam Parrillo, David Parish, Julia Shultz
Supermarkets are distributed evenly throughout the study area. On the other hand, the distribution of grocery stores and limited access RFEs is not nearly as uniform. Considering the demographic characteristics, there is a visual auto-correlation between areas of concentrated poverty and other demographic variables. In general, there appears to be a greater concentration of limited access food stores and grocery stores in areas of concentrated poverty. This is hypothesized to be the effect of both zoning regulations, which tend to be purely residential in higher income areas, and of market driven RFE location, which may be filling the food retail needs of persons with no access to a vehicle. The distribution of both supermarkets and grocery stores is sparse in these areas.

A Demographic Analysis

**Directions for Further Research**

- Examine public transportation within the study area
- Examine population density within the study area
- Conduct statistical analysis to determine the correlation of demographic factors with one another and with RFEs
- Conduct an equity analysis regarding access to RFEs within the study area
- Conduct on site inventories of RFEs to assess actual quality and variety of food

**Research Questions**

- Do people in the study area have adequate access to RFEs?
- Who (if anyone) is less likely to have access to RFEs?
- Is there a relationship between the location of RFEs and the demographic characteristics of a neighborhood?
The Social Role of Grocery Stores

According to Ray Oldenburg in his article entitled, The problem of Place in America, “there is virtually no place where neighbors can anticipate unplanned meetings.” However, our research project suggests that grocery stores have the potential to encourage social interactions. Of the six stores that we conducted observational studies and surveys in, some presented more potential for social interaction than others.

“A grocery store is not just a necessity, it is a quality of life issue” -John Schuler, Clifton Heights Business Association

“IGA is sociable, vans of seniors from a nearby center are bussed there frequently; the front vestibule is a popular waiting area and people are constantly running into acquaintances.” -John

“It is a good location for socializing; this area has a lot and it is right on many bus lines” -Mrs. Bowling, Walnut Hills Area Council

How do people socially interact in grocery stores?

Physical structure affects the nature of the relationships among individuals. Most grocery stores have specific places or “hot spots” that where most social interactions take place.

Are Stores community oriented?

• Only one had community newspaper circulation
• 3 out of 6 had bulletin boards
• All had seating, but nothing elaborate

Are Shoppers Interacting?

• Mostly during the busy times
• Interaction hot spots: produce, deli, checkout, entry
• People usually shop alone, with children, or spouse
• People usually seen speaking are: employees amongst themselves
The Social Role of Grocery Stores

Perhaps the design of a store can maximize the chances of face-to-face interactions, but measuring the width of the stores’ aisle, or observing the absence of overhead music does not sufficiently translate to other dimensions of a place such as its social life.

When ordinary people extract from an abstract space a bounded, identified, meaningful, named, and significant place, then a third dimension is added to a place such as a grocery store (de Certeau 1984, Etlin 1997).

"The longer people have lived in a place, the more rooted they feel, and the greater their attachment to it."

"Both the University Plaza Krogers and the IGA serve the neighborhood- Krogers because it is close and convenient and IGA because it has been in the community for a long time..."

- John Schuler, Clifton Heights Association

Places are made as people ascribe qualities to the material and social aspects of a space such as “safe” or “dangerous” or “ours” or “theirs”.

One of the goals of the survey we conducted in six different stores throughout the Cincinnati central city area was to find out how community residents viewed these qualities in relation to their neighborhood grocery store.

Interviewees were asked to rate statements from a scale 1 to 5 such as:

“I feel SAFE near the store”

“Generally, involvement in local public activities such as grocery shopping increases attachment to one’s neighborhood and fosters a community sentiment. In return, place attachment facilitates a sense of security and well-being” (Thomas Gieryn, A Space for Place in Sociology, 2000).

Location is a relational concept; it refers to social spaces that make connections between users and uses. A community grocery store or food market can be a place where broad variety of people are brought together with a sense of community for a common end, the task of acquiring food.
**Quality of Life Indicators**

**Methodology:** Quality of life indicators relating to the physical environment were selected and researched in depth for this project. A literature review established the criteria for which the physical aspects of a grocery store were to be judged. An observation analysis was performed by the team to assess each store. This analysis was compared with the results from a customer survey taken at each store.

**Natural Environment and Landscaping**

- Should be functional, provide screening and shade, direct traffic, block wind, soften glare, help define size of parking lot.
- Should utilize good plant composition, a mix of: trees, shrubs, flowers, and ground cover.
- Should utilize proper placement of plants.
- Should utilize proper design techniques: the union of three different shapes, scale and color, should be mass plantings.

**Sense of Security; Lighting and Cleanliness**

Research suggests that there are three indicators of potential risk and heightened fear for personal safety:

1) darkness 2) disorder, and 3) finding oneself alone in the presence of others who are perceived as threatening.

Unsafe Indicators: Bad or No Lighting, Litter, Graffiti Damaged/Dilapidated Property.

Adequate Lighting of an area:

1) Instills feelings of safety by eliminating shadows and blind spots.
2) Encourages pedestrian use of the area.
3) Deters crime because offenders prefer to remain unseen.

**Transportation and Parking**

Must consider safety and convenience:

- Merchandise loading entrances and passenger entrances.
- Should be easily accessible to vehicles.
- Parking should be clearly marked.
- Should have good flow of traffic.
- Should be made more aesthetically pleasing with landscaping and walkways.
- Should have large enough driveway opening.
- Should conceal trash pickup, service, storage and unattractive areas.
- Should have correct place of parking chalks, rounded curbs and cart corrals.
- Appropriate provision should be made for safety and convenience for handicapped persons - Paved surfaces should be non-slip type, with efficient drainage for storm water runoff.
Do Grocery Stores Support Social Interactions?

Social interactions happen in various places in our communities. The question investigated in research project was, ‘How a grocery store supports social interactions?’

### Methodology

Students visited 7 different grocery stores within the Cincinnati area and conducted one-on-one interviews with shoppers. A total of 287 interviews were collected. Topics surveyed included perceptions and feelings about Safety, Alienation, Sense of Belonging, and Interpersonal Observations.

### Safety

When a person feels safe, their social support network is enhanced. Our survey showed that people feel safe near the grocery stores. Having parking lots that are well-lit and having easy access into and out of the parking lot contribute to this overall feeling of safety.

### Sense of Belonging

Shoppers spend an average of 51 minutes shopping at the grocery stores we surveyed. 80% of shoppers made between 1 and 10 trips to the grocery store within the past 2 weeks. Also, 39% of shoppers say they know between 1 and 10 employees at the grocery store where they shop.

### Social Interaction

Grocery stores provide places for people to meet one another; 59% of shoppers mentioned that they run into friends at grocery stores. Shoppers also told us that they routinely talk to their neighbors in their communities.

### Interpersonal Observations

Grocery stores provide places where people find out about things happening in their neighborhoods. However, not all stores generate the same level of community knowledge for their shoppers (see Figure 1).

Social interactions are supported at grocery stores. Grocery stores are places where people routinely spend significant amounts of time each week. These are places where people meet each other, develop relationships with employees and find out about things happening in neighborhoods.
This study investigates the connection between social and physical capital by examining the social significance of urban grocery stores in different socio-economic and ethnic settings. Variables in this study include shopping behaviors, social perceptions, and beliefs of customers regarding the formation, maintenance, and loss of their neighborhood grocery store.

Grocery Stores and Social Capital
A STUDY OF SEVEN CINCINNATI NEIGHBORHOODS

Meghan Estabrook, Yoshinobu Sakano, Shawn Patrick Tubb, Daniel Varela, Roderick Williams

For people that have visited the old cities of Europe the experience is exciting and memorable. In many instances the most enthralling part of the visit is the experience in the plazas and areas of social interactions. In other countries the street markets are bustling with activity and are full of a life that is not explicitly directed at the activity of shopping. So what is the relationship between the physical environment and levels of social interaction that exist in some places and not others? In order to understand this, these two ideas must be defined and juxtaposed. There are two ways that community is formed. The first is the community of place, which defines relationships that are based on people's proximity to one another. The second classification is the community of interest which involves relations that are developed through common interest such as a religious activities or social organizations.

For the sake of our argument, we will look at social capital from the perspective of community of place. Elinor Ostrom defines social capital as the shared knowledge, understandings, institutions, and patterns of interactions that group of individuals brings to any activity (1997, 158). This definition deals with the idea of investment of all involved individuals into the community, assuming that a consensus has been developed in a particular neighborhood.

Physical capital is defined as the stock of material resources that can used to produce a flow of future income (Ostrom 1997). Physical capital is about opening up and constraining the possibilities of events. Paving a roadway so that individuals can more easily travel from one city to another would be an example of opening up possibilities, where damming up a river so that the water can’t flow its normal course would restrict the possibilities of the river. Physical capital is important to a community because it is immobile and not moved because of its costliness. Things like water line and road ways are repaired and buildings sometimes demolished, but they remain in the same context for a long time, thus making them very important to the development of communities (Green 2002).
The validity of this study was determined following a review of literature pertaining to social and physical capital and social and physical determinism.

To ensure both general and in-depth investigation, both a survey opinion questionnaire and in-depth interviews were used. The role of a grocery store in inducing social interaction and in some cases, reactions to the loss of a neighborhood grocery store were sought out.

The variegated dataset provided the opportunity to analyze both quantitative (survey) and qualitative (interview) data. Using triangulation (quantitative, qualitative, and field observation) enhanced the reliability of the study.

Conclusions

Overall, it is clear that the importance of a grocery store in facilitating the formation of physical capital varies in differing socio-economic situations. For example, in neighborhoods where there are other community assets (physical capital), the grocery store plays a subordinate role in forming social capital, while in neighborhoods with little physical capital in the form of community assets, the grocery store plays a more important role.

There was a moderate correlation between convenience and enjoyment of shopping at the grocery store.

The closer the store is located to a customer’s residence, the more likely it is that customers enjoy the store.

Preference is formed based on trust - Corryville plays an important role in developing social capital and community trust.

The length of time a person has shopped at the grocery store may influence the customer’s familiarity with employees. There appears to be no relationship between the length of time shopping at the store and the likelihood of finding out happenings in the neighborhood.

Overall, the University Plaza Kroger provides a place for people to meet and establish social networks but it is not a place that facilitates community involvement.
convenience - modularity - redundancy - flow and interaction - parking - checkouts - safety - entrance and exits - shopping carts - thoughtful integration of other models

Design Strategy
innovation; eliminate redundancy; system driven from tailored to my preferences

Sustainable Architecture
- wind farm along roadway to supply
- renewable energy
- grass roof
- natural, ambient light
- guest comfort
- employee productivity
- lower operation costs
- architecture as pedagogy

Field Research Themes
personal service; product display; space; atmosphere; sense of place; history

Roadway Interface
- convenient to shop on the way home from work, etc.
- “commerce takes place at the intersections” - Gil Born
- Conserves land if constructed over existing roadway
- smaller footprint
- advertising presence via unique proximity and orientation to roadway

Gamal Prather
Green Supermarket

Store Layout
Five levels containing shopping bays, four aisles per level
one service level, office space at either end of building

Shopping Bays
unique employee-guest product vehicle interaction;
convenient, personalized shopping experience;
materials contribute to atmosphere;
reduce unsolicited interaction;
guest does some of the work;

bagging own groceries;
self-checkout with RFID technology
**Techno Supermarket**

*Imagine a store where...*

The experience of shopping is much more fluid and organic than rigid and geometric.

The customer is educated by specialists and has the ability to try everything before buying anything.

A shopping cart is almost never necessary, and all of your purchases are loaded into your car for you.

*Educated customers...*

All items intended for purchase would be scanned into this device which keeps a running total of all items and their costs online with the store's inventory and pricing.

*Organic traffic patterns...*

The experience of shopping becomes less restrictive.

The store more easily caters to different types of consumers.

More social interaction can occur among consumers while shopping.
Pinball’s Supermarket

Brett Chiste

**Designed for three distinct customers:**

- *Mr. See-it-all*: He/She is usually a family, or someone just shopping for fun; He/She looks at everything and wants to be entertained and enjoy the shopping trip.

- *Mr. Speedy*: He/She wants to get in and out quickly, looks for a few standard items, favors convenience and no frills; he/she is contained in a cloud of stress.

- *Mr. Relaxo*: He/She likes dining in the restaurant, a typical cooking school student, a tired shopper, or someone just looking to hang out......
Pinball’s Supermarket

ground level

main elevation

perspective exterior

lower level

perspective exterior

perspective exterior
Old World Supermarket

Kristin Dormeister

goals:
Enlightened consumer
Humanizing experience
Leisure Experience
Inspiring Experience

market contains three levels: lower level (service and stock), ground level (promenade, cafe, shop, and atrium), mezzanine level (offices and restrooms)

values respect for: [life, freedom, time, space, community]

parking a hexagon shape center for building, contains full kitchen, extra counters, and lounge chairs, used for demonstrations and relaxation lounge, open ceiling and doors to supermarket, approximately 5000 s.f.

european inspiration a promenade outside the Vatican served as inspiration for the desired experience on my market...

features promenade, cafes, checkouts, atrium, parking, servicing

redesign and upgrade the shopping experience in the supermarket. Concept based on European shopping experience and appreciation for time...
Community Supermarket

Hans Schellhas

The Grocery Store as a Community Experience

- Integral and meaningful part of the community
- Pulse of community activity
- Advocate of healthful community needs
- Celebration of food, health, and service

**Features Include:**
- Outside cafe
- Weekend market
- Visibility of community area
- Shopping cart escalator

**Location:** Metropolitan or active suburban area

**The exterior: an invitation**

**Interior**
The Kroger ‘Block Market’- Adaptive Reuse of Urban Structures

Objectives

• Maintain the Existing Architectural Character of the Neighborhood
• Bridge the Gap between the CBD and Adjacent Urban Neighborhoods
• Connect Market with Urban Public/Park Spaces and Cultural Centers
• Create a Stimulus to Further Development of Adjacent neighborhood
• Improve the Provision of Low-Cost Groceries, Selection, and Service
• Provide a Flagship Store for the Kroger Corporation
• Create a Laboratory for Food Marketing

The Kroger ‘Block Market’ would combine the historic structures of an entire block to create a unique shopping experience. An interior courtyard would be the centerpiece of the block market.

The buildings of the ‘Block Market’ will each house a different food department. The building interiors will be connected for convenient access between departments.

The alternate side of the ‘Block Market’ will house non-grocery departments and ready to eat food shops.
The front elevation with decorative brick arches invites pedestrians to explore the space. The section of the building on the left shows how circulation between buildings and floors would be accomplished.

The facades of the buildings in the interior courtyard area would be transformed into ‘front-door’ areas. Food can be bought by patrons and then enjoyed at a table in the courtyard.

The rear area of the market would provide vehicular access for patrons to load their parcels or drop off passengers.

This aerial perspective shows the enclosed connection located at the rear of the courtyard. This feature joins buildings on both sides of the block and allows easy access from the vehicular access area.

The interior would be draped with warm inviting colors and the shelving units would be decorative and styled after the architectural details of the building. The first and second floors of some buildings could be combined to create more vertical space.

Maintains the Existing Architectural Character of the Neighborhood

vehicular access area
Reworking Retailing

Experiencing Downtown

Food Retailing

Food retailing plays a pivotal role as an attractor of people and in the creation of social indentifiers within cities. The design sought to weave these attributes into a downtown setting of empty lots and semi-used buildings.

Structured around the creation of multi-use and easily reconfigurable public spaces, the design provides a multiplicity of experiences through diverse retailing ambiences ranging from the ‘big box’ to the specialist retailer. The customer experience is enhanced by providing varied options of usage of spaces, visual and social connections with the built environment and creating a urban model that has a positive impact for the downtown by enlivening and widening its appeal.
The Concept of Sensory Retailing

An attempt to create an atmosphere that has a positive subconscious effect on the consumer

**Sense of Place**

Scale, Communication, Function and Visibility

“Commerce is a by-product of community life. The food market has a special role in the business of urban life.”

**Composition**

Color, Textures, Smell, Touch, Visual Variety

**Grocery Experience**

Sensory Perception, Signage, Interaction and Lighting

**Urban Marketplace**

Activity, Community Center, Human-scale, Organic Forms

Practical Implications

- Generate activity at street level
- Modular system to create the building envelope for speed & convenience of construction and for constant re-invention options & expansion
- Define Image and Identity: Form, Material, Storefront, Facades, Entrance, Signage
- Consumer experience: circulation patterns to generate meandering and interesting routes to aid the retail experience
- Multi-ethnic specialty stores, recreation, restaurants, cafes and other community-based institutions to address the various uses & needs in a grocery environment

**Research**

Case studies of trend-setting businesses revealed a need for richness of visual texture, information exchange, sensory perception and the concept of ‘community.’ Disturbing trends were identified as the ‘big box’ approach, sterile/isolated environments and utilitarian spaces.

Utilizing natural light, open spaces and visual linkages for free flow of movement and transparency

Concept of modular design and interactive spaces - referencing historical models of the marketplace
Prototype Design: a Guide to Designing the Urban Grocery

**Building Density**
- **Small Site (20,000 s.f.)**: Building range from 3-5 stories, majority of the buildings are between 5-15 stores, 40-50% of land used, midrise construction. Site should occupy corner to maximize stability and accessibility; should make use of alley for service.
- **Medium Site (40,000 s.f.)**: Availability: high. Columbus: 40,000 s.f. Site should not cross alley; building should extend to street limit for visibility; larger site allows for parking surface.
- **Large Site (80,000 s.f.)**: Availability: medium. Columbus: 80,000 s.f. Several blocks are currently devoid of buildings; allow for extensive parking and visibility of building.

**Building Sizes**
- **Small Site (20,000 s.f.)**: Mostly efficient for tight context; Only a limited selection can be fit into this small a building.
- **Medium Site (40,000 s.f.)**: Low midsize facility; Improved selection with fewer specialty items; best for localized neighborhoods; should not support large areas alone.
- **Large Site (80,000 s.f.)**: Regional draw; requires large catchment to support large variety in specialties; ideal for suburban areas where cars are dominant.

**Vertical Circulation**
- **Elevator**: 90 sf elevator - 720 people/hr move up; 3 x 5’ per person; 2 min up and down; (+) Takes up less space than most flexible placement; (-) May not move people effectively enough/also needs elevator, etc.
  - Pater Noster (German for “Holy Father”): Cars move continuously along route; passengers get on as it passes; (+) Fluid movement between floors; (-) May not move people effectively enough also needs elevator, etc.
  - Platform Lift: Ramp up-elapsed time not available @ 1:24 slope; (+) Flexible placement, can be used as a buffer between outside and the floor; (-) Uses extensive floor space, and a long distance to travel.
  - Box Lift: Building is split into 2 levels to facilitate movement and interaction; Lift moves up half a floor, patron ends up passing through the space.

**Supermarkets**

---

**Chris Kannel**
This program revolves around an idea of integrating a suburban-type grocery store, or hypermarket, into a confined urban site. Unlike the grocery store of suburbia, the urban grocery store accounts for many issues of context that lack meaning beyond city limits. Listing these urban forces and analyzing them allows one to create a program that is both responsive and responsible in dealing with urban dynamics. Through this program, one can state the forces acting on the design, and synthesize those forces to produce a tangible, realistic model and approach to the problem.

The resulting solution is responsive to the forces of the urban dynamic, and should act as a topical road map that guides the design process.
**Design Goals**

Design a supermarket prototype that can be accommodated on a small urban block and relate well to the existing urban context.

Disassemble the elements of a conventional grocery store, design

**Role**

The urban grocery should be a focal point of the community.

**Project Mission**

The mission of the Urban Grocery Store is to provide for our patrons using high-design. This could be accomplished by investigating new typologies of grocery store design, or to reconfigure the existing layout. A new prototype would re-invent the concept of grocery shopping and make grocery shopping as pleasurable as retail shopping.

**Ideal Program**

A percentage program, which is based on the Kroger Corporations current plans, can be universally applied to any sites. The percentage program designates an area of importance based on customer activity. The resulting program is unique, because it identifies and solves the issues of urbanity.

The developed program is a typological program, which can be applied to many sites so long as it remains in the urban context. To achieve this program, many factors were considered: mission and goals of the client, urban context/fabric, user/occupant group, and spatial configurations.

**Formula for Design**

+ integrate urban issues
- depart from existing model
/ separate into departments
* reconfigure model
= a building typology that can be placed among any cities

Throughout the program, many issues are examined in accordance with functional, visual, and experiential requirements. The compilation and synergy of these three elements results in the qualitative space.
Implementing a 60,000 square foot grocery store, of a conventional type, within an urban context is not achievable because it requires too large a site to accommodate parking and does not relate well to its context.

Our approach to prototyping the urban grocery store began by dissassembling the elements of a grocery store: store departments, circulation elements, and exterior attributes. After designing each individual element in its ideal condition, we then reassembled the elements using several constants for design: similar progression through every store configuration, prominence of the atrium as a circulation and organizing element, and utilization of parking structures rather than surface parking.

We applied these principles to two sites, testing entry at the corner and in the center of the site; these permutations addressed numerous variables simultaneously while retaining some similarities and unifying principles.

**Site Application**
Currently, many view grocery shopping as a chore, and the goal of the design is to make the store an experience. By studying the precedents and creating a responsive program, a unique design could be compiled from the lessons learned in the investigative process. The over riding goal of the study is to design a model that better suits the needs of the metropolitan resident.
Charrette #1 Prototype Exterior
The design and illustration of a “ideal” urban market prototype based on independent study and documentation of the sponsor’s existing stores/retail system structure and other relevant prototype “urban market” supermarket model formats. Three dimensional modeling of diverse grocery store and mixed retail development scenarios for the University Plaza site in Corryville: Uptown Cincinnati.
Charrette #2
Prototype Interior

Based on independent study and documentation of the Sponsor’s existing stores/retail system structure. Other relevant prototype “urban” supermarkets model formats were created to design and illustrate the “ideal” urban market prototype.
This project attempts to create a pedestrian oriented mixed-use “town center” for the uptown community that is anchored by a Kroger supermarket. It will consist of a 60,000 square foot two-story Kroger with complementary retail uses on the existing University Plaza site.

Design Statement
This proposal attempts to integrate a suburban size supermarket into the urban setting of Corryville. Kroger and the act of grocery shopping take on symbolic significance through location by serving as terminus of Short Vine Street.

This Kroger consists of two pieces split by a linear element. The west section contains most of Kroger’s products while the east section is a festive market hall filled with produce and seasonal promotions. The lower floor of this section is a flexible public/civic space which could be used for many things: flea market, art gallery, community gatherings etc.

The linear element serves as a pathway, connecting University Plaza with Taft Street. This element brings passersby through Kroger rather than around it, enticing them to stop by and pick up some food on the way. At the Taft entrance is a Kroger café, service by the store’s deli/bakery personnel that would attract lunchtime workers from the professional offices nearby.
Integrate a large footprint supermarket building and complementary retail uses into the dense urban context of Corryville.

Provide a strong framework of public space that relates to Short Vine and the university campus.

Incorporate a mix of uses that complement each other and create a vital 24 hour activity center.

**Design Goals**

Accommodate a large number of parking spaces in a variety of innovative arrangements that are designed to minimize negative aesthetic impact.

Provide a compact two story design for an urban supermarket that reinterprets the program of a conventional supermarket to offer unique experiences for the customer.
Civic Space and the Urban Supermarket

Rebecca Gill

Design Principles:
The experience that the consumer has within this grocery space is noticeably different from those of a standard grocery store because they have the opportunity to be immersed in the visual reality of a grocery store as opposed to the monotony of going up and down similar looking aisles.

Program:
This project attempts to create a pedestrian oriented mixed-use “town center” for the uptown community that is anchored by a Kroger supermarket. The 60,000 square foot two-story store has complementary retail uses on the existing University Plaza site.

Design Statement:
This Kroger is a two-story building that takes advantage of the topography of the site by integrating underground parking. The building uses brick, concrete, and glass to create a palette that communicates to the surrounding neighborhood. The brick and concrete are a continuation of the architectural language already utilized on Vine St.

The large spans of glass that are continued in the axis express the individuality of this building and sets it off from the other buildings in the surrounding area.
Goals

Integrating a large footprint supermarket building and complimentary retail uses into the dense urban context of Corryville

Providing a strong framework of public space that relates to Short Vine and the university campus

Incorporate a mix of uses that complement each other and create a vital 24 hour activity center.

Sections

Accommodate a large number of parking spaces in a variety of innovative arrangements that are designed to minimize negative aesthetic impact.

Provide a compact two story design for an urban supermarket that reinterprets the program of a conventional supermarket to offer unique experiences for the customer.
**Experience Kroger**

Sarah Lauffer, Sarah Fortkamp

---

**Design Concept**

- **Use Vine Street Axis to Advantage**
- **Historically and socially influence use to visually connect taft street to Short vine Street**
- **Create a site that caters to both pedestrian and automobile**
- **Diminish the super block**
- **Allow access to store from different levels**
- **Provide street front activity**
- **Allow for easy pick-up and delivery**

**Proposed Pedestrian and Vehicular Flow**

**Proposed**

---

**Existing**

---

**Program**

60,000 square foot two-story Kroger with complementary retail uses on the existing University Plaza site.

---

**Language of new site drawn from surrounding neighborhood context and fabric**

**Continue scale of surrounding fabric onto the site, character of facade at human scale**

**Pedestrian friendly parking zone: designate and establish path, which improves pedestrian safety**
Above a continuous, commercially used ground floor, the terrace house combines interchangeable sizes of flats around a central terrace. Between two or six flats thus forming a social and economic unit.
Create a valuable wayfinding system derived from the five senses. To see, touch, taste, smell, and hear: allow shoppers to locate product items.

Continue exterior axis through interior. Glass, light, materiality, circulation.

Maximize natural light. Use shading and translucent materials to take advantage of sunlight in atrium space.

Create an interior where products are showcased. Display areas, millwork and cases, create a backdrop for products and merchandise that are being stored and displayed.

Allow Kroger to have an adaptable interior. According to management, Kroger alters interior plan every two years. With design, altering floor plans and displays are made easier on Kroger and customers.

**Interior Design Principles**

- Produce Elevation
- Perspective within produce area
This project attempts to create a pedestrian oriented mixed-use “town center” for the uptown community that is anchored by a Kroger supermarket.
**Design Principles**

Create a two-story mixed use development that utilizes existing topography to respond to different access and use requirements for Short Vine and Taft Road.

Illustrate potential innovations for conventional large footprint commercial structures through the use of “Green” building technology.

- Accomodate conventional large footprint single story supermarket within an innovative site design and mixed-use development.

- Enhance the experiential quality of the conventional parking “field” with unique landscape amenities and protected pedestrian pathways.

- Provide a site design strategy that capitalized on potential pedestrian networks, visual connections, and functional access to the surrounding urban content.
Future Kroger

Project #1:
Adam J. Green

Design Statement

The departments, including dairy, produce, and pharmacy, as well as others, are represented by concrete “pods” attached to the north façade of the structure. Dry-good aisles, represented by orthogonal “blocks,” form the south façade. After several variations, their final composition had several intentions. The block arrangement, each shifted slightly from the next, was meant to deflect fast moving traffic from Taft Road around the building site while providing an undeniable visible presence along the road. Each block contains a single two-story window, allowing ever-changing views of the city as shoppers’ progress through the store. While their arrangement creates a sense of deflection on the north façade, it allows containment on the south. This sense of containment enhances the effect of the protruding pods, which are arranged to relate more closely to the surrounding communities of Corryville and the university.

Program

80,000 s.f. Supermarket and complementary uses on an existing University Plaza superblock.

Design Goals

- Reinterpret the traditional one story supermarket building type.
- Accommodate the supermarket in a multi-story sculpture in the site as the terminus of short Vine Street and as the gateway to the University campus.
- Develop the University Plaza super-block in a unique landscaped setting and allow complementary development of housing and other retail uses.
Upon studying the interior of existing Kroger grocery stores, particular characteristics emerged with relation to the functional layout. The departments, located around the perimeter of the “box,” had an inherent desire to be self-contained. The interior focus, strained each space to be completely independent from their adjacent spaces. Contrasting this, the monotonous rows of dry-goods, centrally located in plan, lacked the spatial experience of the more specialized departments. The conceptual idea showcased departments, including dairy, produce, and pharmacy, as well as others, by concrete “pods” attached to the north façade of the structure. Dry-good aisles, represented by orthogonal “blocks,” form the south façade to complete the sculptural architectural idea.
Site Analysis:

Site analysis included the development of site selection criteria,

The contextual analysis investigated the physical and socioeconomic characteristics and dynamics of “University Heights” and adjacent areas, and the identification of key relationships and issues within this location, (i.e. access and or typologies of existing food stores).
Through a process of analysis and elimination this study helps to pinpoint site selections for potential grocery store locations throughout the uptown area.
University Plaza
Urban Design Proposal

Jerid Bartow, Ian Thomas, Jason Wright

Program:
60,000 s.f. supermarket with other small and large footprint commercial and entertainment uses with upper story housing configured in a multi-block development.

Design Principles

• Create Pedestrian/vehicular, Visual, Social, And Cultural Connections Through the Existing University Plaza Superblock And Surrounding Areas

• Extend and Blend With Existing Urban Context

• Create A Mixed Use Environment To Foster Interaction and Synergy

• Use A Step Down Land Use Intensity Model

• Create an affordable retail and housing development that is inclusive of all income levels and socio-cultural groups

Site Plan

View from BP Gas Station on Corry St.
Integrate non-privatized public gathering space

Urban Design Analysis

**Provide multi-block development pattern that breaks-up the existing University Plaza superbloc**

Create a gateway for uptown

**Fourth Level**
- Residential, Deck parking

**Third Level**
- Residential, Deck parking

**Second Level**
- Residential, Deck parking

**Base Level**
- Entrance, Parking, Kroger Store

**Lower Level**
- Kroger Store, Specialties Stores, Bank, Office

**Mixed-Use**

**Exploded View**

- Kroger Entrance
- Parking
- Kroger Mass

**Urban Design Analysis**

**Scheme 1**
- **Pros:**
  - Good width of the blocks
  - There is a direct connection to Short Vine
  - Triangle terminates at Vine St
- **Cons:**
  - The Jefferson tunnel/triangle
  - Five point intersection at Corry and Vine
  - Intersections are too close

**Scheme 2**
- **Pros:**
  - Simple
  - Intuitive traffic flow
  - Distribution of traffic into square quarters
  - Green spaces placed where it helps
- **Cons:**
  - No terminus

**Scheme 3**
- **Pros:**
  - There are more direct connections to Jefferson
- **Cons:**
  - Harsh angle at Jefferson triangle

**Scheme 4**
- **Cons:**
  - The tunnel poses a problem
  - Bad intersection with Taft and Vine St

**Scheme 5**
- **Pros:**
  - Good circulation
  - Direct routes
- **Cons:**
  - Difficult blocks to build on
Uptown Central

A Bold New Vision

The University Plaza redevelopment will incorporate unique residential alternatives, culturally diverse “destination” retail markets, convenient urban office space, as well as a full service Kroger super-market. The retail and commercial establishments on short Vine and the surrounding neighborhoods will be seamlessly integrated into the mixed-use development.

University Plaza together with the short Vine business district are the heart of the Corryville neighborhood. The plaza site is strategically located in the uptown area but its importance and character have been steadily declining during the last ten years. The proposed re-development directs new vitality to five reconfigured urban blocks to establish the Uptown Central hub and link it with Corryville, the Calhoun Street redevelopment, the UC campus developments, and Mt. Auburn.

- Corryville possesses a mix of urban land-uses, including residential, commercial, retail, institutional, and recreational.
- University Plaza is hub of local activity.
- Many students and employees of the University of Cincinnati live and work in Corryville.
- A variety of multi-family and single family detached housing exist.
- Many places for dining and entertainment.
- Significant institutions exist: the University of Cincinnati, public library, a post office, an elementary schools, the Environmental Protection Agency, as well as a police station and a fire department.
The urban design plan for Corryville promotes ease of accessibility for motorists and non-motorists by creating four quadrants of residential, office, commercial and retail possibilities. A “festival-friendly” space will bisect the development and create much needed pedestrian access between short Vine and Vine Street and will extend to the existing park south of McMillan. By incorporating several underground parking facilities into the design, expansive surface lots will be reduced, providing more development area for new shops and businesses.

The bold new Corryville vision for redevelopment will help to renew the vitality of the community by creating a destination location where patrons can have a truly unique experience.

Dynamic public-private partnerships are essential in creating a positive atmosphere for all key players and future investors. By making use of public incentives, already in place, such as the Corryville Empowerment Zone, and by leveraging the redevelopment experience of university sponsored community non-profit organization encourages these partnerships.

The city should have the key leadership in control the acquisition of land and the relocation of the people. It should be made clear that we wish for the current viable businesses to return and that the issue should be considered and reviewed in the redevelopment plan.

**Proposed Development**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Phase II (2006-2009)</td>
<td>Build Hotel on Block E. Control and clearance of the land. Street realignment of Jefferson with Vine Street</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Phase III (2008-2012)</td>
<td>Construction of Blocks C and D Control and clearance of the land Extension of Vine Street to McMillan Redevelopment will be according to the plan.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The primary objective behind these designs is to develop the MLK site into a destination point. The site sits on the corner of MLK Ave. and Reading Rd. which serve as 2 main arteries connecting the site to the large Uptown university, employment, and residential base. The potential development of I-71 on-ramps onto MLK, adjacent to the site, portends a larger market of I-71 travelers.

**Program:**

80,000 s.f. Kroger, an entertainment complex with an arcade and night club, 40 residential units, structured parking, and complementary retail and restaurant uses.

**Design Statement**

The primary objective behind these designs is to develop the MLK site into a destination point. The site sits on the corner of MLK Ave. and Reading Rd. which serve as 2 main arteries connecting the site to the large Uptown university, employment, and residential base. The potential development of I-71 on-ramps onto MLK, adjacent to the site, portends a larger market of I-71 travelers.

The secondary objective is to create an anchor for adjacent residents and workers. The objective was approached by designing a pedestrian oriented town-center where none had existed before. Also, the site’s immediate proximity to a large worker and residential base draws attention to the need for mixed land uses that appeal to that base.

To create a pedestrian friendly, socially inviting environment, large open plazas are incorporated into the design with ample seating and wide sidewalks and a promenade. This is made possible by two decked parking lots, one below ground and one above, on the site. Other land uses include mixed use developments such as restaurants, retail, and housing.
Visibility from and circulation through MLK and Reading were also key factors in the final design. With the site so large, the first design goal was to find the best on-site location and position for a potential 100,000 sq. ft. Kroger. First a model that was consistent with standard Kroger model dimensions was worked with, the size and form of the building was changed in response to the interplay of Kroger and the other land uses of the remaining site.

Two important elements that guided the programming of the site were the utilization of mixed land uses that could serve local and regional needs, and the need for safe open plazas and walkways that were inviting to pedestrians. Having land uses that operated at different times of the day was also an important factor in the placement of those used and in the functionality and safety of the plazas and walkways. Programming was also tweaked in respect to optimal circulation and visibility.

These projects attempt to create a pedestrian oriented mixed-use “town center” for the uptown community that is anchored by a Kroger supermarket. Visibility from and circulation through MLK and Reading were also key factors in the final design. With the site so large, the first design goal was to find the best on-site location and position for a potential 100,000 sq. ft. Kroger. First a model that was consistent with standard Kroger model dimensions was worked with, the size and form of the building was changed in response to the interplay of Kroger and the other land uses of the remaining site.

Design Goals

Exploit site adjacency to two major roads, and to a future highway interchange

Create a mixed-use regional destination for the Uptown region and beyond.

Create a neighborhood retail and entertainment anchor that meets the needs of adjacent residents and the large number of uptown workers including a major supermarket use.

Create a pedestrian friendly environment that supports 24 hour retail and entertainment uses.

These projects attempt to create a pedestrian oriented mixed-use “town center” for the uptown community that is anchored by a Kroger supermarket. Visibility from and circulation through MLK and Reading were also key factors in the final design. With the site so large, the first design goal was to find the best on-site location and position for a potential 100,000 sq. ft. Kroger. First a model that was consistent with standard Kroger model dimensions was worked with, the size and form of the building was changed in response to the interplay of Kroger and the other land uses of the remaining site.

Two important elements that guided the programming of the site were the utilization of mixed land uses that could serve local and regional needs, and the need for safe open plazas and walkways that were inviting to pedestrians. Having land uses that operated at different times of the day was also an important factor in the placement of those used and in the functionality and safety of the plazas and walkways. Programming was also tweaked in respect to optimal circulation and visibility.
As a result of an extensive survey of Uptown, the site at the corner of Martin Luther King Dr. (MLK) and Reading Road was chosen as the optimal location for a large footprint Kroger supermarket in the Uptown area. The site is one mile from UC and is surrounded by a dense residential, worker, and student population. Also, the City of Cincinnati is considering a proposal for I-71 on-ramps onto MLK and a light rail station at this node. The potential development of these key transportation links makes this site attractive for a mixed-use development.

These important corridors into and through Uptown merge at the MLK site. A wide variety of land uses, including medical institutions, are within a 5 minute walk (1000 feet) of the MLK site; which provides the site with the excellent potential for pedestrian usage.

**Suggested Study Area Uses:**

A - Residential.
B - Commercial.
C - Mixed Use (Residential, Office, Commercial).
D - Mixed Use (Retail, Residential).
E - Commercial.

**Design Objectives**

The site at MLK and Reading is designed to be a destination point for the Uptown region and beyond. Kroger asked for a 100,000 sq. ft. superstore and this 12 acre site meets Kroger’s criteria. Optimal circulation via MLK and Reading, close proximity to UC and medical institutions, a proposed rail station at this intersection and a potential interchange all make this site highly attractive for a mixed-use development featuring a Kroger superstore.
2 Urban Design & Programming

Food As Focus

This design endeavors to create a sense of place or an anchor for adjacent residents and workers. Open plazas surrounded by dense retail, with a focus on food provides a pedestrian friendly town center.

First, identify the criteria for choosing a Lead Development Entity (LDE). The LDE should have prior success with infill and mixed-use development and an orientation of “town center” components and community-building sensibility. Steiner & Associates (Newport On The Levee, Easton Town Center in Columbus) is an example of a company that meets this criteria.

Next, utilize financing methods that will promote growth and sustainability for the site and its periphery and encourage businesses at all levels.

A Place To Meet

Implementation

A housing developer would be hired to create and manage the market-rate living units. Based on current projects in the Uptown area e.g. (JFP Properties Ltd. or the University of Cincinnati). Suggested financing via the City of Cincinnati Housing Round has been successfully utilized in similar market rate housing projects around the city. HUD 108 loans might also be utilized as moderate income housing is a criterion for such a loan.

The development of restaurant and boutique enterprises along Reading Rd. and the site’s plazas can be fostered by a Linked Deposit Loan Program (LDL). An LDL offers qualifying applicants a loan rate that is 2-3 points lower than market rates. This type of loan is ideal for small businesses, especially women and minorities. As a key player in the redevelopment of the site Kroger would have the option to either buy or lease the space from the LDE.
The vegetation of the terraces and the roof garden atop Kroger would be visible from the interstate as well. Also visible would be the fitness center and its western glass façade displaying the members exercising. The building would showcase to all of Cincinnati its uses and human meanings. It would be a center and message for life and living in an otherwise dull and sterile urban environment.
The site is a rather desolate office park-like pocket along I-71. There is very little pedestrian activity and sense of community. The workers of the immediate area park their cars, go to their offices then leave at 5 PM. By 6:30 PM each day, the surroundings are vacant.

The design includes a 90,000 square foot 2 level Kroger, a two story fitness center, four levels of office with gardened roof terraces, 3 street-level storefronts, underground and garaged parking to accommodate all the uses and compensate for the parking that is to be built over all in one megastructure. On the periphery a small pocket park was designed to provide a place for the daily workers as well as those using the storefronts along with a streetscape scheme that would visually lead drivers on Gilbert Avenue and Reading Road to Eden Park Drive and our Kroger structure.

The visibility from Interstate 71 was the biggest strength of the site and the design. The site was located in a pivotal location between downtown and the numerous residential neighborhoods to the northeast. The pedestrian and human realm of the building is faced to Eden Park Drive. However, visually the structure is oriented to Interstate 71. The Kroger and other uses would communicate to the driver that the daily transition from work to domestic life had begun. From I-71 north, the Kroger and its panels of iconography displaying recognizable national and regional logos as well as images of food and drink would be eye level to the driver and communicate and remind people of the meaning of the store.
These were the four categories the studio began analyzing within the context of food vending. Students were given various readings from different authors and then wrote a paper choosing one of these themes. The students soon found out that food vending alongside these four issues is not a widespread topic with literature to back it up. Although the lack of information available seemed to be a problem on the surface, it helped ignite creativity in finding other ways to find a solution.
Public space, food and the (in)formal economy

The rituals and the design of a place suggest to users a certain level of intimacy or perceived distance.

- Steven Alber, MArch

Public Characters

A practice that effectively links food, the poor, small-scale economy and the rest of society is the urban food trade.

Street Vendors are small businesses that should have the choice to support regional agriculture.
The United States
Generally, open spaces in the United States are often overly large making them feel intimidating and desolate.

This is because spaces are generally designed around the automobile, not the pedestrian, making the areas uninviting and uncomfortable.

The separation of residence and work has contributed to the flight of people from urban areas by relocating people to large, sterile, and unwelcoming office parks where there is limited interaction outside the office suite.

Are our city streets comfortable? Are they exciting or memorable? Does the street offer something new? Is anyone not allowed on these streets?

It takes much more than pavers and lighting to make a pedestrian area lively and invigorating.

Street vendors could be used to break up the large bland spaces, creating a more dynamic hierarchy of space.
European Planning and Architecture have long been precedents for the good Urban Design Community. These typically incorporate GOOD public space usage and design.

They are designed on a human scale.

Smaller public plazas and streets encourage more public interaction

Filled with energy: food, crafts, children, elderly, and even ‘undesirables such as homeless are present without detracting from the overall character of the urban fabric.

Street Cafes create movement through interest at the center of social activity.

Street Vendors are a magnet for activity. When clustered they can create street life.

Corner grocery stores create movement with a purpose. There people interact with their environment and create connectivity within the neighborhood.
On space (European Plazas):
Each could be seen as a small micro-society in itself, individually adding to the complexity of the city as a whole and at the same time giving individuals a chance to share themselves with the community.

-Dan Hatch, MA

On culture:
The site of action is an incentive for action. When people see the lively bustle of an open space, they generally want to be a part of it either directly or indirectly. It’s like a spiral effect until the area is saturated and people are wrapped up in this urban niche; but, at the same time enjoying getting away from it all.

- Patricia Martin, BUP

On streets:
Streets are viable public spaces. They have become a primary focus of city buildings over the past few years. The best or most successful streets are those that can be remembered. They leave long-lasting positive impressions, which is why we are attracted to the best of them not because we have to go there but because we want to be there.

- Emily Newman, MA

On scale:
The scale of streets and blocks and of buildings and spaces has become immense and we find ourselves lost. Street vending is of a much smaller scale and has the ability to personalize the modern city again, adding commercial activity at the human scale. Street vending could create a personal atmosphere and provide economic and social activity. A well thought out street vending structure could have the capacity to reconnect the social aspects of the city.

-Marijn van den Dool, MP
On food:
Food is a social glue.

- Frederik Spittael, MP

On food:
The design of the space used for communal eating usually contains one large table with all of the seats facing each other. This means can be formal or informal, but the concept is the same; focus on food and conversation. The cafe also focuses on food and conversation but the added activities and the openness to public space and public interaction facilitates a different level of intimacy and social interaction.

- Steven Albert, MA

On public space:
Public space fails if the ENTIRE public cannot enjoy it.

- Chris Pohlar, MA

On Streets:
One of my favorite things to do when I visit Downtown (Cincinnati) is to stop at a hotdog vendor’s cart and purchase a brat with mustard and just a little bit of sauerkraut. These vendors are generally set up along well traveled sidewalks where business men and women of the city are most likely to stop for a lunchtime meal. It is here where I meet my fellow Cincinnatians. We may just exchange nods or even have a conversation, but either way I somehow feel as though I have a better understanding of the people that I share this great city with. However, I do not feel this way by merely walking through the streets...the hotdog vendor has provided me with an opportunity to feel closer to the people around me.

- Nicholas Muennich, MP

On Law:
A mother who worries about her child’s safety when it leaves the home is going to have a much greater interest in the public spaces in her neighborhood than city council members passing city ordinances or the police officer who goes home to his house in the suburbs at the end of their shift. Perhaps therein lies the problem.

- Dan O’Connell, MA
In Brazil a simple and cost-effective solution to public transportation was implemented. The Brazilian government implemented transportation alternatives eliminating much need for the automobile and allowing for effective pedestrian districts. Above left, pedestrian district imposed by authority and enforced by a clever social enticement (a place for mothers to bring their children to play while they shop or relax near by).

By designing for social control in public spaces, this will create areas that are more inviting. This can occur by focusing on designing spaces that are comfortable rather than defensible. More police in an area can sometimes detract from that space because it sends a message that is not a safe place to be. If the design of the public space is lively/interesting and includes many different venues of business and social interaction, it will attract a diverse group of people. Also, by supporting small businesses, this will give a stronger economic dependence on the quality of surrounding public spaces. And finally, include street vendors who become the ‘eyes of the street’ in public spaces.
Street vending contributes vitality and conviviality to public space. Yet the rights of vendors to occupy these spaces are challenged by municipal authority, food regulatory agencies, and attitudes of people unfamiliar with the benefits of food offerings. Street vendors rights are often compromised or violated in a way that may eventually lead to a policy of benign neglect or in some cases even 'erasure'. To experience the use of public space through the eyes of street vendors students experimented with the rights of "appropriation", "presence", "use and action", "modification", and "disposition' in a series of events conducted on downtown streets.
To demonstrate the right of presence a display of lollipops was set up on the back of the courthouse bus stop. The students anonymously observed, actively participated, and analyzed public reaction.

Literal representation of a food item; instant attention due to familiarity & amusement (exaggeration of form.)

Emphasizes vendor's right to be present anywhere.

The use of signage to represent a multicultural cuisine.

Visual colorful imagery leads to ambience.

the vendor is inconspicuous

Increase Public Trust. Govt approval stamps; visible licensing.

Food display. Presentation & packaging important for enticing people.

Display: The interest generated due to conversion of bus stop into an attractive 'Bill board' highlighted the importance of attractive cart for putting food.

Encourage informal development at ordinary locations to improve street life at ordinary locations.
Central Parkway
Site One: Behavioral Norms.
Picnicking is usually done in parks, not in medians of parkways.

Kroger building
Site Two: Legal Norms.
Setting up to eat next to a corporate headquarters highlighted the blurring of Public and Private

Court Street
Site Three: Cultural Norms.
Buying time at a meter is understood to be for parking, few would eat there.

Court House
Site Four: Social Norms.
Picnicking in front of the courthouse doors instead of at the tables provided.

This experiment was designed to challenge the boundaries of the right of Presence in order to better understand it. The four sites were chosen to challenge conventions to determine how much the student’s presence would be accepted. The juxtaposition between their actions and the “norm” tested peoples reactions to find the formal and informal means of authority.

Conclusions
There are several dimensions to the right of presence that go beyond the time and the place.

The right to be in a space is shaped not only by the law, but by society.

Social, Behaviour, Cultural and Legal Norms play a role in determining how a persons right to be present will be accepted, tolerated, or rejected.
**THE Right of Use & Action**

This right has to do with the free access and use of facilities without necessary appropriation of them and the point at which these actions surpass those allowable limits.

**COKE vs PEPSI challenge**

**OBJECTIVE.** To challenge the normal use of space by engaging the public beyond their intended action.

**SET.** A table was borrowed from a business nearby and a the Court Street canopy, normally used by vendors was occupied without permission.

**CONCLUSIONS.** Unfortunately the day was chilly, so the idea of drinking a cold beverage did not go well with everyone. Although we did get a few people that wanted to participate in the challenge, our experiment was cut short because the table owner wanted his table back.

Important variables for the design of food in public spaces:

- weather
- variety of food
- time of day
- location
Objectives:
Effect of food with regard to a person’s willingness to fill-out a survey. The ability of food to entice people to fill-out a survey. To examine general attitudes toward street vending in downtown Cincinnati.

Why we picked candy/type of candy?
Sanitary issues (individually wrapped), variety of candy to suit different tastes.

What we found from people’s responses to the survey:
Want to see/be assured that street vendors use sanitary practices/ People wanted more variety of foods sold by vendors.

Our Reactions.
Discomfort: Participating in a structured event in a public space that is used primarily by pedestrians.
Shock/Suprise: General respondent ignorance of street vending regulations. Ignorance of sanitary practices used by street vendors.
Surprised/Annoyed: By peoples avoidance behaviors/non-verbal cues to communicate that they did not want to be approached by us.

Public Reactions.
Indifference from the public to street vending issues. Completing the survey just because we stopped them, showing little interest in the survey.

Indifference of people to our event in general.
Providing candy as an incentive seemed to have almost no effect on the percentage of people who stopped to complete a survey. However we noticed that people with candy were more likely to stop when candy was offered as an incentive.

Jenna Haverkos, Jessica Morris, Dan O’Connell
Initially, we hypothesized that a specific boundary created by the blue tape would hinder people from crossing through to accept an apple. The blue tape would set us apart from others, thus creating an assumption that this boundary cannot be crossed and the area is taken. As time would pass, people would accept the appropriated space as ours.

It appeared that most people took little, if any, notice of the blue tape. However, it seemed that they were still repelled for another reason. Unfamiliarity ended up being the physical feature which set the students apart; others assumed that what they didn’t know, they couldn’t trust and accepted their presence, ultimately leaving the students alone.
The right of appropriation is autonomous and manifests in the acquisition of public space for private or personal use. Is human presence required to appropriate public space? And can food be introduced, when using this right, to alter its condition and enhance socio-behavioral dynamics?

Phase one. The reaction was a wholesale indifference to the objects in the public way. A few odd glances back over shoulders, but mostly ignoring the game.

Phase two. By adding people to use the equipment on the sidewalk, passersby paid more notice—but there was an overall uncomfortable feel about it; awkward glances, avoidance, uncertainty of expectation. One man on his lunch break took the risk and sat with us. As we began introducing ourselves, he offered us sunflower seeds from his own hand—this prompted us to move to the next phase.

Phase 3. The introduction of food certainly lightened the mood. It was a simple menu; chips, salsa, and some complimentary prepackaged chips for anyone that wanted some. People laughed and smiled as they walked past—many engaged us in short conversations, some even stopped, sat, and ate with us. The surprising discovery was that people were willing to eat the open food with us, where the prepackaged food was left widely ignored. The open food created an invitation for people to stop and share with us, and people did.
Public Space

Conclusions

An audience gathered across the street and were entertained by the constructed boundary. The event was reorganized when necessary for legibility and the event was observed from a distance. This was pleasant to some, offensive to others, and the tool with which we easily laid claim to a piece of public space was very easy to attract attention and temporarily claim a space by means of simple modification.

Boundary conditions were created and formed a space. Desirability of modification is subjective. The expected experience which leads to an altered atmosphere can be temporary or permanent, pleasant or offensive. Regardless of interpretation it has the ability to attract the attention and affect the users of the space.

Kathy Farro, Dan Hatch, Amanda Hernandez

modification
To demonstrate the 'modification' of public space with the use of food, we held a cupcake walk to bring a festive atmosphere to the street. Our activity was held on a public sidewalk behind a Montessori school. Sheets of paper are placed on the ground in a circle with numbers written on them. When the music starts, the kids walk around the circle, until the music stops and they land on a number. A number is drawn, and whoever is standing on that number is the winner. The amount of numbers depends on the size of the group. We took 12 students at a time, in which the winner would leave and another brought in to replace them. The cupcake walk lasted approximately 30 minutes, all twenty-four students having won a cupcake. There were a few observers and people just passing by, but not many came over to get a closer look. The most public reaction we received occurred when we were walking back to studio, and a few people noticed our sign and were talking about it. We learned that in order for a food event such as this to be successful, it must be located in a more visible area, not an off-street. Perhaps more people would have taken an interest in our event if it were closer to a main intersection.

Vandalization or Artwork? The modification of public property with graffiti is a controversial topic. Who has the right to change public spaces? Should everyone agree on its worth?

In the 1840's, the Uruguayan capital of Montevideo was blockaded by Argentine dictator Juan Manuel de Rosas. After running out of traditional ammo the besieged Uruguayans used very old and very hard Edam cheese to fire from their cônons. This cheese “modified” everything it came in contact with, including the invading ships.
The space or rights to the space have been appropriated, and can now be given or sold to some other entity. It has come under control it is transferable.

If you want to sell space, it has to be valuable to whoever you’re selling it to. Disposition raises the question of appropriation, along with the ethics of and questions about rightful appropriation.

forced disposition

If you want to sell space, it has to be valuable to whoever you’re selling it to. Disposition raises the question of appropriation, along with the ethics of and questions about rightful appropriation.

The space or rights to the space have been appropriated, and can now be given or sold to some other entity. It has come under control it is transferable.

If you want to sell space, it has to be valuable to whoever you’re selling it to. Disposition raises the question of appropriation, along with the ethics of and questions about rightful appropriation.

forced disposition

If you want to sell space, it has to be valuable to whoever you’re selling it to. Disposition raises the question of appropriation, along with the ethics of and questions about rightful appropriation.

The space or rights to the space have been appropriated, and can now be given or sold to some other entity. It has come under control it is transferable.

If you want to sell space, it has to be valuable to whoever you’re selling it to. Disposition raises the question of appropriation, along with the ethics of and questions about rightful appropriation.
THE RIGHT OF PRESENCE
More often than not, street vendors are denied such rights. The right of presence is the opposite of erasure. This right needs to be restored and preserved in the life of the public and their space.

THE RIGHT OF USE AND ACTION
This right has to do with free access and use of facilities without necessarily appropriating them. In some countries, not only street vendors occupy designated spaces in the public space, but also have access to water, electricity, etc.

THE RIGHT OF APPROPRIATION
This right is somewhat similar to the previous right above. Obviously, once used by certain individuals, certain resources cannot be shared by others. Particular areas of the public space lend themselves more to activities such as street vending that other areas.

THE RIGHT OF MODIFICATION
In some cases, individuals have the permission to change the place as they see fit. There should obviously be certain limitations in a place as far as these changes are concerned. Otherwise, others' rights to space might be jeopardized or prohibited. The important question is to find the limits of "improvisation" as "deliberation". To some extent, vendors improvise, but there is certainly a limit here.

THE RIGHT OF DISPOSITION
There are certain rights that can be transferred to others if need be thus becoming somewhat permanent. Besides permanence, the right of disposition might be a way to sustain a business over a fairly long period of time. By regulating this right, it may help ensure long-term business vitality.
IS IT POSSIBLE to take a public space for festivals and events in downtown on game days and also have it function as a successful park space at all other times?

PROBLEMS. After 4:30pm, the city clears out while the anxious downtown work force literally heads for the hills and home. Businesses that would otherwise be open during after work-day hours close because there is not enough customers and there is too large of a gap between downtown and the riverfront.

ROLE OF FOOD. Food will be used to encourage interaction between people, draw people to the area, and it will create the mood of the event.

OBJECTIVES. (1) Try to invite more people downtown and keep them entertained, especially in the evenings and on weekends (2) Try to connect people to downtown and connect the downtown to the riverfront (3) Design a public space that operates successfully both at times for festivals and events and at times of less usage.

STRATEGIES. (1) Create points of interest as mini destinations along a route to a larger destination (2) Create nodes of activity (3) Hold both public and private activities.
Focus Points
Some major nodes of focus and activity create the connectors that will bring and keep the site alive.

Connectors
The project site is crucial because of its connectivity with other assets of the city such as the stadiums, the freedom center, and downtown housing along with cities across the river.

Boundaries
There are no boundaries as to where people come from to utilize this park, however the actual grounds span between the two stadiums, north up to third street and south to the river.
There is a need for a striking and unique feature in the downtown area. A new destination could highlight historical sites in the city, appeal to a wide audience, and be ever changing. The proposed location of the project and its surrounding areas are in a prime location between Over-the-Rhine, a neighborhood rich with history, and a recently redeveloped entertainment district.
Central Parkway will be reduced to four lanes in lieu of a wider median. This median will accommodate an open-air vending area and create a transition from the ground level down onto the subway platform. The vending areas that will be framed by permanent, fluid structures that house temporary vending necessities such as counter space and food preparation areas. These vending areas will be a constant destination in the park area created but will flourish when events are taking place below. The subway station will allow enough room for any event such as a musical performance or art viewing.
Summary Description. This Project proposes the implementation of an Express Commuter Bus Line, which serves breakfast, linking suburban "Park-and-Ride" locations situated approximately 30 minutes from the CBD, with a transit hub located in downtown Cincinnati. Food, in conjunction with a Wi-Fi network and other ergonomic amenities, would be used as an incentive to encourage office workers to ride the bus.

By starting with a few buses operating from one downtown hub running routes to a select number of Park-and-Ride locations, initial costs are lower than a whole new system and thus reasonable, and the system can be implemented incrementally, as the situation allows. Removing the stigma of riding the bus, by making it more like other accepted means of transportation, encourages more widespread use amongst those whose votes could determine the implementation of the light rail system.
Goals and Objectives. To entice suburbanites to use mass transit in the form of busses, providing users an incentive to reduce reliance upon their cars through increased convenience and amenities is essential. It should be noted that cars are part of the system, and owners are not asked to abandon them. To improve the perceptions of users of mass transit, the transit entity should not be publicly funded, but rather strive for self-sufficiency such that it becomes viewed a public asset, and not a liability. Possible sources of initial funding include the City of Cincinnati, County governments of suburban areas serviced, and regional sources, such as OKI and SORTA, who deal with transportation issues.
ROLE OF GARDENS AND URBAN DECAY.

**Social.**
There are few opportunities for gardeners to come together and partake in gardening events.
There are not enough community members involved.
Not much variety of age groups among gardeners.
Vandalism.
Litter.
Homeless people with nowhere else to go.
Nutritional needs not being met.

**Economic.**
Gardens are not exploiting their income generating capabilities.
Inefficient resource use.
Lack of funding.

**Gardening.**
Lack of garden visibility.
Sustaining interest in gardening.
Recruiting/Training young people.
Vacant garden lots/abandoned gardens.
Turnover rates of gardeners.
Gardeners have minimal economic investment.

PROBLEM STATEMENT.
Currently there are over 700 vacant lots in Cincinnati’s Over-the-Rhine neighborhood. These lots collect trash, attract homeless people and crime, and contribute to the area’s negative image. Reclaming vacant lots and non-buildable parcels for community use can improve not only a neighborhood’s image, but also the quality of life for the people who live there.
Community gardens
Provide a viable food source for sustenance and economic benefit and are a venue for community interaction.

CALCULATIONS
Area of Vacant lots/Area required for sustenance of 1 person
=total number of people sustained by the Community Garden. (N)
AREA CORRESPONDING TO N PEOPLE
1 PERSON : 217 SQFEET [2074745/9572]
345 PEOPLE: ? (A)
THUS, A = 345x217 = 74865 SQFEET

Thus if we assume each member involved will grow one plot for sustenance & one plot for selling produce the proportion of people that can be sustained gets doubled (ref Fig)
Cincinnati is made up of 52 communities all of which have a distinct sense of identity and place. These communities have had a profound impact on the history of the city. While current downtown development is being promoted, sprawl continues to have a negative impact on these neighborhood centers. Community networking is threatened as the environment becomes less supportive of healthy neighborhood relationships. Culture is translated through spatial identity over time. It is imperative to rescue and restore our civic centers. To create an event in each community that can be both celebratory to the neighborhood itself while bringing awareness of the other communities of the city would strengthen the bonds of the city at large and promote better and more inclusive community development.
This design attempts to promote the inclusion of all of Cincinnati’s neighborhoods by creating a mobile infrastructure and a planning infrastructure to facilitate community events. Each event will be a unique community project aimed at strengthening the awareness of that neighborhood’s identity. The key to the design of a food event using this infrastructure is that they are well planned using specific and intrinsic characteristics of each neighborhood. The planning infrastructure will aid in bringing a community together to discuss what it is that makes the neighborhood special. The infrastructure to assist the execution of these events will be a mobile kitchen designed on a low riding flat-bed trailer. The Pop-Up will provide the equipment and services to run an event. The events will include local food items prepared and served by the community, some live entertainment element (ideally from the community), a presentation on the historical and social significance of each neighborhood, a collaborative community art project which is to serve as a semi-permanent reminder of the event, and any auxiliary activities that the community plans.
SUMMARY DESCRIPTION. Findlay Commons will be located on Elder Street on the south side of the market house and on the southeast corner of Elder and Race. All building facades will be renovated on Elder Street. The eastern block of the street will be developed as separate restaurants, forming a food court for Findlay Market. Tables and chairs will be set up along the sidewalk for patrons of Findlay Market and Commons to use. Vendors will be encouraged to be in front of these restaurants and in the adjoining park. The park will consist of both green space and hardscape and will include a stage, permanent seating and flexible seating. The development plan also calls for the improvement of the south parking lots of Findlay Market and the creation of a pedestrian boulevard leading from the parking lots to the market house.

DESIGN OBJECTIVES. Provide a new food court at Findlay Market consisting of permanent and mobile vendors. Renovate the buildings to the south of the market house in order to create a unified and consistent look with the rest of Findlay Market. Design an indoor dining area. Create a park space for dining entertainment. Improve south parking lots. Create axis connecting south entry to the market house in between the two south parking lots and through a proposed pedestrian boulevard.
This design proposes creating a bazaar-like feel for the south side of the market square. The removal of an old one-story building on the corner allows a music stage and a pocket park is provided for residents along Pleasant Street.
PROBLEM STATEMENT.
Street vending in downtown Cincinnati is far too scattered and does not offer a wide variety to accommodate Cincinnati’s downtown market area. Furthermore, it is difficult for people in Cincinnati to rely on the patterns of street vending and where they will be located each day.

DESCRIPTION. By centralizing the vending district into three districts, this increased the usage and ease of accessibility. We identified our sites taking into account several issues including: the density, surrounding area, under-utilized spaces and environmental conditions. When designing the layout of the sites the main focus were conditions that would be attractive to both vendors and potential customers. To attract vendors, spaces that were both appropriate for service and storage, allow for high visibility and pedestrian traffic, provide protection from the weather and allow vendors to achieve a profit from vending in these locations. The attraction of customers on the other hand, spaces which are safe, comfortable, convenient, accessible, and offer a wider variety of food which is not typically available from street vendors in downtown Cincinnati.
**WASHINGTON PARK AUTHORITY**

A vacant building north of Washington Park will house Cincinnati COOKS! This transitional training service, helps hard-to-employ and the homeless that call Washington Park their home. Cincinnati COOKS! would offer a permanent base for the immediate employment of its trainees in a park-side cafe, creating a venue for the healthy integration of the diversity of Cincinnatians occupying the area and serving as a model for future neighborhood development.

1. Music Hall is the cultural anchor of the Washington Park neighborhood. Its patrons will help fuel the neighborhood economy by utilizing its assets. The new School for Creative and Performing Arts (K-12) will also contribute to more daytime culinary needs.

2. Washington Park Elementary school will be moving to a new site off the parks grounds. This audience is similar to SCPA; however there will be more young children in and around the park during certain hours of the day. This will be kept in mind by supplying possible ice cream vendors around the park and restaurants/deli's/vendors for lunch for teachers at both schools, and surrounding businesses.

3. The new mixed use parking garage with housing on Vine Street will also contribute to the need for food in and around the neighborhood.

4. The Art Academy of Cincinnati will be another educational asset to the neighborhood along with an ever growing need to feed a growing population.
INTERNATIONAL MARKET

Plan Components

Multi-National Themed Districts
We plan three sections, or districts surrounding the Findlay Market development, each devoted to a different international culture. The three districts will be Asian, Middle Eastern, and European themed.

Infill on East side of Event Space/Parking
We propose the construction of new buildings to the east of the special event space to enclose the open area so it feels more like an urban space. The new buildings would house two shops and a restaurant with an outdoor café. The upper floors would house market rate condominiums. This project would be financed by the Findlay Market Group, and all profits would go to the organization.

Parking Garage with Street Level Shops
We propose an approximate 300 space parking garage on the existing parking lot on the corner of Elder and Central Parkway. The garage is needed to provide parking for the additional patrons that the proposed developments will attract. Street level shops will be used to anchor this important gateway street corner.

The Findlay Market is Ohio’s oldest continuously operated public market. The historic neighborhood surrounding the Findlay is rich in 19th century Italianate architecture. Findlay Market is home year-around to about two dozen indoor merchants selling meat, fish, poultry, produce, flowers, cheese, deli, and ethnic foods. On Saturdays from April to November the market also hosts a thriving farmers market with dozens of outdoor vendors. Findlay Market is a gathering place for people from all over the city. It routinely attracts perhaps the most socially, economically, racially, and ethnically diverse crowds found anywhere in Cincinnati. They come for the sights, sounds, and smells of an old-fashioned public market, for the great variety of fresh foods, for bargains, for people watching, and for an urban shopping experience.

Findlay Market was chosen for the site of Over-the-Rhine’s international market. The international market will pick up where Findlay Market has left off. The plan is to bring in an opportunity for ethnically diverse dining and shopping experiences. With this implementation, not only Findlay Market will be helped but the entire neighborhood.
The Geography of Themed Environments

Hypothesis:
Main Street vs. Vine Street: Because there has been so much more money invested into Main Street for its revitalization, it has turned into more of a themed environment. Vine Street, on the other hand, has remained largely in the hands of the community and therefore has maintained an unthemed or authentic environment.

Operations:

| Ownership: If an establishment is corporate/franchise | 20 points |
| If there is a dress code | 3 points |
| If there is a cover charge | 2 points |
| Connections: History: If a business has been in business less than 10 years | 13 points |
| Investment: The establishment does not host or advertise local events | 6 points |
| There are not at least three local news or community publications available | 6 points |
| Packaging: Marketing: Advertises on television | 4 points |
| Advertises on the radio | 2 points |
| Advertises in newspaper or print | 2 points |
| Advertises through flyers (promotions) | 2 points |
| Design: Blacked out store front | 10 points |
| Altered/Non-contextual facade | 5 points |
| Non-historic signage | |
| Investment: Corporate Menu | |
| Demographics: Clientele: % of customers that live in OTR less than 35% | 5 points |
| % of customers that drive more than 60% | 5 points |
| Staff: % of staff that live in OTR less than 65% | 15 points |
| 100 points |

Methodology:
The process looks at all of the eating establishments and bars in Over-the-Rhine. Then by mapping the geography of “themed” vs. “unthemed” we attempt to test our hypothesis to see if we come up with two different types of corridors and how similar establishments orbit those corridors. A survey looks at four primary characteristics of these establishments to determine how each individually falls within a scale from themed to authentic. Each primary characteristic: Operations, Connections, Packaging, and Demographics, are allotted 25 points for a total of 100. Higher scores are more themed.

Findings:
We did not find exactly what we set out, but we did find clusters of themed establishments and clusters of unthemed establishments. These are more dense on Main Street and less dense on Vine. This could be due to the level of development on each. We do find, that where there are themed establishments that they do happen primarily on Main St, where the unthemed or authentic establishments seem a bit more free to be on either. Twelfth St seems to be the linking corridor between Main and Vine (at least as food establishments are concerned).

Mathias Detamore, Hillary Brooks, Ben Henson, Coleman Kane
Urban Agriculture

Policy Issues

'Urban agriculture' is defined as small-scale, independently or family-owned farming that is an integral part of the urbanizing fabric of a region. It exists as fragmented patches of farmland within older rural settlements and expanding suburban sprawl. We use the term 'urban agriculture' to define geographic areas within Cincinnati's urbanizing region that need attention in land use planning and preservation as viable economic and landscape resources.

Food System

Today we move away from agriculture's traditional production and rural roots focus to define the role of contemporary urban agriculture in the context of economic development, technology and consumer's emerging preferences, community livability, safe food, organically grown food, a means for suburban sprawl management, and the maintenance of a sense of rural character. The following student work explored the linkage between these areas and the system of production, distribution, and consumption in the Cincinnati metro region, and explored the possibility of redefining such areas as special economic districts and unique landscapes.

While a certain amount of food trade is useful and will continue to be an activity of modern economies, communities that seek to meet their food needs locally as much as possible will realize other benefits as well:

"Rebuilding local food production requires rebuilding the local diversity of crops and food businesses needed to adequately feed the local population. Farmers producing for the local market tend to increase the diversity of their plantings - a shift with advantages for the diets of local people and the ecology of local landscapes.

"Money spent on local produce at farmers' markets, at locally owned shops, or on locally produced food stays in the community longer, creating jobs, raising incomes, and supporting farmers.

"Local food often costs less than the equivalent food bought on the specialty chain produce market or from a supermarket, because transportation costs are lower and there are fewer middlemen."
Loss of Farm Land

American Farmland Trust's study: Farming on the Edge discovered that sprawling development threatens America's best farmland. **America is losing prime farmland at a rate of approximately two acres per minute.**

86 percent of U.S. fruits and vegetables, and 63 percent of our dairy products, are produced in urban-influenced areas and our food is increasingly in the path of development. **Growth itself is not the problem, rather it is wasteful land use.** Urbanized land grew by 47 percent and housing lots accounted for 55 percent of the land developed.

**Prime agricultural lands are peripheral to the major urban centers.** Therefore, the pressures for development of these areas are accentuated given the potential for more lucrative land uses.
Changing Nature of Farms

Commercial farms have captured the market as the farming industry has experienced an increase in farm technology, commercialization, and globalization. *The historic fabric of American culture is being lost.*

**Mechanization of Farming**

Farms consolidate to cover costs and increase efficiency. They become more mechanized, production is increased, and less labor is required. Farmers are displaced to urban areas.

Due to globalization, farmers have entered international markets to increase the demand of their products. This increases profit and earning potential, thus enticing farmers to bring more land into production.

**Time line: Changes Between 1990-1975**

- 1790 - 95% of Americans lived in rural areas
- 1900 - Over 40% of US population lived on 5.7 million farms
- 1935 - Peak number of farms - 7 million with average of 55 acres
- 1975 - 2 million farms, average of 440 acres, employing less than 3% of the labor force

**Family** farms are phased out as technological advances force the cost of farming to increase.
Rent determines the agricultural land uses around the market city. Products of higher value can bid higher prices for the use of land which is assigned to the highest bidder.

A piece of land will be put to the use that gives the maximum economic return under the given physical circumstances.

Developers' location decisions are affected by:
- Access to highways
- Distance from natural features
- Farmland quality
- Existence of public infrastructure

Agricultural land uses predominantly have had the lowest economic value while residential, commercial, industrial, and institutional uses have experienced economic returns.

Parameters of Agricultural Location

- Distance of land to the market
- Transport cost per unit of product
- Yield of crop per unit of land
- Market price per unit of product
- Production costs per unit of product
- Proximity to arterial routes
- Scale of production
- Proximity of non-agricultural uses
- Quality and variety of produce
- Level of technology and sophistication of production systems
Consumer Preferences

**Factors Affecting Consumer Choices**

WHAT items do consumers want?
WHERE are they being bought?
WHEN are they purchasing items?

**Prices and Availability**
Urban development applies pressure upon remaining agricultural lands causing the value of farm produce to increase.

**Convenience & Accessibility**
People have less time to prepare food. Eating out, home-delivery, and microwaveable foods are convenient options for consumers.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Percentage of Expenditure on Food</th>
<th>Supermarkets</th>
<th>Specialty Stores</th>
<th>Convenience</th>
<th>Other Stores</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Canada</td>
<td>82.4</td>
<td>6.7</td>
<td>3.4</td>
<td>7.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Asia</td>
<td>72.8</td>
<td>14.2</td>
<td>3.1</td>
<td>9.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Europe</td>
<td>80.7</td>
<td>10.6</td>
<td>2.1</td>
<td>6.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S. &amp; Cent. America</td>
<td>78.4</td>
<td>11.8</td>
<td>2.9</td>
<td>8.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Middle East</td>
<td>85.8</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>3.4</td>
<td>14.3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


**Food Expenditure & Household Income**

- Increased income and smaller families has led to higher per capita expenditure on food.
- While total expenditure away from home have remained higher, the expenses on food away from home have increased faster than on food consumed at home.
Trends reveal that American consumers are older, more diverse, and increasing in number. There will be an additional 50-80 million people consuming food in the United States. Food Expenditures in supermarkets, restaurants, fast food outlets, and other retail establishments are expected to increase by 26% from the current level of $800 billion in 2001 to $1 trillion by 2020.

As ethnic diversity increases in the United States, the desire for a wider variety of produce and food products increases. The Consumer Expenditure Survey of 1994-1996 indicates an increase in consumption of fruit, vegetables, fish, and pork. Small Farmers could benefit by providing such products.

1. California 28%
2. Texas 10%
3. North Carolina 4%
4. Florida 3%
5. Washington 3%

Hired farm workers include those paid to manage farms for employers (10%), supervisors of farm workers (4%), and farm and nursery workers (86%). The number of farm workers is steadily decreasing. Almost half of the hired farm workers are located in five states.

In the U.S., obesity has reached epidemic proportions. Ninety-seven million or 55% of adults ages 20-74 are obese/overweight. Affordability and availability of processed, "junk" and fast foods, poor diets, sedentary lifestyles, and lack of nutritional education are key reasons for this current trend.
Federal and State Economic Policies

**FEDERAL POLICY**

*Pre WWI: Limited government intervention in agricultural sector*

*Great Depression: Collapse of crops and increase in government assistance*

*After 1950: Increase in crop production and more emphasis on farm policies related to supply management*

*Present Scenario: Wide variety of commodity, conservation, trade, credit, and other subsidy programs.*

Government payments have increased steadily from 1996 to 2000 and the rising trend is expected to continue in 2004. However, larger farms receive a higher percentage of the total government payments compared to the smaller farms.

**STATE POLICY**

Ohio and Kentucky, like many other states, have developed programs to help maintain agricultural production and profitability within local economies.

**Ohio:**
- Agricultural Easement Purchase Program (AEPP)
- The family Farm Loan Program
- Current Agricultural Use Value (CAUV) program
- Transfer of Development Rights (TDR)

**Kentucky:**
- Purchase of Agricultural Conservation Easement Programs (Kentucky PACE)
- Tax Relief
  > Differential Assessment Laws/Current Use/Value Assessment
  > Estate Tax Relief
- Transfer of Development Rights (TDR)
- Purchase of Development Rights (PDR)
As a result of industrialization and largely on part of the meat packing crisis in American cities in the early 1900's, the 1906 Food and Drugs Act was enacted to ensure the purity of a product. Since then, many advances have been made to ensure consumer safety and health. While large corporate farms are able to absorb the cost of compliance, these regulations make it difficult for small farm operations to make ends meet.

The food safety Network strives to oversee all aspects of food production, processing, and consumption.

**KEY PLAYERS:**
- Department of Health and Human Services
- U.S. Department of Agriculture (USDA)
- Environmental Protection Agency (EPA)

This network links all levels of government and is guided by the following principals:
- Only safe and wholesome foods may be marketed
- Science-based regulatory decision making
- Government-based enforcement responsibility
- Manufacturers, distributors, and importers are expected to comply and are held liable for inaction
- The regulatory process is transparent and accessible to the public (www.fsis.usda.gov)

The USDA manages most of the organizations directly impacting small farms. These groups include Food safety and Inspection Services (FSIS), Animal and Plant Health Inspection Service (APHIS), Agricultural Marketing services (AMS), Farm Service Agency (FSA), and the Grain Inspection, and Packers and Stockyard Administration (GIPSA).

As regulation compliance has forced small farms out of existence, the government has started developing systems to help protect small business owners. These policies include the Regulatory Flexibility Act (RFA) of 1980 and also the Small Business Regulatory Enforcement Fairness Act (SBREFA) of 1996.
Tariffs raise the price on imported goods before entering the domestic market, while subsidies encourage producers to export their products. Tariffs and subsidies help determine the price of an agricultural good.

**World Trade Organization (WTO)** The Uruguay Round Agreement of 1986-94 culminated into the formation of a world Trade Organization. Under the 'Agricultural Agreement', developed countries had to eventually cut their tariff rates and export subsidies by 36%. All domestic support measures facilitating overproduction were to be reduced by 20% over a 6 year period.

**North Atlantic Free Trade Agreement (NAFTA)** All tariffs on agricultural imports between Mexico, Canada, and the United States are to be gradually reduced and eventually eliminated by 2008. However, under NAFTA, price supports (subsidies) are permitted, so long as they do not interfere with free trade.

**Distribution Channels**

**OLIGOPOLISTIC** operations and **VERTICAL INTEGRATION** have contributed to the consolidation of the food and agricultural industries. Small farms are not able to produce the quantities that most grocery stores require, nor are they able to guarantee a steady **product supply year-round**. As a result, farms have gotten larger, they often produce mass quantities of a single crop, and they utilize heavy amounts of **chemical** fertilizers and pesticides. Our food also **travels longer distances** from more suitable growing climates before reaching local grocery stores. **Grading standards** also force farmers to use preservative methods and genetically enhanced crop varieties to sustain freshness and aesthetic appeal to the consumer.
Economic Strategies

Preserving Farmland as an ECONOMIC ENGINE

**Goals**

- Improve efficiency and reach of small farms to distribute products to traditional and new markets
- Provide an economic benefit to the local economy that exceeds residential value
- Utilize emerging technology to increase yields with an organic, sustainable method
- Employ educational & outreach activities to reconnect people with food production and consumption

**Strategies**

Small farms are typically excluded from the traditional food distribution-processing system across the region and nation. To break the monopoly of agribusiness and provide fresher food to consumers, a better distribution and processing system is needed. Successful distribution examples include systems spearheaded by local authorities that collaborate with institutions, schools, restaurants, internet-based delivery, and co-ops.

As development pressure on agriculture grows, it is imperative that agricultural counties affected by urban sprawl show an economic benefit for farming and agricultural-related commercial activity.

A region will benefit by keeping more dollars in the community and by using the land to generate agricultural revenue while accommodating residential growth demands.

A diverse collection of marketable crops should be grown to diversify the farm's income and economic risk.

Technological advances used to create solar-green houses and better tractors and farm equipment should allow local farmers to produce a higher yield of fresher fruit. A developed distribution system among the farmers and buyers would create an opportunity for local restaurants and grocers to take advantage of the high-quality products produced.

Communities have had several opportunities for involvement that include a subscription system, seasonal events, education, and outreach activities.

Additionally, farms can host activities throughout the year like hayrides, apple presses, and a pumpkin patch.

**Problem**

Small farms are disappearing due to agribusiness and residential developments.

**The number of farms is declining as the size and scale of production is increasing.**
Boone County
Site "A"

Boone County has been developing at a rapid pace over the past 20 years. The residential suburbs have been a contributor to the sprawling developments that have consumed fertile agricultural land. Site A is along the Ohio River, has rich soils, and is an agricultural region experiencing urban/suburban developments from surrounding areas.

**SITE ANALYSIS & ZONING ISSUES**

Site A primarily falls within the flood plains of the Ohio River, urban development is scarce, and agricultural uses dominate the landscape.

Where is the Most Suitable Area for Farming?

According to the soil mapping inventory, the most agriculturally productive regions have been identified.

This area has a unique rural character that is visually stimulating and also contains several historic sites.

WHERE DO WE BUILD?...
This agricultural conservation plan proposes some planning measures to promote the farming tradition in northern Boone County, while reversing the conventional trends in residential and urban developments for the area.

To project the physical growth patterns for the year 2020, the trends for the past 20 years have been analyzed. It is concluded that all of the flat land on the northern tip of the county will be converted into residential land uses, if current zoning regulations are maintained and growth continues at its current rate.

Using overlays of soil types, slopes, flood plains, current land uses, zoning, and infrastructure services, a composite map has been created identifying areas in the region most suitable for farmland preservation and agricultural production.

An economic proposal incorporates locally owned farms to provide fresh, safe, and high-quality products. These products would be available to restaurants and grocers through a specially developed distribution system. To make agriculture more viable, subscription systems, seasonal events at local farms, and outreach activities are opportunities available to the community.

Recommended Land Use Plan
The plan proposes to conserve the farmland by diverting the growth through methods of urban in fill and density concentration. Planning tools of agricultural conservation zoning, Transfer of Development Rights (TDR), and other agricultural economic techniques are employed to maintain the farmlands. It also conserves the parcels of land having higher potential for agricultural development through various zoning methods.
Boone County
Site "B"

Study area B consists of a variety of land uses ranging from agriculture to commercial to residential. It consists of approximately 4300 acres of land. The pressures that are changing the available agricultural and forest land into new residential subdivisions are clearly evident.

SITE ANALYSIS & ZONING ISSUES

The road network in the study area dominates the land uses. It is acting as a catalyst to suburban sprawl. Growth along the corridors is predominantly residential and commercial, while agricultural lands have fewer access routes.

Existing Land Use
-Experiencing growth pressures and possible encroachment from development within Burlington
-Current land use: multi use
-Agricultural-31%
-Residential-44%
-Woodlands-20%

Existing Land Cover
Woodlands cover most of the steep slopes and provide viewsheds to the area that enhance the visual character of the area.

Alluvial Soils
Although properties in the area have a high potential for erosion, they are also more fertile due to their location on the alluvial ridges of local streams.

Where is the Most Suitable Area for Farming?

South-west and south-central parts of the area have an average to high suitability for growing crops. It has high potential for growing tobacco. Principle crops for Boone County include:

- TOBACCO
- CORN
- WHEAT
- ALFA-ALFA
- RED CLOVER
- GRASS
- LESPEDEZA

WHERE DO WE BUILD?...
Boone County
Site "B"

Aditi Mantrawadi  Ruchit Sharma
Angela Quinn  Surabhi Bharbhaya
Beth Kramer  Tatiana Kosheleva
Deepali Tumbde

Half of study area B is currently zoned to allow residential development, indicating the county is accommodating urban sprawl.

Projected growth patterns by 2020 without a strategic plan and enforced land use controls

Proposed land use plan for 2020

Current zoning can not accommodate the growth projected by the year 2020

Proposed Zoning Addressed:
- Changes in terms of land use and character
- Preserving the agricultural land while accommodating future growth
- Forming distinct agricultural districts
- Identifying parcels for cluster developments
- Designating areas for Conservation Easements

issues addressed
- soil productivity
- slopes
- view sheds
- woodland areas
- flood plains
- historic sites

Highest potential found in south-western corner of area B

Implementation tools:
- Transfer of Development Rights (TDR)
- Purchase of Agricultural Conservation Easements (PACE)
- Agricultural Districts
- Cluster Developments

Economic Development Strategies:
- Farmer's Markets
- Vineyards
- Farm to School Programs
- Goat meat production
Warren County Site "A"

Warren County is currently the fastest growing county in Ohio. Warren County Site "A" is experiencing heavy development pressure as the three cities of Monroe, Lebanon, and Mason seek to accommodate their own residential and industry-related needs. This expansion has come at the cost of many small farms.

**SITE ANALYSIS & ZONING ISSUES**

Development is occurring quickly at low densities. Minimum lot sizes of 2 acres for properties not serviced by sewer are standard.

The location of a strip of land designated for manufacturing activities corresponds with the location of a major underground aquifer and wellhead protection zone. Areas with a larger presence of streams and ground water aquifers have a higher risk of becoming contaminated. Established wellhead protection boundaries help protect public water supply resources.

**Where is the Most Suitable Area for Farming?**

Soils with a more neutral pH (Russell and Miami Xenia Wynn) are typically more agriculturally productive than those that have higher acidity and alkaline ratings.

**Where Do We Build?...**
Three aspects of land use and economic development have been examined and fused into a comprehensive plan. These strategies for implementation suggest ways for agricultural and urban land uses to co-exist within a community.

**Development Recommendations:**

> Development impact fees based on acreage utilization to encourage denser settlement

> Implementing stipulations for minimum lot sizes through the zoning ordinance

> Using sewer lines and necessary infrastructure improvements as incentives for higher density development

> Developing a farmland green belt for preservation along the flood plain to prohibit Mason’s coalescence with Lebanon and Monroe

> Strengthening and connecting trail systems for alternative transportation and recreation

> Creating a Planned Unit Development (PUD) combining, commercial, professional, high density residential land uses while preserving agricultural properties.

> Maintain high density residential development at 2-4 units per acre and low density at 1 unit per 2 acres to 1 unit to 1 acre.

**Strategies Helping Farmers and Local Economies:**

**Distributions system-** A distribution/processing/retail center is proposed, as well as the establishment of a new farmer's market, and community supported agriculture.

**Processing-** The Warren Agricultural Boards is proposed to help process and sell locally grown produce in surrounding areas. The first recommended processed product is organically grown salsa.

**Marketing-** 'Made in Warren County' product labels, signs, and flyers as well as other advertising techniques to promote agricultural awareness.
Warren County has become a prime example of urban sprawl. Study area "B" is located in the central part of the county. It includes parts of Turtle Creek, Clear Creek, and Wayne Townships. The study area is bound by Little Miami River & flood plain, Pekin Road, the city of Lebanon, and Interstate 71.

**SITE ANALYSIS & ZONING ISSUES**

Current land use within Site "B" remains predominantly agricultural; however, encroaching development threatens this rural area. Minimum lot sizes of 2 acres for properties not serviced by sewer are standard in Warren County.

Current Zoning in Area B

Current Land Use/Land Coverage

Current Zoning in Area B

Current Land Use/Land Coverage

What Areas are Suitable for Farming?

Large plots of land in this region are highly suitable for farming.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Land Use</th>
<th># of Parcels</th>
<th>Total Acreage</th>
<th>% of Site Area</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Agricultural/Vacant</td>
<td>214</td>
<td>6,504</td>
<td>69.10%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recreation/Open</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>136</td>
<td>1.40%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Single Family</td>
<td>646</td>
<td>2,777</td>
<td>29.50%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>866</td>
<td>9,416</td>
<td>100.00%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Where do we build?

Crop land and pasture dominate the study area with woodland forests bordering the Little Miami River.
The area of Turtle Creek Township that contains site B will more than double its population by 2020. The current zoning standards are not prepared to accommodate both housing and agricultural needs for the area. This plan suggests alternatives allowing the county to provide adequate housing and preserve the most agriculturally profitable areas.

### Projected Land Use in 2020 if Current Trend Continues

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Change</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2000</td>
<td>6,438</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2020</td>
<td>13,610</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7,172</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Recommended Plan for Year 2020

**Features:**

- **Preserved 1,316 Acre Agricultural District**
  This area serves as a farming education center in the region. It features an information center, demonstration farm, livestock, orchard, parking lot, and bike trail.

- **New Sewer lines**
  These would serve the southern part of Area B and enable 1.2 acre single family units to be concentrated in the area.

- **Residential Development**
  This zone would have 2 acre single family units reflecting low density development.

- **Conservation District**
  This area is located between the agriculture district and residential areas and serves as a buffer between opposing land uses.
References:

**Food Commerce in the Preindustrial Era:**

**Food Production, Distribution, and Manufacture 1845-1900; Groceries from 1900-1945; The Golden Age of Supermarket 1945-1980**


**Superstores Growth and Girth: Grocery Retailing 1980-present**


**Trends: Business Strategies**


**Gender, Poverty, and Grocery Store in Cincinnati, Ohio**

**The Social Role of Grocery Stores: Quality of Life Indicators**

**Grocery Stores and Social Capital: A Study of**
Appendix


First Look at the 2002 Census of Agriculture. www.agriculturalcensus.us.gov


"Free trade is helping most, hurting some," Farmers Weekly 138 no. 17 (2003): 80.


Seven Cincinnati Neighborhood


FOOD PRODUCTION ISSUES


CAGIS. 2004. GIS data.


Castellini Company Representative. 2004. Interview by

Cato Institute. 2004 Internet; www.cato.org


Olowolayemo, Surajudeen and Debra Tropp. 2000. "How Local Farmers and School Food Service Buyers Are Building Alliances. Lessons Learned from the USDA Small Farm/School Meals Work-


Standard Industrial Classification. Available at <http://www.wave.net/upg/immigration/sic index.html> accesses 16th April 2004


Szafnuch David L. How to save Americas Depleting Supply of Farm-land.


Revisiting the Pedagogy of Public Space by Redefining the Public

Preliminary Draft
Please do not quote without author’s permission

By:
Mahyar Arefi
School of Planning
University of Cincinnati
P.O. Box 210016
Cincinnati, OH 45221-0016
Tel: 513-556-0212
Fax: 513-556-1274
AN OVERVIEW OF THE LITERATURE: Much of the research on the loss and decline of the public space and public realm expresses concerns over what constitutes the “public” (Arendt, 1958; Sennett, 1977; Rustin, 1986; Mitchell, 1995; Crawford, 1996; Southworth and Parthasarathy, 1996; Banerjee, 2001). Broadly, public refers to the space and affairs “among those who inhabit the man-made world together” (Arendt, 1958: 52). However, this definition implies multiple interpretations (Southworth and Parthasarathy, 1996: 246) and discussions including the dichotomies between the public and private, family and civil society, inclusion and exclusion, and freedom of access and control.

The preponderance of the “publicness” of public space stems from the virtues of the “unplanned encounter” (Scruton, 1987) including: diminishing the “fear of the strange and stranger” (Lennard and Lennard, 1984), providing freedom of access and encounter, diminishing exclusion and increasing opportunity for casual encounter, heightening awareness of the “other,” visibility and “conviviality” (Illich, 1973; Banerjee, 2001), shared joy and group identity, a catalyst for memory and fantasy, and creating a social bond. While various ethical, political, emotional, and socio-cultural characteristics of the term have been recognized, their policy implications have remained either somewhat elusive or vague, or have become increasingly irrelevant.

Successful urban design practices still largely depend on generating spaces that celebrate the iconic attributes of the consumerist society (i.e., the Times Square), or monitor the presence of the incivility through exclusion (i.e., the private corporate open spaces in downtown Los Angeles). So much so that open spaces that cater primarily to the “white-collar office worker, business firms and visitors and middle and upper class residents” constitute the ideal negotiated plaza (Loukaitou-Sideris, 1993; Frieden and Sagalyn, 1989). These spaces are far less diverse and open and convivial and largely constitute what Walzer (1986) calls simple-minded space rather than those that encourage open-mindedness and conviviality and encourage social bonding, or diminish the fear of the strange and stranger, or induce unplanned encounter.

Part of the contemporary sterility or banality associated with the public space has to do with spatial control (Lynch, 1981) and the exercise of the rights of citizenship and how they have transformed in recent times. These five rights include: presence, use and action, modification, appropriation, and disposition.

The question is to identify specific publics that correspond to these respective spatial rights. For example, the right of presence remains critical for the homeless or the underclass to be recognized. This represents an alternative approach to how to think about public spaces instead of designing them retroactively and based on a general, monolithic notion of the public. Without such a right, the homeless cannot be tolerated and included. Mitchell’s (1995) essay on “The End of Public Space?” vividly illustrates the struggle among various types of “publics” and the exercise of their at times conflicting sets of rights over a contested public space known as People’s Park in Berkeley, California. The noteworthy publics in the struggle over the contested “public space” included the City, the University of California, Berkeley, and the homeless people who sought their free access to the park within their democratic and citizenship rights.

As it turned out, each of the parties involved had their own interpretation and perceptions of what constitutes public and public space. While the University and the City favored restrictions of access to those who violated the social codes of civility, the homeless
people considered People’s Park a true public space they were entitled to use. What are the possible urban design implications of multiple perceptions toward the public and public space?

The literature on public space and the nature of public realm clearly show that the story of People’s Park has been but an isolated incident surrounding the transforming, fuzzy, and conflicting nature of the public. In fact, the production of public space that ideally allows the attributes of a broadly defined public to make sense becomes increasingly problematic in the contemporary society. While the notion of public man becomes questionable due to a variety of ongoing phenomena including globalization, the rise of the telecommunication era and the network society (Lim, 2002), and fear of the stranger, public has lost much of its potency due to the strength of the values of privatism, the concomitant fall of public man (Sennett, 1977), the steady withering of the public realm (Banerjee, 2001), and so on. As such, while the term public has lost much of its conceivable luster, it has been reduced to different categories that reflect its multiple layers, including conviviality (Illich, 1977), tolerance of the other, and, seeing and to be seen.

Therefore, it is conceivable to think of public spaces that cater to different types of publics. While much of the literature on public space has questioned the openness, accessibility, and the distribution of public space, the degree of its publicness remains questionable as well. On the other hand, the crisis of publicness has seriously questioned the precision of public space as a meaningful term. Lim (2002) has used the term “civic space” instead of public space to “clarify the need for spaces in which civil society can engage in its daily practices of voluntary association” and Banerjee (2001) has recommended focusing on the concept of “public life” rather than public space, because “public life is flourishing in private places, not in corporate theme parks, but also in small businesses such as coffee shops, bookstores, and other such third places.” To Lim (2002), civic space constitutes an active dimension of social life and change; to Banerjee (2001) however, the importance of social life has diminished due to our isolation from the public life due to the Internet and cyberspace.

The dichotomies between public life and public space on one hand, and between public space and civic life on the other, call for revisiting the term public and its relevance in conceptualizing the public realm or public space.

The most prevalent impact of the transformation of the term public is that it is no longer a monolithic concept, which once was captured in spaces that were conceivably open to the masses of people from different walks of life, social class, income, and gender. Instead, the word public has been redefined into spaces of limited liability in a sense that they respond to certain type of publics instead of a broad conception of public encompassing difference and deviance among other things.

**STUDENT PROJECTS**

In a class exercise on the role of food in the life of public space, the spatial rights defined by Lynch were examined in Cincinnati, which has experienced heightened racial and social tensions in the last few years and has gained reputation for police brutality and intolerance toward certain kinds of public. An interdisciplinary group of the University of Cincinnati students and faculty from architecture, planning, and geography collaborated on the design of different types of public spaces that aimed to address
different types of public. The venue for this multi-group exercise was the Niehoff studio located at the downtown Cincinnati. These publics represented socio-economic diversity and raised concerns about group identity. Selecting appropriate locations for each public space on the basis of social purpose and group identity, students attempted to resolve the conflicting rights of citizenship, and exhibited the visual and contextual attributes of their proposed public spaces.

What follows describes each student project, the specific social, economic, and the physical goals associated with them, and also the critical elements in understanding the current status of public space. Students identified different publics against the backdrop of street vending or more broadly food, which could serve as an important catalyst in the vitality and revitalization of cities (Crawford\(^1\), 2000) and their public spaces. Street vendors contribute to the creation of viable public space and contrary to those who believe public space is dead, the changing nature of the public space calls for “different publics” (Crawford, 2000).

1. **Washington Park Authority**: Addressing the “homeless” as a needy public and as a unifying theme, the first team of students designed a “food district” in the vicinity of the Cincinnati Drop-In Center. The disconnect among various social service organizations in Cincinnati, on one hand, and the central location of the Drop-In Center at the periphery of the highly stigmatized Washington Park in Over-The-Rhine, on the other, prompted this design. The proposal sought to engage the local stakeholders including the merchants, business owners, the City Council, and community leaders in the implementation of the Washington Park Authority. The design combined the services of the Drop-In Center, Dress for Success, Cinti Cooks, and the Food Ventures Center, so that the homeless get cleaned up, get dressed up, and get training, and apply their new skills for self-sufficiency.

\(^1\) See Gewertz 2000.
2. Breakfast Bus: The second team targeted a different type of public by focusing on the public spaces surrounding the work place in downtown Cincinnati. Their design rationale derived from the idea that the public transportation system is essentially stigmatized, lacks incentives for suburbanites, and perpetuates the commonly held perception that it subsidizes the poor. More than offsetting the need for transportation through a unique culinary experience, the designers hope to attract the typically well-educated and affluent suburbanite labor force who, commutes to downtown to work. This effort finds the form of an express bus route serving breakfast from a suburban park and ride and a convenient downtown depot. As part of their site selection criteria, this group recommended parking lots that are not isolated and instead, have some existing amenities in their proximity (i.e., a grocery store, or a restaurant within walking distance).
3. Game Day: Arguing that after 4:30 pm, businesses close early because of the lack of customers and that there is really not much to do or see, the third group focused on downtown Cincinnati as a ghost town. This group envisioned a “Game Day” as a festival type event that could rejuvenate downtown Cincinnati. Capitalizing on activities that start early and last all day when Cincinnati Bengals and Reds play home games, the idea is to attract a public that seeks to spend some time when there are events (i.e., games in progress and happening in Downtown). Designing several points of interest along a path that connects different public spaces in downtown, this group set out to create a set of journeys for downtown Cincinnati. In addition to game days, other possible events for attracting the public to the underutilized public space of downtown Cincinnati include: A Taste of Cincinnati, the Cincinnati Tall Stacks,” and the “Oktober Fest.” The designers also recommended zoning out the downtown spaces for both “long,” “medium,” and “short term” street vending in Cincinnati.
4. **Community Gardens**: The fourth group sought to enhance the community ownership of the public space, especially in deteriorating neighborhoods. The idea behind this proposal emanates from recycling the underutilized spaces within a neighborhood into community gardens. These gardens would in turn induce social interaction by promoting gardening, engaging the community in celebrating their local identity as well as showcasing their work and products and holding various educational programs for people of different ages. The policies that are conducive to planning community gardens would include: allocating public spaces within a ¼ mile of any residence and locating gardens within close proximity to children’s schools.

5. **Pop-Up Cincinnati**: This project was premised on the role of local cultural events in restoring the community identity. These events can be celebratory to the neighborhood while also bringing awareness to the other local communities. The infrastructure to assist the execution of these events involves a mobile kitchen designed on a low riding flat-bed trailer with a truck for towing and a small stage for music and live presentations. The truck will include a movie projector that can be used by the community for any kind of audio-visual presentations, movies, etc. The cooking units run by natural gas will be both modular and interchangeable so that as the community plans for the event, they can actually plan a kitchen that will best suit their needs. Each event will be designed for the community by the community. Neighborhoods will compete for eligibility based on their intentions for the planned events. When applying
for the use of the mobile infrastructure, other criteria will have to be met for consideration (i.e., access, availability of a square or a main street corridor, and historic significance). An event could be as intimate as a block party to bring together members of the community with local businesses or support a larger program such as a home fair to advertise the amenities of the community and encourage home buying. A menu will have to be prepared that will capitalize on resources of each locality; it could be based on a local restaurant that is key to the community, or a specific food type that is common to the neighborhood, etc.

6. The Bazaar: This proposal focuses on south side of the Findlay Market in the heart of Over-The-Rhine, a dysfunctional, yet promising district of Cincinnati. This project is proposing placing arts and crafts vendors along the south of the Market, and extending the theme of arts by creating a stage area for performances to be located at the Southeast corner of Elder and Pleasant Streets. This event will occur every Saturday during the summer from June until August. While the vendors will operate during normal Market hours, the stage can be used until at different times. The products will be high quality and locally made and distributed. Emergency vehicles will have a clear path, as the vendors are not located in the center of the roads. The vendor will have a designated zone and the stage area will cut into two existing buildings, allowing a sheltered area and opening up the currently small corner space for seating. The lower level of the buildings will contain permanent restaurants to further facilitate the stage area after Market hours.
7. Findlay Commons: This group sought to enhance the popularity and profitability of Findlay Market, which is a thriving marketplace in the middle of an impoverished Cincinnati neighborhood. Lacking a stopping point for visitors, this group proposed a development scenario based on which patrons could linger and perhaps stay a bit longer on a Saturday morning. Specifically, the plan was to attract different types of publics from the neighborhood itself, downtown, the suburbs, and visitors from out of town. Envisaged as a destination, visiting Findlay Market could potentially become an event, not just another stop on the to-do list.

Findlay Commons will be located on Elder Street on the south side of the market house and the lot on the southeast corner of Elder and Race. The group proposed to renovate all building facades on Elder Street, and to develop the eastern block of the street as separate restaurants, forming a food court for Findlay Market. Tables and seats will be set up along the sidewalk for patrons of Findlay Market and Commons to use. Vendors will be encouraged to sell in front of these restaurants and in the adjoining park, which will consist of greenspace, hardscape, a stage, permanent seating, and flexible seating. The plan also proposes to improve the south parking lots of Findlay Market, and the creation of a pedestrian boulevard leading from the parking lots to the market house.
8. Subway as an Underground Arts Center: The Cincinnati subway system and the Race Street Station located directly below Central Parkway between Vine and Elm Streets are notably unique features of the city that remain hidden and unused. The proposed site of the project and its surrounding areas are in a prime location between Over the Rhine, a neighborhood with a rich history and a recently developed entertainment district, and the Central Business District. This area currently has an abundance of large, impersonal office buildings on the south side of Central and parking lots to the north.

A portion of the median on Central Parkway would accommodate an open-air vending area and transition space from the ground level into the station. The vending stations would be framed by permanent, fluid structures that house temporary vending necessities such as counter space and food preparation areas. Vending areas will be an extension of the events taking place in the subway station below. There are a total of 40 canopies, all over 15 feet wide. The largest 7 on each side extend out from the bridge at or beyond 9 feet, allowing plenty of room for all vending necessities, and in the event that some are empty, covered eating areas. Utilities such as electricity and water will be extended from the road to the vending areas, allowing for easy setup. The median will also be the location of moveable seating and tables, skylights, and a pedestrian bridge connecting the two medians. The skylights, increasing in size towards the outside ends of the medians, will house the emergency exits stairwells. The tables and seating can be easily locked up at night within the subway station. The transition from the subway includes the ADA-accessible ramps and the two original staircases that face one another in the center of the site. These steps are within code (7/11”); not much would have to be done to alter them for present-day use.
The subway station will facilitate the art events. The subway station has a central, raised platform and 3 subway tracks. The west end of this symmetrical space will include a ramp entrance, while the east end will remain open. This open space will allow enough room for any events where a large crowd may gather, such as a music event. The sides (the train tracks and outer walls) will house art and other exhibits.

9. Outdoor Food Courts: This group proposed to create centralized vending districts within the city of Cincinnati, which include friendly public spaces for people to sit and eat. After surveying several random people on the street, it was concluded that customers would like to see more opportunities to buy from food vendors and they would also like to see a wider variety of food offered to them. The purpose of centralizing the food vending in the city of Cincinnati is to provide for an attractive place for people to congregate while stopping for food, a central place for vendors to reach their customers, easy accessibility to a centralized place, a variety of types of food in one central location, and a safe and comfortable place where people can relax in the middle of the day and enjoy their lunch. If this project is successfully completed, the resulting spaces can provide a space that can hold a crowd continuously mixing between functions, people can use the space without limiting the movement of others, this space will activate
underutilized space, and it will provide larger revenue for the vendors. The three locations that we have chosen are:

- The corner of Fourth Street and Sycamore Street
- The corner of Fifth Street and Race Street
- The corner of Court Street and Walnut Street

Table 1 summarizes the students’ projects corresponding to Kevin Lynch’s spatial rights, and the resulting publics and proposed public spaces.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Project Title</th>
<th>Spatial Right</th>
<th>Type of Public</th>
<th>Type of Public Space</th>
<th>Expected Outcome</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Washington Park Authority</strong></td>
<td>Right of Presence</td>
<td>The homeless and the displaced</td>
<td>Connecting neighborhood “assets” with parks and underutilized buildings</td>
<td>Helping the homeless getting cleaned up and learning new skills toward self-sufficiency</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Game Day</strong></td>
<td>Use and Action</td>
<td>People who attend football games, festivals, &amp; events; a public that seeks exciting events</td>
<td>Connecting different public spaces and filling the gap between downtown and the riverfront; creating points of interest</td>
<td>Following Lynch’s model of “place as a set of journeys,” thereby rejuvenating downtown Cinti</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Community Garden</strong></td>
<td>Disposition</td>
<td>Community bonding and stimulating social interaction</td>
<td>10 min. walk, potential vacant lots and parking lots in rundown areas of Cincinnati (O-T-R)</td>
<td>Recycling underutilized neighborhood public space into community gardens; creating social capital, restoring a sense of local identity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Subway</strong></td>
<td>Modification</td>
<td>Private parties, banquets, dances, public events</td>
<td>Accommodate an open air vending area around the Cincinnati subway</td>
<td>Transforming the subway station below Central Pkwy to accommodate an arts center with an open-air vending area, moveable seating, tables, and skylights</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Outdoor Food Courts</strong></td>
<td>Use and Action</td>
<td>Daytime population who mainly work in downtown</td>
<td>Create centralized vending districts</td>
<td>Providing opportunities for customers seeking a wide variety of food in friendly public spaces</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Breakfast Bus</strong></td>
<td>Modification</td>
<td>Attracting suburbanites to ride mass transit — especially the well-educated, affluent with negative perception of downtown</td>
<td>Serve breakfast in route from a suburban park and ride and a downtown depot (vacant parking lots)</td>
<td>Replace the negative perception of the stigma of mass transit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Pop-up Truck</strong></td>
<td>Appropriation</td>
<td>Neighborhood residents</td>
<td>“Urban” living room</td>
<td>Holding neighborhood cultural events, restoring the local identity by showcasing live presentations, live music performances and entertainment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>The Bazaar</strong></td>
<td>Use and Action</td>
<td>Suburbanites</td>
<td>Findlay Market community gathering place; outdoor market spaces (i.e., on Saturdays)</td>
<td>Creating vending zones, placing arts and crafts vendors along the south of Findlay Market on Saturdays from June until August</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Findlay Commons</strong></td>
<td>Use and Action</td>
<td>People from the neighborhood, suburbs and downtown</td>
<td>Stage, seating and improving the parking lot as food court</td>
<td>Creating a destination (vending areas, outdoor seating and eating spaces, and parking), and a stopping point for visitors to Findlay Market</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The Geography of Themed Environments in Over-the-Rhine

Mathias Detamore, the University of Cincinnati
Department of Geography

In the contemporary American landscape, theming has become a palpable force in the defining of our culture. From suburban shopping malls to Disneyworld, novelty heavily influences the theming of our economies of consumption. As sprawl continues its outward trajectory, what we still loosely call the suburbs is supported by these principles of novelty and theming. In contemporary urban redevelopment, theming and themed environments are often used to compete economically with the destination oriented retail and entertainment developments of the suburbs. This kind of “suburbanization” of the city is precarious at best. While our cities have renewed interest in their revitalization, the resulting tourist economies, do not have the capacity to sustain inclusive urban communities.

Drawing primarily on the work of Sorkin, Gottdiener, and Smith, this study defines theming, explores the implications and liabilities associated with it, and examines how the contemporary American environment is based on the evolution of mass consumer culture. Then, to explore the emergence of themed environments in an urban setting, this research examines Over-the-Rhine, an inner-city neighborhood in Cincinnati, Ohio. This study attempts to determine if this community is being themed through revitalization. This study looks specifically at food to highlight the theming process.

A theme is simply defined as a topic or motif; at its very essence, an abstract. Theming is basically the organization of raw data into strings of recognizable information. On the surface this seems innocent enough and that goes without saying that it is not the concept of theme that is negative. We all seek for strings of continuity; it is how we come to understand the world and even question it. This is natural to the human condition and we use these strings of continuity to interface with the complexities of the environment around us. The beginnings of themes derive directly from this necessity to link together common traits of elements in the environment so that we can understand them. Yet, like all traits of the human condition, our greatest assets can also become our greatest liabilities.

The liabilities of themes, and more specifically theming, in our contemporary society are not that they are abstracted motifs used to understand the world around us, but that the nature of the process that defines themes is determined by outside sources. Theming goes wrong when the organizing principles that result in contiguous constructs of linked meaning are removed from the control of the cultures that use them. Culture both defines and is defined by the symbols it creates to represent value. These symbols or themes become ingrained in our emotional and psychological responses to the environment, but the symbols themselves are merely representations of value. Remove symbols or themes from their contextual derivatives, and they can be used as powerful tools to incite emotional responses that can then be manipulated into desired outcomes.

There is an increasingly strong connection between the economic need to make a profit and the reliance on symbols in the marketing of commodities. This link is a very important clue both to the function of
themed environments in our society and to their increasing use (Gottdiener 2001:41).

The liabilities in themes and theming associated with economic investment in our contemporary environment are that they provide vapid fantasies with false senses of community and culture. The fantasies are derived from symbols that have cultural significance, but are applied like stage-sets to other value systems. The very nature of these fantasies mesmerizes our senses and impairs our ability to recognize the deeper structures at work. It is this inability to recognize reality from illusion that keeps us consuming.

The need of producers for the realization of capital does not enter the public’s perception of their own experience. Instead, the act of consumption – with its connections to fantasy and symbol – and the quest for meaning characterize the everyday experience of themed environments. Commercial themed environments succeed not because of corporate will alone but also because places like Disneyworld are entertaining (Gottdiener 2001:126).

It no longer matters who sells us their product, or what their ethical responsibilities are to themselves, the culture, and the environment, as long as we are entertained.

Corporate economies have drawn on these fantasies as titillating sensual experiences to perpetuate large-scale consumption. They rely on the blindness created by fantasy to continue to sell their products. “A nation of consumers must be fed by appeals to consume even when the goods they are presented have dubious use-values” (Gottdiener 2001:46). If consumption economies are to remain viable, they must prove to their consumers that what they are selling is needed. The moment that we stop consuming the economy fails.

Fancy marketing and packaging alter the perceptions of products and environments by linking them to emotionally triggering themes. The responses drawn out of these themes make us perceive that a product itself is necessary. These “needs” eventually filter through the cultural perception in a consumption society to redefine the nature of necessity. For example, we all need shelter, but in contemporary American society shelter is “a ‘basic' three- or four- bedroom suburban house complete with a fully equipped kitchen and recreational room” (Gottdiener 2001:47). There is no physical necessity for that much space to survive as a human being, but because through the theming process, the cultural perception of that much space as a necessity pervades into our psyches.

The spatial devices to lure consumers to the various modes and variations of market places are as integral to the process of consumption as image itself.

Consuming is not only image driven but is also dependent on new forms of space. These themed environments structure the consuming experience in ways that borrow from the state fairs, the department stores, the arcades, and the movie palaces… (Gottdiener 2001:42).
It is not enough that goods and the images that sell them are present in one space; specific typologies of spatial adjacency are required to create an atmosphere in which products can be displayed. The atmosphere itself has as much psychological and emotional weight as the symbols behind the product. If we look at the spatial deconstruction of sprawl; its automobile dependency, its poly-nodal nature, its deficiency in any clear spatial hierarchy, or the sheer isolation of tract house developments; the marketplace must still deal with people’s natural proclivities to commune in pedestrian environments to function. Urban themes are commonly drawn upon to do just that.

In our discussions of the important commercial places, such as malls and theme parks, I observed that the themed environment sought to recycle the ambiance of the pedestrian city. This urban motif is replicated in many forms…The idealized street setting that creates a condition of safety for pedestrian crowds is one consistently popular motif. There are personal and commercial reasons for this success” (Gottdiener 2001:180).

Due to the large scale failure of devices such as Urban Renewal to revitalize our urban cores (Knox 1996:350), many cities have brought the ideals of theming into their redevelopment schemes. From projects such as Times Square, South Street Sea Port, and the Lower East Side in New York City, to Beale Street in Memphis, to the Strip in Las Vegas, all perpetuate consumption through the theming of the environment with cultural symbolism. These spaces establish the necessary spatial typologies that psychologically sell products. The difference between South Street Sea Port and the Mall of America is that the former is nested within an actual urban fabric with a distinct spatial hierarchy. The similarities lie in South Street Seaport’s ability to buffer itself from the city, filtering out perceived dangers of urban life and controlling the use of public space (Sorkin 1992:184). Many cities have recognized the potential for their abandoned industrial waterfront and outmoded city centers to be refurbished for tourism, shifting “from their previous emphasis on manufacturing – an emphasis belonging to the pre-1980s period – to an almost singular focus on promoting tourism” (Gottdiener, pp 130).

Within the urban environment, corporate economies have recognized a present nostalgia for the city and have exploited its spatial adjacencies to incorporate themed establishments that lure in suburbanites. Historically, cities have performed as the infrastructure to support human endeavor and transaction. They are the matrix through which economy, culture, politics, philosophy, and all other forms of human creativity have been filtered. The hierarchy of their spatial adjacencies has organized the pluralistic nature of class and order for millennia. “Whether agora, castle, piazza, or downtown, the idea of a city of centers stands, at a minimum, for the idea of a spatial city, a city in which order is a function of proximity” (Sorkin 1992: xii). It is at the very core of human socialization that cities have historically defined the nature of progress and civilization.

It is no secret that the American landscape has fundamentally altered the physical construct of what a city is and how it functions. From the City Beautiful Movement of the late 19th century, to the Federal Housing Act of postwar America, we have sprawled out into the landscape at unprecedented rates. Postwar expansion “witnessed massive increases in the production of means of production, not to mention means of destruction” (Smith 1996:115), all of which propelled our ability to live outside the city. The consumption economies that have ensued from
attributes such as automobile dependency and corporate marketing have perpetuated the delusion that sprawl is ok and natural resources are inexhaustible. Yet, while we continue to devour the landscape as a disposable commodity at a gluttonous rate, sprawl also suffers from sprawl. However, there does seem to be a counter-inertia, even if minute, back to the city.

Popular among gentrification theorists is the notion that young, usually professional, middle-class people have changed their lifestyle… Thus, with the trend toward fewer children, postponed marriages and fast-rising divorce rates, younger homebuyers and renters are trading in the tarnished dream of their parents for a new dream defined in urban rather than suburban terms (Smith 1996:52).

In spite of this apparent trend however, or perhaps because of it, this new urbanization is stuck in the same guiding principles that crafted our sprawlscapes. There is a desire for “difference, diversity, and distinction [that] forms the basis of the new urban ideology but it is not without contradiction” (Smith 1996:114). The new urban order seeks diversity but longs for control. It wants to celebrate history, but only as long as it does not disrupt consumption. It recognizes the liabilities of suburban sameness, but cannot seem to get past the devices that made it that way. The new urban ideology, and how it is being played out in urban revitalization projects all across the country is no different than the consumption trends that sent sprawl on its path.

Patterns of consumption come to dictate patterns of production; the values of consumption rather than production guide central city land use decisions. Gentrification is explained as a consequence of this new emphasis on consumption. It represents a new urban geography for a new social regime of consumption (Smith 1996:52).

It is in effect a suburbanization of the city.

The devices that dictate this new urbanization are similar to those that sprawl operates under. Sorkin identifies this new city form with three characteristics: 1) its ageographical nature; it could happen anywhere, 2) its obsession with security and the perception of danger (real or unreal), and 3) its imagination of the city as a theme park. This study concentrates on the latter.

Literal representations of the past are tailor-made to support tourism, “and economic-development experts now turn every small-town thoroughfare into Main Street. Vintage villages, regardless of their lack of authenticity, are designed to resurrect local economies” (Sorkin 1992:189). These simulations create nostalgia through their rendering that is paper thin; designed to woo the inattentive observer with the symbolisms of an era gone by without any actual meaning or critical understanding of their origins. The explicative stops at form, as none of the former meaning remains for these revamped districts of urban decay. “All of these sites become culinary and ornamental landscapes through which the tourists graze, celebrating the consumption of place and architecture, and the taste of history and food” (Sorkin 1992:189). Many American cities, now attempting urban revitalization have invested solely in the preservation of historical infrastructure. This preservation has “superseded attention to the human ecologies that
produced and inhabit them” (Sorkin 1992: xiv). The professions of planning and urban design have almost completely dedicated their industry to the reproduction of historicized pasts.

This new realm is a city of simulations, television city, the city as a theme park... Whether in its master incarnation at the ersatz Main Street of Disneyland, in the phony historic festivity of a Rouse marketplace, or the gentrified architecture of “reborn” Lower East Side, this elaborate apparatus is at pains to assert its ties to the kind of city life it is in the process of obliterating (Sorkin 1992: xiv).

One of the biggest influences in this new urban realm of plastic spatialities of stage-set environments may be one of the most respected contemporary urban critics, Jane Jacobs. Her sense of urban street life, the dynamic layering of culture and economy has yielded some of the most profound understandings about the nature of urbanity that still pervade our understandings of cities. Yet, as we have already defined with theme, a symbol removed from its context can be a powerful tool for manipulation. It is the very outline of her model of city that has been used, removed from its deeper structures that rely on the sociological precedents of culture and economy, and applied as theme to the economies of consumption emerging in urban environments.

Contemporary developers have found it eminently easy to furnish such obvious symbols of urbanism, while at the same time eliminating the racial, ethnic, and class diversity that interested Jacobs in the first place, and launched a widespread reconsideration of our cities a generation ago. Jacobsian urbanism has not failed, but succeeded too well – or more accurately a diorama of its most superficial ideas has preempted the public domain (Sorkin 1992:126).

It’s precisely this gross misrepresentation of urban design that has permeated urban revitalization to align it with the corporate economies of consumption.

It is from this understanding of themes and their influences on urban revitalization that we can observe a real inner city urban environment. For this, we look at Over-the-Rhine in Cincinnati, Ohio.

**over-the-rhine**

Over-the-Rhine is one of the oldest neighborhoods in the center of Cincinnati, Ohio. Cincinnati is located on the Ohio River in the South West corner of Ohio. Elevated 80 feet above the river and set approximately 200 feet back, the center city rests on a roughly one square mile basin, that is enclosed by cliffs to the east and north, and a valley creek to the west. Over-the-Rhine sits immediately north of the CBD separated by what used to be the Miami and Eric Canal (now Central Parkway). The canal connected to the river; ran north along what is now Eggleston Street; cut laterally across east to west, bisecting the basin; and then turned sharply north to make its way toward Lake Erie. This canal constituted the southern and western edge of Over-the-Rhine. The northern edge is defined by the cliffs that wedge the neighborhood in a triangular position against the CBD to the south. Today it is one of America’s most important historic districts, housing the largest collection of 19th century Italianate architecture in the country.
Over-the-Rhine first developed in the early half of the 19th century. Like many peripheral neighborhoods in this era, Over-the-Rhine was a large draw for many immigrant populations and by 1850 was 60% Germanic. Nostalgic for home, The Germanic population at the time dubbed the canal that separated the community from the CBD the “Rhine,” reminiscent of the Rhine River in Germany and the neighborhood was henceforth known as Over-the-Rhine. Over-the-Rhine was built up over the expanse of the 19th century to be a vital city neighborhood including restaurants, pubs, churches, a farmer’s market, Music Hall, industrial developments and numerous other institutions that helped to define the later stages of Cincinnati’s commercial city. Over-the-Rhine was also considered Cincinnati’s premier entertainment district, littered with beer gardens, burlesque venues, and gambling that gave Over-the-Rhine a bad reputation amongst “respectable” people.

Over-the-Rhine continued to develop through the turn of the century. As suburbanization trends occurred throughout the country with the City Beautiful Movement, the more affluent of the residents of Over-the-Rhine followed the rest of the rich and middle class out of the basin and into suburbia. The neighborhood would never reach the vitality or density again that it enjoyed through the latter half of the 19th century. Urban migration brought in waves of Appalachians and African Americans from the south looking for work throughout the 20th century. As well, slum clearance in the West End displaced more African Americans into the community. Over-the-Rhine quickly ghettoized and consistently declined for the rest of the century.

Somehow the vast majority of the infrastructure survived cosmopolitan planning, slum clearance, and urban renewal to become the historic landmark that it is, although, it has always been the battle ground for the discourse between the city and the urban poor. Now, Over-the-Rhine is under major consideration for redevelopment as part of a larger urban scheme. In spite of its history as a haven for those outside the city’s mainstream population, the new plan for Over-the-Rhine intends to capitalize on its proximity to the CBD, viewing it as a neighborhood of the central city. The goal is to bring people back to live in the city. Yet, while the city sets itself up to attract new residents, there are concerns, specifically within Over-the-Rhine that new development has not considered the needs of current residents and that new development is not bringing with it the necessary industries to support more residential living in the center city.

In this transition of redevelopment for Over-the-Rhine, Main Street has already received much of this attention. Many bars and nightclubs have been developed here recently with some mixed-use amenities interspersed. However, in its current stasis, and because it has become an entertainment district, it has been subject to suburban tourism and the exclusivity that comes with it. Two blocks to the west and running parallel to Main Street, Vine Street bisects the CBD, runs through Over-the-Rhine, and continues north to connect downtown to the other neighborhoods and communities of the city and region. It is one of the most geographically significant streets in Cincinnati. Yet, while projects are coming online to begin the redevelopment process for Vine Street, at present, it has received disproportionately less investment dollars than Main Street. Here, on Vine Street, the atmosphere, the establishments, the demographics have a completely different feel. It is here that we begin to describe a geography for theming in Over-the-Rhine.

**hypothesis**

This research hypothesizes that 1) most redevelopment dollars focused in Over-the-Rhine are spent primarily
on Main Street and, 2) most of the themed environments occurring in Over-the-Rhine are on or around Main Street. It is important to note from the onset that everything is themed in some way or another. The very definition of theme is simply to organize information into strings of recognition. The criticism of themes stem from the perpetuation of consumption in corporate economies that use themes to sell products and environments. It is here that we question the role of themes in our urban environment.

This research analyzes the geography of theming through the juxtaposition of eating establishments, restaurants, bars, grocery stores, etc. and their relative location to these two major corridors as it is associated with the redevelopment process. Using food as the barometric consumable to highlight the state of cultural sustainability, every eating and drinking establishment within the study area of Over-the-Rhine has been mapped and ranked by a list of criteria derived from the literature to determine their individual positions within a spectrum of themed to unthemed.

The direct link to food and consumption is both literal and metaphorical. The physical consumption of food is explicative to other forms of consumption and begins to imply the embodied values of a themed environment. This hypothesis starts to get at that. According to Eric Schlosser, “[w]hat people eat (or don’t eat) has always been determined by a complex interplay of social, economic, and technological forces…A nation’s diet can be more revealing that its art or literature” (Schlosser 2001:3).

**methodology**

Each establishment has been evaluated against four topics determined to reveal its overall *themeness*: operations, packaging, connectivity to the city, and demographics. These qualities were determined to yield a significant cross section of determinants that specify theming.

Within operations, the ownership of the establishment is questioned in two ways: 1) whether or not it is under corporate ownership, 2) and whether or not it is a franchise. This is seen to hold a lot of weight because it speaks to the influence of a corporate entity within the community. The nature of corporate operations as outlined above deals specifically with consumption economies. Consumption economies are a basis for theming and themed environments. Franchises are seen as derivative of corporations. Also under operations are dress codes and cover charges, which speak to an establishment trying to control its clientele and its overall appearance.

Under connections, the topic has been broken down into two major subtopics: history and investment.
History speaks specifically to how long an establishment has been in the community. While this in not necessarily making a derogatory statement to new establishments, it operates under the trend for contemporary development to work within ten year real estate amortized profit projections which then leave an establishment abandoned or blighted after it has reached its ten year profit goals. Two questions are asked under investment: 1) does the establishment host or advertise local events and 2) are there local news or community publications available within the establishment? Whether or not an establishment participates in community issues reveals their level of commitment to the community. A level of commitment to the community reveals deeper issues of investment that are not merely profit motivated.

Packaging has been divided into three subtopics: marketing, design, and menu. Marketing speaks to the strategies used to lure in customers. Our survey looked at marketing through the auspices of advertising and the use of media appealing to particular types of demographics. It looks at television for its propensity to draw in large audiences and the ease of targeting specific demographics, as well as, radio, promotional flyers, and print ads which speak to smaller scales and generally more diverse groups. Design seeks to look at the architecture and how it fits in to the context. Does it stick out like a thumb hitchhiking, or does it blend in aesthetically to the context. This asked if there were any blacked out storefront, altered facades, or flashy non-historic signage. Menu asks if the establishment is operating their kitchen with a corporate menu. All together, packaging deals specifically with the symbolism used by an establishment that might be able to draw on emotions and psychology to manipulate consumption through themes.

Demographics is broken into two main subtopics: clientele and staff. Staff is heavily weighted in this category because the ability for an establishment to support its community by employing them is an invested establishment that is probably less concerned with how the image of their business comes across to tourists. It is seen favorably if more than 65% of any establishment’s employees live in Over-the-Rhine. Clientele is broken down into two questions 1) The total amount of customers that live in Over-the-Rhine less than 35% and 2) The amount of customers who drive more than 60%. Similar to “Connections to the city”, demographics analyzes the level of commitment to the community, but more specifically targets their level of involvement with tourism.

Using these criteria, a survey has been devised that examines each establishment and places them within a spectrum of unthemed to themed. Each of the criteria has been given a weighted value, together totaling a range of 100 points; the higher the points received, the more themed the establishment.

findings

A spatial analysis of the data collected supports both hypotheses. The data shows evidence that theming has a presence in Over-the-Rhine, specifically where redevelopment on Main Street has occurred. Although the findings show Main Street is a themed corridor and Vine Street is an unthemed corridor, it is not as black and white as anticipated. Rather, Main Street has two themed clusters with a gradation of unthemed between them. The more themed cluster is at the intersection of 12th and Main with Have-a-Nice-Day Café and Bar Cincinnati, while a milder themed cluster dwells closer to Liberty Street with Moose on Main and Main City Bar. In between are interspersed authentic and less-authentic establishments that connect the two nodes of the corridor. Vine Street, by contrast, has no themed establishments as defined by the criteria. Vine Street also, does not seem to cluster itself into nodes but rather, has dispersed eating and drinking establishments along its corridor.
The key difference between Vine Street and Main Street is the density of eating establishments. In terms of operating eating and drinking establishments between the two corridors, Vine Street has half as many as Main Street. Of the 47 Over-the-Rhine establishments that were looked at for this study, 18 (38%) were located on Main St, while 9 (19%) were on Vine. This shows a clear pattern of investment for the area. Yet, these two streets do show themselves as the major corridors of Over-the-Rhine with a combined total of 57% of the total number of establishments with the remaining 43% randomly dispersed throughout. But in terms of themed versus unthemed, of Main Street’s 18 establishments, 9 (50%) are themed; while none of Vine Street’s 9 establishments are themed.

Twelfth Street, close to the southern border of Over-the-Rhine, which connects Main Street to Vine Street, becomes the other interesting geographical feature. The third densest corridor of eating and drinking establishments is located on Twelfth Street. It is made up predominately of mildly-unthemed establishments and draws the themed environments into the unthemed. Along this corridor an interesting push - pull is suggested between the major theme cluster and the unthemed corridor. It is here that we see Over-the-Rhine developing themed environments that are currently permeating other urban revitalization projects around the country.

Other insightful information for the findings here are the overall trends within the four major topics of the criteria. Looking at the one question within each that held the most weight throughout the scoring, we begin to discover how these topics effect the environment. Under Operations, the corporate/franchise question worth 20 points showed 8 (17%) total establishments. With Connections, how long the establishment has been in business, worth 13 points; 31 (66%) of the establishments were less than 10 years in operation. For Packaging, how the design
and architecture fits in, worth 10 points; found 18 (38%) establishments with drastically altered street fronts that stick out from the fabric. And Demographics, how many employees live in Over-the-Rhine, worth 15 points; also with 18 (38%) establishments which hire less than a substantial portion of their staff from Over-the-Rhine residents (fig 1). These four questions totaling over half of the survey questionnaire show some interesting trends.

Out of the 47 establishments studied, 22 (47%) were considered unthemed; 16 (34%) were considered mildly unthemed; 6 (13%) were mildly themed; and 3 (6%) were themed (fig 2). Of the unthemed, 0% are corporate; 54% have been in Over-the-Rhine less than 10 years; 13% have design flaws; and 0% higher less than a substantial portion of Over-the-Rhine residents. For the mildly unthemed establishments, it’s 6%, 68%, 68%, and 44% respectively. Mildly themed: 67%, 83%, 67%, and 83%. Themed: 100% across the board (fig 3). The length of time that an establishment has been in operation is the least telling. While the potential for newer places to be themed is obvious, it does not speak to the establishments that have not yet had a chance to root themselves in the community. But the greater implications here are not whether the establishments are themed or unthemed but rather that the majority of eating and drinking places in Over-the-Rhine (66%) are new and this reveals the deficiency in rooted establishments that leaves, in the fabric, a weakness to be exploited by new development. The design aspect is the next least telling. While the spread is rather normal, it is possible to create, by these criteria, an environment that sticks out from its context and still be authentic or at least unthemed. The staffing aspect is very telling, however. None of the themed establishments hire a substantial portion of the employees from residents of Over-the-Rhine, while all of the unthemed do. The interesting figure is that the two middle groups both sit right around 66% for hiring from the community. This could speak to a lot of things but it is interesting that the hiring of Over-the-Rhine residents falls just about 50% in terms of establishments, but this is only made possible by the combined efforts of the mildly-themed and the mildly unthemed.

Finally, the corporate criterion is the most telling. Here, with themed ranking at 100% and mildly-themed following with 66% contrasts vastly to less than 10% in the mildly unthemed and 0% for authentic. It clearly shows that corporate and franchised environments lead to theming.

---

**Conclusion**

Over-the-Rhine is one of the most important historic districts in the country. It contains within its borders
the largest collection of 19th century Italianate architecture in the United States. Its rich architecture and history are a constant source of civic pride for the city. It is showing signs of transition from a ghettoized neighborhood of one of America’s oldest urban cores to a thriving living room for the city. Yet, it will not be able to develop and maintain an inclusive community for long-term sustainability if the majority of development concentrates on themed environments of tourist economies.

There are some questions here that would require further study to understand the exact patterns of use, and their social relationships that apply here. It might be helpful expand the scope of the project to include a greater number of establishments. While restaurants and bars are vastly telling, they certainly do not maintain the exclusive rights to theming. It would be beneficial to see how other commercial and retail industries fit into the model for theming in Over-the-Rhine that we’ve begun to uncover here. As well, it would be beneficial to understand why Main Street. Main Street historically was a commercial corridor that supported shopping and business for local residents, while Vine Street was the entertainment corridor drawing on tourism. Why was there a flip in the morphology? When did it occur? And how does it impact the existing culture residing there?
Criteria for “Main Street” study

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Topic</th>
<th>Subtopic</th>
<th>points</th>
<th>“Theme Park” vs. “Authentic”</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Operations (25 points)</td>
<td>ownership</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>corporate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>franchise</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>conduct</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>dress code</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>cover charge</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>business</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>corporate suppliers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Connections (25 points)</td>
<td>history</td>
<td>12.5</td>
<td>recent development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>no community</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>investment</td>
<td>12.5</td>
<td>involvement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Packaging (25 points)</td>
<td>marketing</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>aggressive (flashy)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>design</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>applied (disparate)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>menu</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>eclectic (not ethnic)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Demographic (25 points)</td>
<td>clientele</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>commuters</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>staff</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>tourist</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Scoring:
Scores will be given out in a “yes” or “no” fashion. In each subtopic, if an establishment acts in a theme park field, all designated points for that subtopic will be given. Consequently, if it acts in the authentic field, no designated points will be given. In the subtopic fields where there is more than one criterion, only one “yes” vote is required to gain all points (if both occur, it will not add extra points).

Breakdown:
- 0-25 authentic
- 26-50 authentic leaning toward theme park
- 51-75 theme park leaning toward authentic
- 76-100 theme park
“Main Street” Survey
Niehoff Urban Laboratory, Winter 2004

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>establishment questions</th>
<th>yes</th>
<th>points</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>corporate/franchise</td>
<td></td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>dress code</td>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>cover charge</td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>does not host/advertize local events</td>
<td></td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>does not have at least 3 local news/community publications</td>
<td></td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>blacked out store front</td>
<td></td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>altered façade</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>non historic signage</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>been in business less than 10 years</td>
<td></td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>advertizes on television</td>
<td></td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>advertizes on radio</td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>advertizes through flyers (promotion)</td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>advertizes in print (newspaper/magazine)</td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>corporate menu</td>
<td></td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% of customers who live in OTR less than 35%</td>
<td></td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% of customers who drive more than 60%</td>
<td></td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% of staff who live in OTR less than 65%</td>
<td></td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


Cincinnati voters approved the $6 million bond for its construction in 1917.

But it never happened. Their work was seen only by passers-by and photographers, never by subway passengers.

But what they did was exemplary. It looks like that at any moment, people could rush down the concrete steps to the platform and catch their train. It is so perfectly empty and vast that the imagination has nothing else to do but picture what could have been.

And that is the fascination that led Singer to write his book, Cincinnati Tomorrow to sponsor tours and a group of University of Cincinnati students to be the latest to develop a plan for the vacant subway.

THE SCHEMES

Over the years a number of ideas have been proposed for the 2.1-mile stretch of tunnel, including a bomb shelter, winery, wind tunnel and underground nightclub.

Most recently, UC architecture student Dan Hatch designed a plan to turn the space into an area for visual and performing arts. He and a couple of urban development students walked the two-mile stretch and developed plans they have presented to Cincinnati Tomorrow groups.

“Our proposal didn’t alter too much what is existing,” Hatch explains. “Whoever built it, built it well. It’s just waiting for finishing materials to be put on
College students offer to revamp eatery – for a slice of the pie

Nuns find new spot to serve up pizza

By Kevin Aldridge
The Cincinnati Enquirer

OVER-THE-RHINE – A pizzeria run by Roman Catholic nuns as a charity project might have a new home this fall in the heart of Over-the-Rhine.

The Dominican Sisters of Hope and the Sisters of Notre Dame de Namur, who operate the Venice Pizza restaurant, are raising $500,000 to refurbish a storefront at 350 Vine St.

The nuns were evicted in December from a West McMicken Street storefront in University Heights because they hadn’t paid the rent for three months. They started the eatery there in 1990.

Sister Monica McGlinchey, a Dominican Sister of Hope and president of Power Inspires Progress, said a group of interior design and architecture students from the University of Cincinnati have volunteered to create conceptual drawings for the new restaurant.

She said those students along with others from Miami University will

offices, bathrooms and service areas.

“UC has been really helpful,” McGlinchey said. “This is a wonderful opportunity for students to learn and assist in a low-income community.”

In return, the nuns have offered the students $1,000 worth of free pizza.

“That’s better than money to college kids,” said Frank Russel, director of UC’s Community Design Center.

Lauren Kelsch, 21, a UC interior design and architecture student and Over-the-Rhine resident, said she was inspired to act after reading a news article about the nuns’ plight. “I’m happy to be doing something for my community as well as the nuns and their Venice Pizza project.”

Venice Pizza is part of Power Inspires Progress, a program that provides part-time jobs for hard-to-employ people. The pizza parlor employed about 12 workers who were paid from minimum wage up to $7 an hour.

A local attorney is negotiating a lease agreement on the new site.

UC students, nuns build training site

By Roy Wood
Staff writer

A group of University of Cincinnati graduate students is helping to revamp an Over-the-Rhine storefront for a group of nuns who want to open a pizza place where people can learn workplace skills.

The non-profit project is called Venice Pizza.

Nuns from the Dominican Sisters of Hope and the Sisters of Notre Dame de Namur started the business in 1986 to provide food, service, catering and computer training for hard-to-employ residents.

“We work with people from three to six months to try to get them into full-time jobs,” said Sister Barbara Wheeler, from the Dominican Sisters of Hope. “The typical profile of people we serve have difficulty getting employment.

They may have lost a lot of jobs previously, may have limited reading or math skills or may be offenders, she said.

By filling small orders at the pizza joint, they develop what Wheeler described as transferrable skills, such as how to dress appropriately, how to deal with the public, how to handle food, and how to run a cash register.

“Some of the people we see don’t have a lot of good work records, so they may have to learn things as basic as just going to work on time,” she said.

Travis Watlet and Emily Wiry, students in the University of Cincinnati’s College of Design, Architecture, Art, and Planning, continued working last week — after the close of classes — on the pizzeria they are helping to build as a training site for people who have a hard time getting jobs.

It is open at 15th and Vine Street. It will have a training center and computer training center.

A contractor paid through a $35,000 grant from the Greater Cincinnati Foundation will complete the interior for the catering center.

After new owners bought the building last year and raised $250,000 from a GoFundMe, the students learned their long-term lease with the former owner wasn’t valid. As a result, the sisters had to start looking for a new store.

“All the outreach was to an old open hour that had been at The People’s Theater and the House of Nobody Bartering.

This past spring, about 15 students from Miami University did some training and drywall work in the building.

This summer, 10 students from UC’s College of Design, Architecture, Art, and Planning used donated materials — much of which was scrap — to fashion new floor and new wall design.

The students received 8,000 donated tile; however, the tiles were of varying sizes, textures and colors. To be able to use the mismatched materials, the students

winter. A contractor will complete the interior.

A great deal of time and effort went into simply figuring out how to fabricate floor and wall panels from the refine materials, said Terry Bolding, the assistant professor of architecture who led the students in the endeavor.

“Everyone has put in lots and lots of extra time on the project,” he said. “They’ve been working nights and weekends.”

In fact, some students were working at the pizza place Thursday, even though their college term had ended six days earlier. Exams were all but done.

At this point, UC architecture
New suit filed in builder scandal

By Rob Drinan
Post staff reporter

Cash buyers of Enepenck Co.-built homes want a federal judge to seize proceeds from the pending sale of Peoples Bank of Northern Kentucky and put the money in a special account to be divided among the disgraced homebuilder's many creditors.

The demand is part of a new lawsuit filed in U.S. District Court in Covington seeking compensation for about 50 homeowners still saddled with huge loans on their homes due to Enepenck's failure to pay off the banks that lent the company money to build new homes and condominiums.

Peoples Bank and Enepenck worked together in a conspiracy setting up an enterprise. They were involved in an enterprise together to defraud Enepenck's profits, providing cash flow that kept him in business, said Jeff Blankenship, attorney for the cash homebuyers. Had Peoples Bank not artificially propped up Bill Enepenck's failing company, the lawsuit contends, Enepenck would not have been able to continue building homes and pocketing homebuyers' money.

Peoples bailed Enepenck through a series of loans to cover millions of dollars in overdrafts, the lawsuit said.

Blankenship and colleagues Ed Monegan and Richard Day contend that Peoples Bank and Enepenck broke federal racketeering laws and committed mail and wire fraud in the detriment of the cash homebuyers.

"This whole conspiracy, this whole scheme was kept alive by them (Peoples Bank) bringing in cash," Blankenship said in a phone interview. The lawsuit contends former Peoples President John Fannin and former Vice President Marc Menne participated in the conspiracy.

John Schull, Fannin's attorney, reiterated Monday that Fannin was unaware of any illegal activity and was trying to do the right thing.

"This is what he thought he knew, John was working in the best interests of the bank," Schull said.

See ENPEENCK on 6A

Supermarket by design

UC students making 'big-box' superstore shrink into city's smaller spaces

By Cindy Garbaccio
Post staff reporter

Thirty years ago, supermarkets began an exodus from inner-city neighborhoods, building ever larger megastores in the suburbs.

But those big supermarkets surrounded by parking lots don't lend themselves to the limited confines of a city block, leaving companies to struggle with the question: How do you transform the suburban prototype of the supermarket that is now being used into something appropriate for an inner-city setting, where you don't have access to an 8- or 10-acre empty block?

This is a significant problem for any city neighborhood with a dense population that isn't already dependent on some type of grocery store.

Ted Tidman, director of the UC Community Design Center, has turned to UC for help in designing a model for grocery stores that are intended to be a place where people come to shop, rather than a place to drive to.

"The project is a model for city neighborhoods and city environments," Tidman said.

"We want to create a store that is a place where people want to go, not a place where they have to go, and that will be a place where people can shop and have a good experience and feel like they're part of the community."
Supermarket: UC designers taking on urban challenge

From 4A

Markets, grocery stores, restaurants, fast-food chains and food pantries — even private vegetable gardens — in Corryville, Over-the-Rhine, Avondale, Clifton, Evanston, Mount Adams, Over-the-Rhine, Walnut Hills and the West End.

It won’t be easy to come up with a workable urban design, says Cincinnati City Council Member Jim Tarbell.

“You can’t tear down a bunch of buildings to create a traditional suburban supermarket. The whole idea is to have it fit into the urban fabric,” said Tarbell, an Over-the-Rhine resident who has campaigned for improving and adding commercial space in the inner city as a way to draw new people into these communities.

Tarbell said the Kroger store in Over-the-Rhine, like most urban supermarkets, is a “nuts-and-bolts operation” that offers little more than the basics; many neighborhood shoppers travel to the suburbs to do the bulk of their shopping.

“It certainly serves a purpose, but it isn’t attracting new people into the community, and it doesn’t cater to new residents to the area who may have a more adventurous shopping program,” Tarbell said. “But a supermarket and other retail space certainly can be an asset to a community. It is one of the things people look at when they consider moving into an area.”

UC architecture student Derek Mason of Cleveland, a participant in the urban supermarket study, agrees. “It’s the same issues wherever you look, in this country or in Europe.”

“The ‘big box’ supermarket surrounded by parking works in the suburbs, but it doesn’t work in city neighborhoods,” Mason said. “One advantage you do have in a city is that people don’t have to be as dependent on a car, but finding enough room for parking is still a big challenge.”

Mason’s group is looking at solutions such as building the supermarket atop a parking garage.

Other students are considering sweeping changes to the plaza itself, such as building a public park in the plaza or adding a gas station with the supermarket — a combination common in Europe and already in place at a handful of suburban supermarkets in Greater Cincinnati.
It's No Picnic-in-the-Park...But a Picnic-in-the-Parking Space for Design Students

Architecture and planning students turned picnicking pranksters for a day – picnicking in a metered parking space on a busy downtown street, on a six-lane roadway median and on the courthouse steps. They and other students found creative ways to test and stretch the social boundaries of public spaces to find ways to improve Cincinnati’s public events.

Date: 11/17/2003
By: Mary Reilly
Phone: (513) 556-1824
Photos By: Niehoff students

Close to 30 students in the University of Cincinnati’s top-ranked architecture and planning programs have been giving downtown workers and residents some unconventional food for thought. The students – all participants in a special, long-term project at UC which seeks to build a better city – have been humorously breaking social taboos regarding public space in order to determine, among other things, how large-scale, public events like Oktoberfest or Tall Stacks can better step up to the plate in drawing attention and crowds without stepping over the line.

The “Oh my God!” factor greeted students Greg Snyder, Kyle Hanigosky and Chris Pohlar as they picnicked at various points in one of downtown Cincinnati’s most congested areas, Court Street. They picnicked on the court house steps, in the median of Central Parkway and then, in a metered spot in the heavily congested area around the courthouse. “We could hear one lady literally saying, ‘Oh, my God!’ as she did a double take driving by when she was looking for a space to park, and we were picnicking in the parking space,” explained Pohlar. “We wondered if people would get upset with us for taking up a parking spot even though we’d fed the meter, but no one really seemed to be mad, but plenty were surprised,” he added.

The three students, who titled their project “Just Chill’in’ to Challenge the Boundaries” were not so much exploring the legal controls of public space so much as the social and cultural controls. Says Snyder, an architecture student from Owensville, “There are multiple social controls on public space that are probably more powerful than legal controls. The police were all around as we picnicked around, and we didn’t have a problem. They had no reaction. But, the informal, social controls were powerful. I was nervous at first. I found that people’s expectations can really control you. It’s the kind of controls that affect food vendors who sell from pushcarts on the street. After all, an event is the blurring of public and private space that normally determines the right to be accepted, tolerated or rejected.”

That’s just the kind of lesson they and their fellow students need since the class in which they’re working, The Niehoff Studio, specifically examines the use of food – retail, restaurant, and special events – as the basic ingredient in a long-term effort by University of Cincinnati students to
build a better city.

Every quarter, teams of UC students gather around their design and research tables in an Over-the-Rhine studio classroom to serve up a menu of ideas that will benefit inner-city neighborhoods like Over-the-Rhine, East Walnut Hills, Corryville and the East End. The effort began in the fall of 2002, and each quarter is building on the one before it.

*The Niehoff Studio* will last for at least six years. In the first two years, we’ll continually focus on food in some way. What solutions can be devised to assure that low-income areas receive the services and goods necessary? Can we attract new residents to rundown areas with the power of vibrant food retail? How can suburban superstores be adapted to the inner city with its dense urban context? There are so many economic, social and cultural implications. There’s power to be tapped in the buying and sharing of food,” explained Frank Russell, co-leader of The Niehoff Studio and director of UC’s Community Design Center.

This quarter, other students also challenged the spatial “status quo.” Another group of students placed colorfully wrapped lollipops into the perforated holes of the plastic bus shelter of a busy Court Street stop. They then observed and analyzed reactions, including the change in the social atmosphere of the stop. According to group members Steve Albert, Stephanie Kroger and Sanmati Naik, passers-by first thought the lollipops were a public-art display. When the trio tried to sell the lollipops at a minimal price, downtowners were skeptical about the safety and cleanliness of the suckers. When the students gave the lollipops away for free, they quickly gathered an eager crowd.

The lollipop lessons learned? Among others, that any special event needs to build the public trust by visibly showing where a food product comes from.

The same lesson was brought home by students who spelled out the words “EAT ME” on the downtown sidewalk, using pre-packaged cupcakes to spell out the words. At first, very few pedestrians took a cake, but those who first dared, came back again and again for more, getting far more than their fair share.

Trust was quickly built up by students Mathias Detamore, Frederick Spittael and Bobby Bitzenhofer who set up a “living room” on the sidewalk, with coffee table, lamp, and TV on a stand. A few passers-by sat down with the students, sharing the offered chips and salsa and, in turn, offering the students food.

The students will now take what they’ve learned in challenging public-space boundaries and design creative public events for the city. For example,
one group is designing a theoretical “underground, cutting-edge” music, art and dance event, to include ethnic artists, in Cincinnati’s long-neglected subway tunnel, started in 1920 but never completed, and located under Central Parkway.

The group planning the subway event – planning students Amanda Hernandez of Grelton, Ohio, Kathy Farro of Anderson Township, and architecture student Dan Hatch – like the idea of literally going underground to participate in the city’s underground arts scene. In addition, the event would showcase the history of the subway tunnel as well as local architecture and transportation issues.

The students will present design drawings and details of proposed public events for the area at 5 p.m. Wednesday, December 10, in The Niehoff Studios, located downtown on the ground floor of the Emery Center, 110 East Central Parkway at Walnut Street.

In addition to Russell, others leading this quarter’s Niehoff are Michaele Pride-Wells, director of UC’s School of Architecture, Mahyar Arefi, assistant professor of planning; and Colleen McTague, adjunct instructor of geography.

The Niehoff Studio was launched last fall with a $150,000 gift from UC alumnus and Board of Trustee member H.C. Buck Niehoff as well as additional support from the Kroger Company, UC’s Community Design Center, UC’s Institute for Community Partnerships, UC’s College of Design, Architecture, Art, and Planning, UC’s McMicken College of Arts and Sciences and UC’s College of Education.
Over-the-Rhine Pizzeria Provides Students a Slice of Real Life Experience

Local nuns almost evicted from their non-profit pizzeria are getting some “piece”-of-mind from young University of Cincinnati designers who are cooking up ideas to help the sisters continue their service in Over-the-Rhine.

Date: 3/4/2004
By: Mary Reilly
Phone: (513) 556-1824
Photos By: Drawings by Lauren Farquhar and Claire Collier

The Dominican Sisters of Hope and the Sisters of Notre Dame de Namur don’t have a lot of dough. That’s one of the reasons that their non-profit Venice Pizza, founded as a means to provide jobs and training for hard-to-employ residents in our urban neighborhoods, needs to quickly move from its present location on the edge of Camp Washington to Over-the-Rhine. Their rent is rising, forcing them to relocate.

But now, the sisters have picked out a storefront location at 1301 Vine Street in Over-the-Rhine as the new home for Venice Pizza, part of their Power Inspires Progress program. They’ve also turned to University of Cincinnati interior design students to help them refashion the space into a pizzeria, catering business and training center. The students, led by Carrie Beidleman, adjunct professor of design, will present their final design ideas to the Dominican Sisters of Hope and their non-profit’s Board of Directors at 10 a.m., Monday, March 15, in the 5000-level foyer of UC’s College of Design, Architecture, Art, and Planning. The students will later present their concepts to the entire Over-the-Rhine community from 5-7 p.m., Wednesday, March 17, in UC’s Niehoff Studio located in The Emery Center, 110 E. Central Parkway at Walnut Street in Over-the-Rhine. One student concept will be selected to provide the ingredients the Dominicans need to retrofit their new space.

In all, eight students from UC’s interior design program – recently rated as the nation’s best undergraduate interior design program – are cutting their teeth on this real-world project. For these third-year students, who have worked in their classroom studios and for design firms across the country as part of their cooperative-education requirements, this is their first time in seeing a design project completely through from beginning to end. (Co-op refers to the practice of alternating academic quarters with quarters of paid, professional work. It had its worldwide founding at UC in 1906, and UC’s co-op program is ranked 4th in the nation by U.S. News & World Report.)

“When I worked in Atlanta on my last co-op, I was given responsibility for portions of corporate projects, but I was never given the full responsibility of a project from beginning to end,” explained student Lauren Farquhar, 20, of Wichita, Kansas, who, once this project is complete, will spend her summer working in London as her next UC co-op requirement.
She added, “The sisters couldn’t afford the professional services we can provide, and they were so excited when they came and saw our ideas at mid-term. And I’m excited too, because this is a meaningful project. I’m really looking forward to going into the space when it’s done and knowing I had a hand in it.”

Farquhar’s interior designs for the storefront pizzeria “embrace the low-budget challenge,” as she put it, inherent in the project. For instance, she’s suggesting that the sisters paint large, diagonal squares of bright, primary colors on their concrete floor, matched by similarly colored booths they could build themselves.

Fellow student Claire Collier, 23, of Brookville, Ind., is using the non-profit’s name of Venice Pizza as her inspiration and incorporating the colors and shapes common to Venetian glass into her design. Her color palette of rich blues, greens and browns is accented by hand-blown Venetian glass fixtures to provide the pizzeria’s lighting. Collier, like many other students, is suggesting more seating and a more professional setting for customer-worker interactions. In Venice Pizza’s current space, there is only room enough for three dining tables and a card-table register.

Sister Monica McGloin said that the group already has someone who will oversee the renovation of the space at 1301 Vine St., and a UC student will do the necessary construction drawings and bid packages in the spring, thanks to funding from UC’s Institute for Community Partnerships, supervisions by UC’s Community Design Center and technical assistance from KZF Design Inc. All that remains to be done is the necessary fundraising. “If all goes well and we begin renovating the Over-the-Rhine space at the end of May, we hope to be operating in our new space by September,” added McGloin.

When that happens, Venice Pizza will continue its ministry of employing and training hard-to-place workers, paying up to $7 an hour. The venture has employed up to 12 part-time workers at any one time.
Students Step in to Help Preserve Historic Dance Hall

University of Cincinnati design students are seeking partners to help them bring new life to a historic Over-the-Rhine gem, a 19th-century German dance hall. Meanwhile, they’re having a ball, brainstorming ideas for the interior space at 1313 Vine Street.

Date: 3/1/2004
By: Mary Reilly
Phone: (513) 556-1824
Photos By: Heather Farrell-Lipp

The one-time Cosmopolitan Hall in Over-the-Rhine is a building with a storied past, and a group of University of Cincinnati students are now working to see that it has a future that follows suit.

The 1885 Italian Renaissance Revival building was constructed after the Civil War as part of an entertainment district for the area’s German, Hungarian, Slavic and Italian residents, and it was specifically built for dances (with a still-functional sprung floor), concerts, athletic contests (like boxing), weddings and, yes, drinking. From its birth amid cosmopolitan gaiety, it’s had many uses since, including housing a Prohibition-era speakeasy and later – an indoor-golf complex, insurance offices and wallpaper retail store as well as serving as a movie set. The building’s enormous dance hall was the setting for scenes from the movie, “A Rage in Harlem.”

Soon, the building – now housing The Warehouse night club – will stand empty, and that’s where the UC architecture and planning students come in. Twelve students – all working in Over-the-Rhine as part of their classroom participation in the university’s six-year-long project known as The Niehoff Studio – are designing new uses for the building alongside of faculty from UC’s College of Design, Architecture, Art and Planning.

Leading the effort is Jeff Tilman, assistant professor of the school’s top-ranked architecture and interior design programs, recently ranked as the nation’s best. He explained, “In many ways, the students are creating interior design concepts that return the building to its original use. They’re conceptualizing an urban music and recording center, restaurants and bars, dance floor and pub, children’s resource center, and even things like a police substation.” Tilman added that the 12 students would devise 10 concepts in all, and almost any of them are feasible due to the building’s flexibility: It’s four stories high in the front and two stories in back, with two sub-basements. In addition, its basic structure is sound.

The students took on the project after hearing that The Warehouse night club
would be moving to Main Street in early March, leaving the Cosmopolitan Hall empty. “Then, when the architecture students saw 1313, they wouldn’t consider working on any other project in Over-the-Rhine. They want to see the building with new life and new uses rather than torn down,” stated Tilman.

Master’s architecture student Heather Farrell-Lipp said that her efforts and those of her fellow students — photographing, measuring and researching the building’s spaces — are not taking place in a vacuum. The students are working in their Over-the-Rhine studio classroom three days a week, and they’ve each had to interview and gain the perspective of different groups in the neighborhood, including parents, long-term residents, empty nesters, Bohemian artists, the elderly and those who work in the vicinity.

The project on behalf of 1313 Vine St. is only one of several efforts by students in Over-the-Rhine as part of The Niehoff Studio. In all, 35 architecture, planning and geography students are currently lending their academic skills to the community as part of the studio class. They will publicly present their ideas during an open house from 5-7 p.m., Wednesday, March 17 in their studio space at The Emery Center, 110 E. Central Parkway at Walnut Street. Afterward, the students’ ideas in relation to the Cosmopolitan Hall will be passed along to the Vine Street Pride Center and will be available to other non-profit groups in Over-the-Rhine.

Faculty leading The Niehoff Studio this quarter are, in addition to Tilman, Frank Russell, director of UC’s Community Design Center; Mahyer Arefi, assistant professor of planning; Colleen McTague, adjunct instructor of geography; and Menelaos Triantafillou, visiting associate professor of planning.

The Niehoff Studio – with its goal of building a better city – was launched by UC in the fall of 2002 with a $150,000 gift from UC alumnus and Board of Trustee member H.C. “Buck” Niehoff as well as additional support from the Kroger Company, UC’s Community Design Center, UC’s Institute for Community Partnerships, UC’s College of Design, Architecture, Art and Planning, UC’s McMicken College of Arts and Sciences and UC’s College of Education, Criminal Justice, and Human Services.